

## **AL JAZEERA'S PARATEXTUAL REFRAMING OF THE ATLANTIC AND FOREIGN AFFAIRS COVERAGE OF THE 2022 RUSSIAN-UKRAINIAN WAR**

**Karina AlOteibi<sup>1</sup>, Ahmad S Haider<sup>2</sup>, Hadeel AlSaed<sup>3</sup>**

<sup>1,2,3</sup>*Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan, <sup>2,3</sup>Middle East University, Amman, Jordan*

**Abstract:** *The Russian-Ukrainian War, which began in February 2022, has recently become a trend and attracted the attention of different news agencies. This paper examines the paratextual components of ten news articles on the Russian-Ukrainian War. The source articles are extracted from The Atlantic and Foreign Affairs, while the Arabic translation is retrieved from Al Jazeera website. In this paper, the narrative theory is adopted (Baker, 2018) since it is a dynamic and flexible approach that emphasizes the role of translators and interpreters as active participants in constructing reality. The English articles with their Arabic counterparts were compared, and the parts that were paratextually reframed in the translated versions were identified. Investigating how Al Jazeera reframed the Russian-Ukrainian War through translation, Al Jazeera appears to sometimes create different, diverse, and contradictory versions of the narrative. This may result in various and, sometimes, different views of the same story. The findings showed that the paratextual framing strategies utilized by Al Jazeera to reframe the Russian-Ukrainian War include titles, subheadings, introductions, and footnotes. The paper concludes that the war is framed in the source texts in line with the source media outlets' agenda and is then reframed in the target language through translation. The entire process might affect how the target audience views the event under study.*

**Keywords:** *Russian-Ukrainian War, translation, paratextual framing, Al Jazeera, titles*

**About the author:** *Karina AlOteibi is an MA holder in Audiovisual and Mass Media Translation at the Applied Science Private University. Her main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, pragmatics, and translation studies.*

**e-mail:** *karinaoteibi1997@hotmail.com*

**About the author:** *Ahmad S Haider is an associate professor in the Department of English Language and Translation at the Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan. He received his Ph.D. in Linguistics from the University of Canterbury/ New Zealand. His current research focuses on how political events are socially, discursively, and linguistically represented in media, combining Corpus Linguistics and (Critical) Discourse Analysis. His main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, pragmatics, and translation studies. Dr. Haider has built different large Arabic and English corpora. He professionally masters different Corpus Linguistic software packages.*

**e-mail:** *a\_haidar@asu.edu.jo*

**ORCID ID:** *<http://orcid.org/0000-0002-7763-201X>*

**About the author:** *Hadeel AlSaed is an Associate Professor at the Department of English Language and Translation at Applied Science Private University (ASU). Dr. Saed received her Ph.D. in Curriculum and Methods of Teaching English from the University of Jordan in 2012. Her main areas of interest include second-language learning, first-language learning, translation studies, socio-linguistics, syntax, and phonetics. Dr. Saed has published many research articles in prestigious journals.*

**e-mail:** *h\_alsaed@asu.edu.jo*

**ORCID ID:** *<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6833-2165>*

**Copyright © 2023 Karina AlOteibi, Ahmad S Haider, Hadeel AlSaed**

**Article history:** Received: 22 May 2023; Reviewed: 15 September 2023; Revised: 5 October 2023; Accepted: 15 October 2023; Published: 12 December 2023



This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

**Citation (APA):** AlOteibi, K., Haider, A.S., & AlSaed, H. (2023). Al Jazeera's para-textual reframing of The Atlantic and Foreign Affairs coverage of the 2022 Russian-Ukrainian War. *Studies in Linguistics, Culture, and FLT, 11*(3), 183-206. <https://doi.org/10.46687/RQTH4999>.

## **Background of the Study**

Narrative discourse is a description of events that uses verbs of speech, motion, and action to describe a series of events. Drawing on Baker (2018) theory of narrativity, this paper investigates the role of translation in reframing one of the recent events that attracted the whole world's attention, which is the Russian-Ukrainian War. News reporters and translators are not neutral in their coverage, and media outlets, in most cases, have an ideological bias toward one of the conflict parties (Al-Salman & Haider, 2021; Haider, 2019; Haider & Hussein, 2020).

In February 2014, Russia annexed Crimea from Ukraine after the Revolution for Dignity and aided pro-Russian separatists in their conflict with Ukrainian forces in the Donbas. The situation then worsened, and Russia launched a full-scale attack on Ukraine on February 24, 2022. Western officials have argued that the scale of the war could be the largest in Europe since 1945. The conflict led to a humanitarian crisis. The EU, the US, and some countries imposed sanctions on Russia. The Russian-Ukrainian War provoked a debate among Arab populations about the adverse effects the war is having on the economies of some Arab countries. Some claim that the robust man model (using Putin as an example) inspires the Arab people as a way to develop and influence the world order. Putin is portrayed as the leader who defied the Western plot of democratization in Eastern Europe, created the West dependence on Russian energy, interfered in the US presidential elections, and contributed to stabilizing the Syrian regime. Moreover, the war has already affected several sectors in the Arab region, including oil and gas, agricultural imports, and tourism. There is only one Arab government that is genuinely pro-Putin, namely the Assad regime in Syria, while most of the remaining Arab states prioritize their Western ties. However, this does not imply that Arab nations are at war with the Kremlin. Instead, they typically view Russia as a sizable global power that still matters in their region and occasionally makes interventions advantageous to their interests.

Although there are few studies that tackled reframing narratives in media translation (Al Sharif, 2009; Allawzi, Al-Jabri, Ammari & Ali, 2022; Qin & Zhang, 2018; Smadi, Obeidat & Haider, 2022), this study is significant since it investigates the reframing of the Russian-Ukrainian War, a hot issue that has implications for the whole world. It demonstrates the complex interplay between translation, politics, ideology, and power. This study examines the paratextual reframing strategies when translating news articles from English into Arabic. Thus, it fills a gap in the literature of translation studies and can be useful for media reporters and owners, translators, political scientists, and communication specialists.

This paper examines the paratextual components of ten news articles on the Russian-Ukrainian War. The source articles are extracted from *The Atlantic* and *Foreign Affairs*, while the Arabic translation is retrieved from *Al Jazeera* website. This paper contends that the source texts frame the war in line with the agenda of the media outlets they originate from and then undergo a process of reframing when translated into the target language. The questions posed are:

1. What are the main paratextual reframing devices that *Al Jazeera*'s translators used in reframing the Russian-Ukrainian War narratives?
2. How do paratextual reframing devices affect the Russian-Ukrainian War narratives?

## Review of Related Literature

### *Narrative Theory and Paratextual Framing*

In this paper, narrative theory is adopted since it is a dynamic and flexible approach that acknowledges the complexity of human behavior and does not follow static patterns (Baker, 2010). It also emphasizes the role of translators and interpreters as active participants in the construction of reality. According to Baker (2018), a narrative is a public and individual 'story' that people subscribe to, and that conducts their manner and behavior. They are the stories people tell about the world(s) they live in. The uses of the terms 'narrative' and 'story' are interchangeable in this context. Baker (2018) demonstrates how translation can create or reframe the same story in the target text using the concept of framing. Different narrators can tell the same story differently, depending on their skopos and political objectives. Accordingly, researchers may examine how translation supports, undermines, or changes elements of a particular narrative. In this study, narrative theory is used as a theoretical basis for analyzing and classifying ten articles related to the Russian-Ukrainian War based on paratextual design.

The French theorist Gerard first introduced the term "paratext," arguing that all supplementary content surrounding the main text is deemed paratext (Genette, 1997). In addition, he stated that paratext is an integral part of the text, and any text without paratext cannot be considered a text.

Wolf (2006) stated that various devices fall under paratextual framings, including titles, epigraphs, images, picture frames, footnotes, postscripts, intertitles (in printed literature), opening or closing credits (in films), or captions (in visual arts). He distinguished between "authorized" or "intra-compositional" paratextual framing and "unauthorized" or "extra-compositional" paratextual framing. The former has to do with the paratextual techniques employed by the author of the original text. Conversely, the latter refers to paratextual elements that others, such as translators and interpreters, have altered or added to the

original and actual framed text. The relevance of paratextual framing devices, in general, resides in their ability to mediate between the text and the readers of that text (Kovala, 1996). Endnotes, footnotes, and glossaries are tools used in translation studies that give translators and translation companies a space to remark on and share their opinions on translation (Baker, 2006).

Conflict narratives are politically loaded, which is evident in the public's knowledge (Abu Rumman & Haider, 2023; Al-Abbas & Haider, 2020; Haider, 2019). Interpreting and translation are effective instruments for recognizing the political significance of narratives when the relevant conflict is discussed worldwide. The translation or retelling of a story is eventually embedded within the personal narrative of the translator/reteller and reframed within specific contexts (Hijjo, Kaur & Kadhim, 2019).

### ***Empirical Studies***

Different studies have investigated how political texts are translated into various languages and examined what reframing strategies are used in rendering these texts. For example, Hijjo and Kaur (2017) examined the effectiveness of paratextual reframing devices in manipulating reality by analyzing the English translations of the Arabic media reports on Daesh using the theory of narrativity proposed by Baker (2006). This research suggests that paratextual devices, such as titles, headings, and images with captions, are powerful reframing tools that operate outside the immediate text. Similarly, Sanatifar and Jalalian Daghig (2018) conducted a study on how the Iranian media reframed the way that the Western media had structured the public view of the social and political aspects concerning its nuclear program. The study employed a socio-narrative perspective to analyze the societal narrative and how it operates within society's various units and institutions. It also examined the strategies used by local translators to reframe the story from a micro perspective. The analysis reveals that the translators attempted to remove or downplay the undesired effects of the primary story on their target audience or offer a completely different image of the story.

Qin and Zhang (2018) used Chinese and English versions of news coverage of Edward Snowden's case to demonstrate the framing tactics. The primary body of data for the study comprises 47 Chinese news texts and their English translations that were published between 2013 and 2015 in state-owned Chinese news outlets. The findings showed that the translated reports of this incident are reframed, although the ideologies of the news agency that translated the texts and the organization that broadcasts the Chinese news are the same. Furthermore, the findings revealed that Chinese state-owned news organizations frequently employ selective appropriation and labeling as reframing tactics to validate their versions of events and match their political beliefs. Moreover, Qin and

Zhang (2018) argued that various elements, including the intended readership, the political situation, and the news agency's political orientation influence the process of reframing any narrative.

Adopting Baker's (2006) narrative theory, Hijjo et al. (2019) discussed the potential impact of translators in shaping ideologies and political agendas through their translations of stories. Their research examined how "Daesh" was portrayed in Arabic editorials and their English translations published by the Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI), an organization that frequently receives support from major Western media outlets and is pro-Israel. The study employed narrative theory to examine how narrative legitimizes, normalizes, and justifies specific actions to the public. The results imply that MEMRI uses translation to advance its ideologically charged aim of presenting Arabs and Muslims as terrorists by drawing on the meta-narrative of the War on Terror. This is done through selective and decontextualized excerpts and mistranslation of some others, resulting in a misleading representation of the original Arabic narratives. This difference misled the English audience and impacted their official and public opinion regarding important subjects like the War on Terror, which affected millions of people's lives.

After reviewing the literature and to the best of our knowledge, no study has been conducted to investigate the paratextual reframing of the translation of the 2022 Russian-Ukrainian War narratives, a gap this study attempts to fill.

## Methodology

This section introduces the methods and procedures to be followed in conducting the current study. It discusses the investigated media outlets, data selections, theoretical framework, and study procedures.

### *Investigated Media Outlets*

As mentioned above, three media outlets are examined in this study. The English source texts produced by *The Atlantic* and *Foreign Affairs* are compared with *Al Jazeera's* target articles published in Arabic.

#### *Al Jazeera*

*Al Jazeera*, launched in 1996, is a well-known news channel based in Qatar. It has more than 80 offices around the world. *Al Jazeera* Arabic was the Arab world's first independent news station dedicated to offering comprehensive news and live debates. By shattering long-standing taboos in the region's media, such as hosting Israeli officials or engaging with Arab regimes, *Al Jazeera* has given the Arab world access to contemporary journalism.

This channel is a major Arabic-language news network that has played a significant role in shaping the media landscape in the Arab world. Several fundamental ideologies guide *Al Jazeera*'s editorial approach. Firstly, the network strives to provide an alternative perspective to mainstream media by providing thorough coverage of news stories from a local and international angle. Secondly, it seeks to be an objective, impartial source of information that promotes critical thinking and a range of viewpoints. *Al Jazeera* adheres to freedom of speech and promotes democratic principles. It speaks candidly about human rights issues and pro-democracy movements throughout the Arab world, hoping to give marginalized perspectives and representatives a voice (Figenschou, 2013).

### *The Atlantic*

*The Atlantic* is an American magazine and multi-platform publisher launched in 1857 in Boston. It features articles on politics, business, foreign affairs, culture, arts, technology, and science. The magazine has gained a good reputation across the United States for supporting meaningful careers and identifying emerging poets and writers. The magazine also presents the opinions of knowledgeable writers on significant modern political issues like abolition, education, and others.

*The Atlantic* remains dedicated to creating open-minded forums that allow for vigorous intellectual inquiry along with diverse perspectives for its readers. Despite having no defined partisan or ideological objective, it endorses informed analysis while valuing critical thinking considerably. Thus, its editorial team prioritizes challenging traditional mindsets by entertaining concepts from different political spectrums while advocating comprehensive coverage of global concerns such as international conflicts, diplomacy, and development to benefit from a comprehensive grasp of worldwide complications.

### *Foreign Affairs*

*Foreign Affairs* is an American magazine founded by the Council on Foreign Relations (CFR) way back in 1922 that has evolved into a multi-platform media company providing various services such as print magazines alongside websites/mobile sites/apps and social media feeds. It caters to diversified international subscribers representing multiple interests.

Its focus extends beyond national coverage, engaging in rigorous intellectual analysis independently illuminating varied perspectives without any specific ideological framework aligning itself against or subscribing towards understanding multiple views on complex issues. The magazine's editorial staff favors in-depth investigation and analysis based on trustworthy information. They

strive to provide readers with a comprehensive grasp of complex global issues because there may be numerous interpretations and policy recommendations.

**Data Collection and Corpus Size**

The focus of this study is on the articles that were written in English and translated into Arabic. An English-Arabic parallel corpus of ten pairs of articles on the Russian-Ukrainian War published between February and October 2022 is used. The source texts contain 22,170 English words, and the translated texts 19,416 Arabic words. The first five English source articles were extracted from the Atlantic media outlet, while the other five were retrieved from the Foreign Affairs Magazine’s website. The Arabic versions of the ten articles were extracted from *Al Jazeera*’s official website. Table 1 provides some details on the five selected articles from *The Atlantic* magazine.

**Table 1.** A brief introduction of the selected articles from *The Atlantic*

No.	Title/Link	<i>The Atlantic</i>	<i>Al Jazeera</i>
1	Title	<b>What Russia Is Stirring Up at Chernobyl</b> The 1986 explosion at the plant was a turning point for independence in Ukraine. Now, Russia is threatening to make the country relive that trauma.	ديرت اذام .. لبانق نود قيوون برح لبونرشت لعافم نم ايسور (Lit. Nuclear war without bombs... <i>What does Russia want from the Chornobyl reactor?</i> )
	Date	MARCH 02, 2022	MARCH 26, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://theatlantic.com/science/archive/2022/03/ukraine-russia-chernobyl-warning/623878/">https://theatlantic.com/science/archive/2022/03/ukraine-russia-chernobyl-warning/623878/</a>	<a href="https://t.ly/T9Xi6">https://t.ly/T9Xi6</a>
2	Title	<b>Putin Doesn’t Realize How Much Warfare Has Changed</b> The Russian president’s obsession with World War II is hindering his invasion of Ukraine.	سيئرلا لفاغأ له .. ني توب تاق افخ! خي راتلا سوردي سورلا (Lit. Putin’s failures... <i>Did the Russian president ignore the lessons of history?</i> )
	Date	MARCH 24, 2022	MAY 14, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/03/putin-doesnt-realize-how-much-warfare-has-changed/627600/">https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/03/putin-doesnt-realize-how-much-warfare-has-changed/627600/</a>	<a href="https://t.ly/BMi4G">https://t.ly/BMi4G</a>



No.	Title/ Link	<i>The Atlantic</i>	<i>Al Jazeera</i>
3	Title	<b>Putin Is Just Following the Manual</b> A utopian Russian novel predicted Putin's war plan.	ڈی اورلا .. لٹل فملا نیلمرنگلا باتک اینارکوا برحپ تآبنت یتلا (Lit. <i>The Kremlin's favorite book... The novel that predicted the war in Ukraine</i> )
	Date	MARCH 26, 2022	APRIL 19, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/03/putin-kremlin-foreign-policy-strategy/629388/">https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/03/putin-kremlin-foreign-policy-strategy/629388/</a>	<a href="https://t.ly/od6KC">https://t.ly/od6KC</a>
4	Title	<b>The Biggest Threat to Putin's Control of Crimea</b> Crimean Tatars have long helped shape Ukraine's sense of self as a vibrant multiethnic, multiconfessional, multilingual place.	نومل سمل ا ن سلا .. مرقل رات یف ایسور دض ا ه اوملا نودوقی اینارکوا (Lit. <i>Crimean Tatars... Sunni Muslims lead the confrontation against Russia in Ukraine</i> )
	Date	MAY 17, 2022	SEPTEMBER 10, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/05/ukraine-war-crimean-tatars-stalin-soviet-union/629824/">https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/05/ukraine-war-crimean-tatars-stalin-soviet-union/629824/</a>	<a href="https://t.ly/64332">https://t.ly/64332</a>
5	Title	<b>WHAT IF RUSSIA USES NUCLEAR WEAPONS IN UKRAINE?</b> A look at the grim scenarios - and the U.S. playbook for each	نی ا : یوونلا برحل تاهویرانیس احال س ایسور مدختست ن ا نکمی نطنش او درتس فیکو ؟ یوونلا (Lit. <i>Scenarios of nuclear war: Where can Russia use its nuclear weapons? And how will Washing- ton respond?</i> )
	Date	JUNE 20, 2022	SEPTEMBER 23, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/06/russia-ukraine-nuclear-weapon-us-response/661315/">https://theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/06/russia-ukraine-nuclear-weapon-us-response/661315/</a>	<a href="https://t.ly/1Uu7u">https://t.ly/1Uu7u</a>

Table 2 provides some details on the five selected articles from *Foreign Affairs* magazine.

**Table 2.** A brief introduction of the selected articles from *Foreign Affairs*

No.	Title/ Link	<i>Foreign Affairs</i>	<i>Al Jazeera</i>
1	Title	<b>The Coming Ukrainian Insurgency</b> Russia's Invasion Could Unleash Forces the Kremlin Can't Control	حالم .. رظت نمل نی توب سوباک اینارکوا یف امدقل اضاقتنالا (Lit. <i>Putin's anticipated nightmare... The features of the upcoming uprising in Ukraine</i> )
	Date	FEBRUARY 25, 2022	FEBRUARY 26, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://foreignaffairs.com/articles/ukraine/2022-02-25/coming-ukrainian-insurgency">https://foreignaffairs.com/articles/ukraine/2022-02-25/coming-ukrainian-insurgency</a>	<a href="https://bit.ly/3GH2azz">https://bit.ly/3GH2azz</a>



2	Title	<b>The Return of Conquest?</b> Why the Future of Global Order Hinges on Ukraine	وحام ايسور دي رت اذامل.. ةشهل ا دودحلا لمل اعل ا طيرخ نم اينا ركوأ (Lit. <i>Fragile borders... Why does Russia want to erase Ukraine from the world map?</i> )
	Date	APRIL 06, 2022	APRIL 20, 2022
2	Link	<a href="https://foreignaffairs.com/articles/ukraine/2022-04-06/ukraine-russia-war-return-conquest">https://foreignaffairs.com/articles/ukraine/2022-04-06/ukraine-russia-war-return-conquest</a>	<a href="https://bit.ly/3GkQZfJ">https://bit.ly/3GkQZfJ</a>
3	Title	<b>China's New Vassal</b> How the War in Ukraine Turned Moscow Into Beijing's Junior Partner	له.. بديل ا مّزقت و نين تال ا قلم عت ةلود ل ا ايسور اينا ركوأ برح لوح ت ؟ ني صل ل عبات (Lit. <i>The dragon is stomping, and the bear is stunting... Will the Ukraine war turn Russia into a state of China?</i> )
	Date	AUGUST 09, 2022	AUGUST 11, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://foreignaffairs.com/china/chinas-new-vassal">https://foreignaffairs.com/china/chinas-new-vassal</a>	<a href="https://bit.ly/3RlCrCy">https://bit.ly/3RlCrCy</a>
4	Title	<b>All the Tsar's Men</b> Why Mobilization Can't Save Putin's War	ةئبع تال ا ذقن ت له.. رصي قلا ل اجر لك يف هطروت ما نيتوب ةيركس عل اينا ركوأ ع قن تسم (Lit. <i>All the Tsar's Men... Will the military mobilization save Putin or get him involved in the Ukraine quagmire?</i> )
	Date	SEPTEMBER 23, 2022	OCTOBER 03, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://foreignaffairs.com/ukraine/all-tsars-men">https://foreignaffairs.com/ukraine/all-tsars-men</a>	<a href="https://bit.ly/3uENAFS">https://bit.ly/3uENAFS</a>
5	Title	<b>Can Ukraine Survive the Winter?</b> What the Country Needs to Hold Out	مسح ي له.. صا صرل او دربال ا ةكرع اينا ركوأ برح اءاتش ل (Lit. <i>The battle of cold and lead... Will winter decide the war in Ukraine?</i> )
	Date	NOVEMBER 08, 2022	DECEMBER 27, 2022
	Link	<a href="https://foreignaffairs.com/ukraine/can-ukraine-survive-winter">https://foreignaffairs.com/ukraine/can-ukraine-survive-winter</a>	<a href="https://bit.ly/4a2pUvs">https://bit.ly/4a2pUvs</a>

The compiled data were divided into two main sub-corpora based on the language, mainly an English sub-corpus and an Arabic counterpart. The English sub-corpus contains the texts that were written in English (English as a source language/SL), while its Arabic counterpart contains the Arabic translation of the English articles (Arabic as a target language/TL).

### ***Theoretical Framework***

This paper adopts Baker's (2018) narrative theory. By drawing upon this theory, the study aims to explore the influence of translation on the target readers, emphasizing the significance of understanding the interconnection between texts to comprehend the overarching narrative. Additionally, in line with Baker's framing concept, the study explores how translation might construct or reframe a story in the target language, stressing the influence of many narrators with various skopos and political objectives. This approach will provide insights into how translation choices can maintain, undermine, or modify narrative aspects.

### ***Procedures***

The procedures (to be) followed in this paper are as follows:

1. Selecting an occasion that different news outlets densely covered. The Russian-Ukrainian War 2022 was selected.
2. Looking for online news websites and broadcasters in Arabic and English that covered the event. Three main media outlets were selected, namely *Al Jazeera*, *Foreign Affairs*, and *The Atlantic*.
3. Ten pairs of Arabic and English articles were extracted from the websites of the three news outlets.
4. Comparing the English Articles with their Arabic counterparts.
5. Identifying the parts that were paratextually reframed in the translated versions.

It is worth noting that all Arabic text excerpts and examples included in this study have been translated into English by the authors, who acknowledge that it is their obligation to ensure that the translations accurately communicate the original Arabic content's intended meaning. Additionally, these translations were checked by two scholars with expertise in translation to guarantee the highest degree of translation quality.

### ***Analysis and Findings***

In this section, the paratextual framing strategies utilized by *Al Jazeera* to reframe the Russian-Ukrainian War were examined. These strategies include titles, subheadings, introductions, and footnotes.

#### ***Titles***

Titles are the first elements to be read, and based on them, one decides whether to continue reading the article or not (Al-Salman & Haider, 2021; Haider & Hussein, 2020). They act as indicators of the text's content. They also direct the

reader’s comprehension of the narrative. Whether original or translated, titles can influence and guide people’s ideas about specific events by supporting or undermining certain public narratives as they occupy an initial position in the article with a bold font (Lanser, 1981). Table 3 shows examples of paratextual title framings.

**Table 3.** Examples of paratextual title framing

No.	Source	ST	TT ( <i>Al Jazeera</i> )	Literal Translation
1	Foreign Affairs	All the Tsar’s Men	..رصى قلا لاجر لك هى بعثتلا ذقنت له مأ نيتوب ءيركس عل عقنتسم يف هطروت ؟ ايناركوا	All the Tsar’s Men... Will the military mobilization save Putin or get him involved in the Ukraine quagmire?
		Why Mobilization Can’t Save Putin’s War		
2	Foreign Affairs	China’s New Vassal	نينتلا قلم عت له ..بدلا م زقتو ايناركوا برح لوح ععبات ءلود ل ايسور ؟ نىصلل	The dragon is stomping, and the bear is stunting... Will the Ukraine war turn Russia into a state of China?
		How the War in Ukraine Turned Moscow Into Beijing’s Junior Partner		
3		The Biggest Threat to Putin’s Control of Crimea	ةن سلا ..م ر قلا راتت نودو في نومل س م لا ايسور دض ءه ج اوم لا ايناركوا يف	Crimean Tatars... Sunni Muslims lead the confrontation against Russia in Ukraine
		Crimean Tatars have long helped shape Ukraine’s sense of self as a vibrant multiethnic, multiconfessional, multilingual place.		
4	The Atlantic	Putin Doesn’t Realize How Much Warfare Has Changed	له ..نينتوب تاقاف خ يسور لا سيئرلا لف خ ؟ خيراتلا سورد	Putin’s failures... Did the Russian president ignore the lessons of history?
		The Russian president’s obsession with World War II is hindering his invasion of Ukraine.		

In Example 1, the translator reframed the original narrative by using some specific lexical choices such as “؟ ايناركوا عقنتسم يف هطروت” (Lit. *get him involved in the Ukraine quagmire?*) to draw the reader’s attention to the fact that mobilization may not save Putin, but rather lead him into a pit. The word “quagmire” itself has a negative connotation. It relates to a difficult, complicated, or unpleasant situation that is not easy to avoid or escape.

In example 2, using the term “vassal” in the title of an American editorial implies that Russia is subordinate to China, which clearly indicates the balance of power between the two nations. However, *Al Jazeera* replaced the title of

the ST with a new one to attract the audience by employing specific symbols. The dragon is a powerful symbol commonly associated with Chins in Western media, representing power. Meanwhile, the bear is a symbol often associated with Russia, symbolizing its potency and resilience. As Hijjo and Kaur (2017) put it, “framing by labeling in the translation of the article’s title signals a different narrative than of the source, thus leading the target audience to a framed interpretation of the text” (Hijjo & Kaur, 2017, p. 25).

In Example 3, *Al Jazeera* replaced the narrative of the ST with a completely new one to shift the viewers’ attention to the fact that the Crimean Tatars Sunni Muslims oppose Russia. Since the majority of *Al Jazeera*’s audience is Muslims, the translator wanted to draw attention to this particular group and thus make them empathize with the war.

In Example 4, *Al Jazeera*’s translator reframed the original narrative by using simpler words and to the point. The new narrative suggests that Putin’s actions in Ukraine may be seen as a failure and that he might have missed out on important historical lessons. The title points out that Putin might have made errors that could have been avoided if he had learned from the past, while the source one highlights his lack of adaptability to modern warfare. Using the examples above, it is clear that title manipulation through framing may be utilized to reframe narratives through translation (Baker, 2018).

In conclusion, the variations in the previously mentioned titles show how minor changes in wording can highlight various viewpoints and generate contrasting meanings. Three of the examples above change definitive statements into questions, thus assuming the middle-of-the-road position. Because of this, it is crucial for readers to critically assess titles and be aware of any potential bias or agenda. It is worth emphasizing that readers can access the original text since *Al Jazeera* left a link to the original text at the end of each article. This encourages a closer investigation of the actual content to get a thorough comprehension of the subject.

### ***Subheadings***

Subheadings are paratextual materials introduced by the text producer to split a text thematically into sections so as to make reading easier (Hijjo & Kaur, 2017). Subheadings, intertitles, and internal titles are also used in translation to reframe narratives in translated texts since they help create cohesive narratives by integrating diverse narrative parts and directing readers to a newly created narrative (Al Sharif, 2009). *Al Jazeera* divided all ten translated articles under investigation into sub-sections. In many cases, it tended to translate an already existing subheading from English into Arabic, and in many others, it has created new ones. Table 4 shows some examples of paratextual subheading framing.

**Table 4.** Examples of paratextual reframing through subheading

No.	Source	ST	TT ( <i>Al Jazeera</i> )	Literal Translation
5	Foreign Affairs	MISTAKES BREED MISTAKES	عبرألا ايسور اياطخ	Russia's four sins
6		FORCES UNLEASHED	يناركوالا بعشلا مُفُوقلا نم جرخي	The Ukrainian people are coming out of the bottle or emerging from the abyss.
7		LEAVE A LIGHT ON	دربلا .. 2023ءاتش صااصلرلا نم يسقا انايح	Winter 2023... The cold is sometimes harsher than bullets.
8	The Atlantic	-	يف ايسور لبونرشت	Russia in Chernobyl
9		-	خيراتلاب سوهلا	Obsession with history
10		-	ةلحر ..موقلا راتت قبزغلاو ملألا	Crimean Tatars... A journey of pain and alienation

In many cases, the translation of subheadings on *Al Jazeera* was neutral and balanced. In Example 5, the English subheading, retrieved from *Foreign Affairs*, is “MISTAKES BREED MISTAKES,” whereas the TT is “عبرألا ايسور اياطخ” (Lit. *Russia's four sins*). The translator conveyed almost the same meaning using more specific words. The Arabic subheading refers mainly to “Russia’s four sins,” which implies that the blame for the conflict lies squarely on Russia’s shoulders. Furthermore, the use of the word “اياطخ” (*sins/mistakes*) also holds a moral connotation, which further reinforces the negative portrayal of Russia’s actions. The subheading may have been translated in this way to appeal to Arab readers who might have a different understanding of the Russian-Ukrainian struggle. In many parts of the Arab world, there is a deep mistrust of Russian actions in Syria and other regional conflicts, which could have influenced the translator’s decision to frame the narrative in this way. Additionally, using numbering, as in “the four sins,” is a common rhetorical device in Arabic media, which could have made the subheading more attractive to Arab readers. Arab media frequently includes cultural features that appeal to Arab audiences. By using numbers, the topic can feel more accessible and recognizable in light of this cultural background. The anticipation that a numbering scheme can evoke can entice readers to keep reading to find out what each item comprises. This can be a good way to grab the audience’s interest.

In example 6, the English subheading “FORCES UNLEASHED” is translated as “مُفُوقلا نم جرخي يناركوالا بعشلا” (Lit. *The Ukrainian people are coming out of the bottle or emerging from the abyss*). The translator appears to have engaged in reframing by creating a new subheading that highlights the agency of the Ukrainian individuals rather than the movements of external forces. It is also

worth noting that the Arabic subheading contains a relatively cultural reference to the phrase “ماظنل اطاقس! دي ري بعشلا” (Lit. *The people want to overthrow the regime*), which was a famous slogan during the Arab Spring protests. This allusion may be an attempt by the translator to compare the situation in Ukraine to the larger worldwide battle for democracy and human rights.

In example 7, the source English subheading “*LEAVE A LIGHT ON*” is a metaphorical expression that suggests hope and resilience in the face of hardship, adversity, and trouble. Therefore, it can be interpreted as an encouragement and motivation to keep the light of hope burning even in the darkest times, which is relevant to this context. On the other hand, the translated subheading “انايحأ صا صرلا نم يسقأ دربل... 2023 ءاتش” (Lit. *Winter 2023... The cold is sometimes harsher than bullets*) represents the harsh winter weather conditions in 2023, with the added emphasis on how the cold can be just as deadly as bullets. However, it is worth noting that the selection of subheadings can greatly impact how the reader interprets the text. In this instance, the subheading’s translation might give a more accurate account of the severe winter weather in 2023. Still, it may also lack the source subheading’s emotional impact and motivation.

As noted from the previously discussed three examples (5, 6, 7) extracted from the *Foreign Affairs*, subheadings existed in each article, and many were capitalized to get the readers’ attention. At the same time, the authors in *The Atlantic* magazine did not divide the articles into sub-sections at all. As shown in examples (8, 9, 10), *Al Jazeera* created a new subheading that is consistent with the translated texts beneath. However, adding sub-headings may be confusing for some readers as to whether they were in the original article or added by *Al Jazeera*.

In example 8, the translator of *Al Jazeera* employed a reframing strategy by adding a new subheading, “لبونرشت يف ايسور” (Lit. *Russia in Chornobyl*). This subheading may serve to reframe the narrative by drawing a parallel connection between the disaster in Chornobyl and Russia’s involvement in the Russian-Ukrainian War. In the ST, no subheading corresponds to “Russia in Chernobyl.” Hence, the translator has included this subheading to highlight Russia’s involvement in the ongoing conflict. Since Chornobyl is a well-known disaster with enduring repercussions on people and the environment, this reframing technique may also convey a sense of urgency or significance. Moreover, by connecting the article to a well-known historical event and subject, this subheading might also increase readers’ interest in the report.

In example 9, the newly inserted subheading by the translator is related to Russian President Vladimir Putin. Here, the translator attempts to give the reader a particular perspective on Putin’s actions and motivations in the current conflict. The subheading, which translates to “Obsession with history,” implies

that Putin's actions in the war are driven by his personal beliefs and ideas about Russian history and nationalism. By including this subheading, the translator provides context for the reader and frames the story in a way that shapes how they see Putin's actions. This subheading could also be an attempt to appeal to readers' emotions and create a more powerful story. By emphasizing Putin's historical "obsession," the translator asserts that the conflict is deeply rooted in his perspective rather than just political tactics or reasoning. Such a portrayal of Putin's behavior could evoke stronger emotions from the reader and elevate their worries regarding the conflict's consequences.

In example 10, *Al Jazeera's* translator has inserted a new subheading, "راتت... مرقلا ةبزل او ملأا ةلحر... مرقلا" (Lit. *Crimean Tatars... A journey of pain and alienation*), which not only summarizes and reiterates the central theme of the article but also adds a new layer of meaning to the main highlights of the text, which is the situation of the Crimean Tatars, who were forced to leave their homes as a result of the Russian-Ukrainian War. The translator's decision to insert a new subheading could be interpreted as a purposeful attempt to reframe the article's narrative in a way that appeals to the intended audience (Gentzler, 2016). In the Arabic subheading, for instance, the misery and exile of the Crimean Tatars are emphasized, which is likely to resonate with certain Arab readers who have experienced exile and expulsion in the past. The translator can better connect emotionally with some readers and place the text within a larger narrative of injustice and human suffering by framing it in this way.

In general, the use of subheadings as a paratextual reframing tool in translation is often successful because by adding new subheadings, translators can influence how readers interpret the material and create stronger emotional connections with their target audience. However, such reframing strategies can also be controversial, as they involve making decisions about texts that the original authors may not have fully authorized. Therefore, translators should be aware of such strategies' potential risks and benefits and use them judiciously in their work (Baker, 2006).

### ***Introductions***

Introductions are essential elements of news articles as they provide readers with a first impression and prepare them for the content of the article. The main goal of the introduction is to let readers be familiarized with the topic of an article. In its translation of news articles from other sources, *Al Jazeera* designated a section for providing an introduction. This intentional addition aids the framing process by providing readers with information that shapes their first expectations about the story in question (Wolf, 2006). Table 5 shows examples of paratextual introduction framing.



**Table 5.** Examples of paratextual introduction framing

No.	Source	TT ( <i>Al Jazeera</i> )	Literal Translation
11	Foreign Affairs	<p>ةمجرتلا ةمدقم ءابنأ هيف تءب يذلا تقولا يف ايناركوا يف ةيسورلا تاسكتنالا جرخ ،مالعال لئاسو ول برسنت نيتوبري ميءالف يسورلا سيئرلا /ربم تبس 21 يف باطخ يف ةيركسع ةئبعت انلعلم لول ي ةيملاعلا برحلا ذنم ةقوبسم ريغ ءاربخ لداجي نيح يفو .ةينائل مجب شيج يف ةئبعتلا نالع ان بلقي نأ نكمي يسورلا شيجلا ،بقة لءاسا ةيركسعلا نيزاوملا نأ نكمي ةوطخلا هذو نأ نورخا نءاري .اهلحت نأ نم الءب وكسوم قمءا قمعت نيروف“ ةلجب روشنملا هلاقم يف سنرول لداجي ،ةيكريمال “زريفأ تاسارءل يرخفلا ذاتسالا ،نامءيرف نءنل جءيلوك زجنك يف برحلا ءسايس :ءايقلا“ باتك فلؤم لإ اينرؤك نم ةيركسعلا تايلمعلا ريخالا ةئبعتلا رارق نأ ،”ايناركوا لءع ةمخو بقاوع هل نوكت فوس ،ايناركوا يف طقف سيل ،ايسور .اهسفن وكسوم يف نكلو</p>	<p><b>Introduction to translation</b> As news of Russia’s setbacks in Ukraine is leaking to the media, Russian President Vladimir Putin made a speech on September 21 declaring a military mobilization unprecedented since World War II. While experts argue that declaring mobilization in an army the size of the Russian could turn the military balance upside down, others bet that this step could deepen Moscow’s crisis rather than solve it. Lawrence Freedman, who is an Emeritus Professor of War Studies at King’s College London and the author of “Command: The Politics of Military Operations From Korea to Ukraine,” in his article published in the American magazine “Foreign Affairs,” argues that the recent mobilization decision will have dire consequences for Russia, not only in Ukraine but in Moscow itself.</p>
12	Foreign Affairs	<p>ةمجرتلا ةمدقم نأشب اقح ايسور هل ططخت يذلا ام اهرظتن لبقتسم ياؤ؟ ايناركوا ةوقلاب اءرطيسي تفسب لءح انءخأي لاقملا اءه يف؟ ءالبل لءع قباسال لوؤسملا ،نوءنول سالغوء ةيزكرملا تارباخملا ءلاكو يف ،ءوقع ءئالء نم رءكئال ةيكريمال هءاوتس يذلا ويرانيسلا لءل ايناركوا لءالءح ترقق لءح ايسور ائبنتم ،اهنم ءازجا ول لمكلاب برح هءاوت فوس وكسوم نأب ءفلكتلا ءظهاب ءسرس تاءاصع ءاسالا اهءايءءت زواءتت امبر .اهسفن ايسور لءءل ءل ايناركوال</p>	<p><b>Introduction to translation</b> What is Russia really planning to do about Ukraine? And what future awaits it if it forcibly extends its control over the country? In this article, Douglas London, a former CIA official with more than three decades of experience, takes us through the scenario that Russia will face if it decides to occupy Ukraine in whole or in part, predicting that Moscow will face a costly and fierce guerrilla war whose ramifications may extend beyond Ukraine and into Russia itself.</p>

No.	Source	TT ( <i>Al Jazeera</i> )	Literal Translation
13		<p>تم جرتل ا دمدم ري مي دالف، يسورلا سي ئرلا ناوت ي مل حيولتلا او ديهتلا نع ”ني توب يف ةي وونلا ةحل سأل امدخت ساب هوزغ ةي ادب يف اميس ال ،اي ناركوا تايا لولا بجت ست مل و .دال بل يتح تا دي دهتلا كلت نم يال ةدحت ملا تايا لولا يلع يتم نكل ،اي لعف نال فيكو ؟درل اب رارق ذاختا ةدحت ملا شاقنلا اذه لوح ؟درل اذه لكش نو كيسي تا رابخت سالا عم تجم طاسوا يف رئادلا ررحملا و بتالكلا دعأ ،ي كيري مال ن مال او ةلجم هترشن ال يلحت ”رسولش كيري“ ةي كيري مال ”كي يتنالتا ي ذ“</p>	<p><b>Introduction to translation</b> Russian President Vladimir Putin did not hesitate to threaten and allude to the use of nuclear weapons in Ukraine, especially at the beginning of his invasion of the country. The United States has not yet responded to any of these threats, but when will the United States decide to respond? And what will the nature of this response be? This is the debate that is currently taking place among the American intelligence and security community. The writer and editor, Eric Schlosser, prepared an analysis published by the American magazine “The Atlantic” on this issue.</p>
14	The Atlantic	<p>تم جرتل ا دمدم لكي يتنالتا اذ ةلجم نم لا قمل اذه يف خي راتلا يف تح ابلا نراق ي نيب ”رُف ي ب ين وطن أ“، يركس عل يتلا ةي ركس عل تاكي تكتلا ةي ل ا حلا ابرح يف ايسور امدخت ست يتلا تاكي تكتلا او ،اي ناركوا يف ةي تي فوسلا تا و قلا اتم دخت سا ة، تي نالتا ةي مل اعلا برحلا ناب يسورلا سي ئرلا نأ يل صل خيل بيل اسال ا خاسن تنسا مويلا دي عي وهو ،اهس فن ةم دقلا ةي ركس عل رُف ي بل اق فو- من كمي وي ران ي س اهب بس ةر دم جم ئاتن زرفي ن زواجت نع ني توب زجع وه يس اسال ايسورل ي تي فوسلا ي ضاملا</p>	<p><b>Introduction to translation</b> In this article from The Atlantic magazine, military historian “Anthony Beevor” compares the military tactics used by Russia in its current war in Ukraine to those used by Soviet forces during World War II. He concludes that the Russian president is now reproducing the same old military methods, which, according to Beevor, could lead to devastating results, mainly caused by Putin’s inability to move beyond Russia’s Soviet past.</p>

As Table 5 shows, *Al Jazeera* reshaped the TT by inserting politically charged introductions to the translated text to provide recipients with some background information before reading the rest of the text. In Example 11, the introduction contained some information about the topic to be discussed in the article. Initially, it highlighted the news of Russia’s defeat in Ukraine and how Putin announced an unprecedented military mobilization. It also included quotes from professionals and academics who argue that the action would worsen Moscow’s issue. This framing makes an initial expectation that the news story will be focused on the negative outcomes of Putin’s actions and their potential impact on Russia. According to Entman (1993), framing involves choosing some aspects of a perceived reality and emphasizing them in a communicative text in order to stimulate a specific problem definition, causal interpretation, moral assessment, and/or treatment prescription. This is exactly what the *Al Jazeera* introduction

does. It chose a few key details from the news story and presented them in a way that supports a particular problem definition (the Ukrainian crisis and its potential to worsen), causal interpretation (Putin's military mobilization), and treatment recommendation (the necessity of international action).

In example 12, *Al Jazeera* added an introduction that aids in framing by providing context and raising interesting questions that bring the reader's attention to the subject. It prompts two important queries: What is Russia's strategy for Ukraine, and what will happen if it succeeds in its efforts to take control of the nation by force? By presenting these queries, *Al Jazeera* prepares the ground for a more thorough investigation. The author, Douglas London, a former CIA agent with more than three decades of expertise, is also briefly introduced in the introduction, which increases the article's credibility. It is worth mentioning that almost in each introduction, *Al Jazeera* provides some information about the journalist who wrote the article. Usually, this information is written at the very end of the original article as a footnote, but *Al Jazeera* decided to give more credit to the original author of the ST by putting his/her name at the very beginning in the introduction section.

In example 13, the introduction provided by *Al Jazeera* highlights Russian President Vladimir Putin's threats to use nuclear weapons in Ukraine. It also begs the question of how and in what manner the United States will respond to these threats. *Al Jazeera* frames the story in a way that underscores the gravity of the situation and begs questions about the possible consequences by offering an introduction focusing on Putin's nuclear dangers. As previously discussed, mentioning the authors' analysis from the selected magazine in the introduction lends the story more authority. According to Kellner and Share (2007), determining the truthfulness and persuasiveness of media messages depends heavily on the source's reliability.

In example 14, the inserted introduction summarizes the key ideas covered in Anthony Beevor's article. It draws attention to the contrast between the military strategies employed by Soviet forces during World War II and those used by Russia in its ongoing war with Ukraine. It also implies that the Russian president is employing outdated military strategies, which could have disastrous consequences. Readers might influence their opinions by comprehending the major themes of the article through this introduction. The introduction also offers readers a framework for understanding the article's context and main key concepts.

While analyzing the ten selected articles, it was found that *Al Jazeera* used introduction framing to support certain frames in each article that drive readers' thoughts to the intended narrative. *Al Jazeera's* framing recontextualizes the English narratives under study by adding a brief introduction to the translations, thus signaling different interpretations than those in the sources. This acts as

a framing tool that establishes the tone for the rest of the article and molds the first expectations of the readers. By citing reliable sources and using persuasive language, the outlet can attract readers and highlight the situation's seriousness. In addition, *Al Jazeera* boosts the credibility of its news and emphasizes the gravity of the concern by quoting reputable journalists and sources.

### Footnotes

Footnotes, endnotes, and glossaries are tools that help translators remark on their translation (Baker, 2006). They are paratextual materials that allow authors to further explain and support their arguments and ensure that the target audience understands the texts smoothly (Hijjo et al., 2019). Footnotes frequently include “framed” definitions and links to resources that can be found outside the text.

Providing links to primary sources is a persuasion tool and a way to gain the audience's trust. The translated articles on *Al Jazeera* have a special section at the end in which a link to the source article is attached. Table 6 shows examples of paratextual footnote links and the author's biographical information.

**Table 6.** Examples of links and some biographical information

No.	Source	ST	TT ( <i>Al Jazeera</i> )	Literal Translation
15	<i>Foreign Affairs</i>	LAWRENCE FREEDMAN is an Emeritus Professor of War Studies at King's College London and the author of <i>Command: The Politics of Military Operations From Korea to Ukraine</i> . MORE BY LAWRENCE D. FREEDMAN	م ج ر ت م ل ا ق م ل ا ا ذ ه ن ع Foreign Affairs ق ر و ر ض ل ل ا ب ر ب ع ي ا ل و ن ا د ي م ع ق و م ن ع د م ح م م ي ر ك : ق م ج ر ت ع ق ا و م : ر د ص م ل ا ق ي ن و ر ت ك ل ا	This article is translated from <i>Foreign Affairs</i> and does not necessarily reflect the site's point of view. Translated by: Karim Mohammad. Source: Websites
16	<i>The Atlantic</i>	Dina Khapaeva is the director of the Russian studies program at Georgia Tech's School of Modern Languages. She is the author of <i>The Celebration of Death in Contemporary Culture</i> .	* م ج ر ت م ل ا ت ا ق ي ل ع ت * ي ر ي خ ر و ن : ق م ج ر ت م ج ر ت م ر ي ر ق ت ل ا ا ذ ه ن ع The Atlantic ا ل و ن ع ق ر و ر ض ل ل ا ب ر ب ع ي ن ا د ي م ع ق و م ق ر ي ز ج ل ا : ر د ص م ل ا	*Translator's remarks. Translated by: Noor Khairy This article is translated from <u>The Atlantic</u> and does not necessarily reflect the site's point of view. Source: <i>Al Jazeera</i>

Example 15 shows that *Al Jazeera*'s endnotes include references to the primary sources of the article, as well as the translator's name and the link to their other works. It is worth noting that the Foreign Affairs footnote contains biographical information about the author of the text itself, Lawrence Freedman, and a link to his other published articles. The target text footnote, on the other hand, informs the reader that the article is translated from Foreign Affairs and may not necessarily represent the website's views. The reason behind *Al Jazeera*'s disclaimer in the TT footnote is likely connected to the concept of reframing narratives in media translation. Media translation involves translating words and conveying cultural values, viewpoints, and ideologies. *Al Jazeera* may have inserted this disclaimer to clarify that they merely provide a translation of the original article and that the opinions represented therein may not always correspond to their own editorial stance. This is particularly important in media translation since differing cultural and political backgrounds could affect how the target audience perceives the same material.

Same as in example 16, the ST footnote provides biographical information about the author, Dina Khapaeva, while the TT footnote contains no biographical information. Instead, it provides the translator's name and the link to the source of the translation. As mentioned before, *Al Jazeera*'s statement in the TT footnote: "This report is translated from *The Atlantic* and does not necessarily reflect the viewpoints of *Al Jazeera*," is a form of reframing narratives in media translation. It is a way of distancing the media outlet from any possible debate or criticism that may arise from the content of the translated report. By acknowledging that the report is a translation and not an original piece of work produced by its own media outlet, *Al Jazeera* demonstrates that they are not responsible for the report's content and that any opinions expressed do not necessarily represent its own views. As it acknowledges any potential biases and perspectives included in the source material and allows readers to establish their own opinions and thoughts, this can be viewed as a sort of responsible journalism.

A glossary is a collection of words and definitions related to a specific subject. Glossaries make it simple for readers to find terminology and explanations for some jargon (George, 2022). By ensuring that the audience is aware and capable of understanding the meaning of the terms and expressions used in reports, glossaries can play a crucial part in reframing narratives in the context of media translation. In all ten selected articles, *Al Jazeera* only **once** provided its target audience with a footnote glossary. Table 7 shows an example of a paratextual footnote glossary.

**Table 7.** Example of paratextual footnote glossary

No.	TT ( <i>Al Jazeera</i> )	Literal Translation
17	شماوه: *بنيان عالا واتي ارقلا قيديوهيلا* قيديوهيلا قناي دل اي ف راي ت يه عاروتلاب ال ا عاب ت ا نمؤي ال لوزن نوركني و ، ةبوت ك م ل ا عاروتلل قيهفش تاري سفت مي دقل ا دهعلا دعب	Margins: * Karaite or Anani Judaism: It is current in the Jewish religion whose followers believe only in the written Torah and deny the revelation of oral interpretations of the Torah after the Old Testament.

While English editorials do not typically have glossaries in any of their articles, in *Al Jazeera*'s translation, they are presented in only one article. In example 17 above, *Al Jazeera* tends to provide its reader with the meaning of "Karaite or Anani Judaism" because some of the target audience may not have come across this term before. Moreover, this definition provides readers with meaningful context and background information essential for understanding the subject matter and helps ensure reporting accuracy.

Overall, the ST footnote provides additional information about the article's author. In contrast, the TT footnote provides information about the translation and its source, in addition to the translator's name and links to his/her other translated works. This serves as an effective tool to gain the audience's trust. Furthermore, by providing definitions and explanations for specific terminology and jargon, glossaries in translated articles can help bridge the gap between the source and target cultures and promote greater accuracy in reporting. Still, *Al Jazeera* only once used a certain meaning of the word in its translations of ten selected articles.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

This paper discusses the reframing narrative strategies employed by *Al Jazeera* in its Arabic translation of *The Atlantic* and *Foreign Affairs* coverage of the 2022 Russian-Ukrainian War. The study showed that *Al Jazeera* used numerous paratextual framing techniques, including titles, subheadings, introductions, and footnotes, to reframe the story of the Russian-Ukrainian War. The paper concludes that the war is framed in the source texts in line with the source media outlets' agenda and is then reframed in the target language through translation.

The paratextual framing strategies employed by *Al Jazeera* contributed to the reframing of the Russian-Ukrainian War. The titles of the translated articles were extremely important for establishing the tone, emphasizing important details, or introducing the readers to a particular viewpoint. Subheadings provided a structural framework for understanding the various sections or themes inside the articles, while introductions offered a preliminary backdrop or framing for the following content. Furthermore, footnotes served as additional points of



emphasis and clarification by providing information about the translation and its source, thus helping to gain the audience's trust.

The findings demonstrate the potential for multiple and divergent interpretations of a single story since different framing decisions result in distinct reader perspectives and comprehensions. To critically interact with news narratives and acquire a thorough grasp of complex conflicts, media consumers, scholars, and politicians must be aware of these instruments and their effects.

Analyzing the paratextual components in the ten chosen news items on the Russian-Ukrainian War has shed light on how the *Al Jazeera* devices reframed the conflict story. The *Al Jazeera* channel strove to adopt a balanced approach, but was not totally effective. They allegedly leaned more toward Ukraine in several cases and expressed compassion for its predicament. This implies that their translation efforts were influenced by prejudices or contextual factors that favored Ukraine over Russia.

Finally, *Al Jazeera's* coverage of the Russian-Ukrainian War was apparently not neutral since it failed to attain a middle-of-the-road position and leaned more toward Ukraine while expressing sympathy for its cause. Individuals must, however, critically assess numerous sources of information in order to build informed viewpoints about the issue.

This paper presents various implications that should be taken into account. Firstly, it underscores the significant role of media organizations like *Al Jazeera* in molding narratives and viewpoints concerning conflicts. Secondly, it underscores the capacity of media institutions to mold public sentiment through translation and framing decisions. Thirdly, employing different framing techniques in translation results in diverse interpretations of the same narrative, highlighting the crucial role of translators in shaping audience perception. Lastly, recognizing framing techniques provides insight into the construction and manipulation of narratives.

The results also have consequences for efforts to resolve conflicts. Different narratives created through translation and framing can affect how the general public views conflicts and their resolution, which may help or facilitate diplomatic efforts and peacebuilding programs. Policymakers, journalists, and other parties involved in conflict resolution need to comprehend and successfully navigate these divergent narratives effectively.

Moreover, the approach also emphasizes how political and cultural settings affect framing decisions. The audience's cultural background, regional dynamics, and editorial policies may influence *Al Jazeera's* reframing tactics. The existence of various and incompatible versions of the story in media discourse emphasizes media diversity. Furthermore, this paper also emphasizes the value of audiences' media literacy and critical thinking abilities. Audiences can critically assess



news pieces and create well-informed opinions by spotting reframing techniques and biases. Finally, the need for ethical journalism and translation procedures prioritizing accuracy, fairness, and transparency is emphasized.

## References

- Abu Rumman, R., & Haider, A. (2023). A corpus-assisted critical discourse analysis of Jordan's 2011 protest movement in Jordanian newspapers. *Online Journal of Communication and Media Technologies*, 13(1), e202306. <https://doi.org/10.30935/ojcm/12856>.
- Al-Abbas, L. S., & Haider, A. S. (2020). The representation of homosexuals in Arabic-language news outlets. *Equality, Diversity Inclusion: An International Journal*, 1-29. <https://doi.org/10.1108/EDI-05-2020-0130>.
- Al-Salman, S., & Haider, A. S. (2021). The representation of Covid-19 and China in Reuters' and Xinhua's Headlines. *Search (Malaysia)*, 13(1), 93-110.
- Al Sharif, S. (2009). *Translation in the service of advocacy: Narrating Palestine and Palestinian women in translations by the Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI)*. United Kingdom: University of Manchester.
- Allawzi, A., Al-Jabri, H., Ammari, D., & Ali, S. (2022). Translation as a political action: Reframing 'the deal of the century' in the translations of the BBC. *Heliyon*, 8(2). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e08856>
- Baker, M. (2006). *Translation and conflict: A narrative account*. London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203099919>.
- Baker, M. (2010). Narratives of terrorism and security: 'Accurate' translations, suspicious frames. *Critical Studies on Terrorism*, 3(3), 347-364. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17539153.2010.521639>
- Baker, M. (2018). *Translation and conflict: A narrative account*. London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429438240>.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of communication*, 43(4), 51-58. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.1993.tb01304.x>
- Figenschou, T. U. (2013). *Al Jazeera and the global media landscape: The South is talking back*. New York and London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203067321>.
- Genette, G. (1997). *Paratexts: Thresholds of interpretation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gentzler, E. (2016). *Translation and rewriting in the age of Post-Translation Studies*. London: Taylor & Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315619194>.
- George, T. (2022). What is a glossary? | Definition, templates, & examples. Retrieved on 15 September 2023 from <https://www.scribbr.com/dissertation/>

glossary-of-a-dissertation/#:~:text=A%20glossary%20is%20a%20collection,be%20obvious%20to%20your%20reader.

- Haider, A. S. (2019). The representation of Al-Megrahi's release in Arabic and English newspapers in 2009 and 2010: A corpus-assisted discourse study. *Dirasat, Human and Social Sciences*, 46(1 Supplement 2), 297-317. <https://doi.org/10.35516/0103-046-986-019>
- Haider, A. S., & Hussein, R. F. (2020). Analysing headlines as a way of downsizing news corpora: Evidence from an Arabic–English comparable corpus of newspaper articles. *Digital Scholarship in the Humanities*, 35(4), 826-844. <https://doi.org/10.1093/llc/fqz074>
- Hijjo, N. F., & Kaur, S. (2017). The paratextual analysis of English translations of Arabic media narratives on Daesh. *The Southeast Asian Journal of English Language Studies*, 23(3), 21-36. <http://doi.org/10.17576/3L-2017-2303-02>
- Hijjo, N. F., Kaur, S., & Kadhim, K. A. (2019). Reframing the Arabic narratives on Daesh in the English media: The ideological impact. *Open Linguistics*, 5(1), 81-93. <https://doi.org/10.1515/opli-2019-0005>
- Kellner, D., & Share, J. (2007). Critical media literacy, democracy, and the reconstruction of education. In D. P. Macedo (Ed.), *Media literacy: A reader* (pp. 3-23). Switzerland: Peter Lang.
- Kovala, U. (1996). Translations, paratextual mediation, and ideological closure. *Target: International Journal of Translation Studies*, 8(1), 119-147. <https://doi.org/10.1075/target.8.1.07kov>
- Lanser, S. S. (1981). *The narrative act: Point of view in prose fiction*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Qin, B., & Zhang, M. (2018). Reframing translated news for target readers: a narrative account of news translation in Snowden's discourses. *Perspectives*, 26(2), 261-276. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676x.2017.1377265>
- Sanatifar, M. S., & Jalalian Daghig, A. (2018). Translation as re-narration: A case of Iran's nuclear program as circulated in the Western and Iranian media. *Asia Pacific Translation and Intercultural Studies*, 5(1), 3-20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23306343.2017.1419799>
- Smadi, H., Obeidat, M., & Haider, A. S. (2022). Paratextual (re)framing of media coverage of Christchurch Mosque Shootings: A translation-oriented study. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2022.2029251>
- Wolf, W. (2006). Introduction: Frames, framings and framing borders in literature and other media. In W. Wolf & W. Bernhart (Eds.), *Framing borders in literature and other media* (Vol. 1, pp. 1-40). Leiden, Netherlands: Brill. [https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401202022\\_003](https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401202022_003)