STUDIES IN LINGUISTICS, CULTURE AND FLT
This first issue of the twelfth volume of *Studies in Linguistics, Culture, and FLT* is the end result of the work of the Department of English Studies, Faculty of Humanities, Konstantin Preslavsky University of Shumen.

*All issues in this volume have been published with the financial support from Project of the Bulgarian National Science Fund – Bulgarian Scientific Periodicals KP-06 NP 5/59 dated December 8, 2023.*

**Editorial Board**: Editor-in-chief: Prof. Roumyana Todorova, PhD (Bulgaria)

**Co-Editor-in-chief**: Assoc. Prof. Desislava Cheshmedzhieva-Stoycheva, PhD (Bulgaria)

**Editors**: Assoc. Prof. Carol Griffiths, PhD (Leeds University, UK); Prof. Dr. el-Sayed el-Aswad (Member of the American Anthropological Association, USA); Prof. Dr. Birsen Tütüncü (Istanbul Kültür University, Istanbul, Turkey); Prof. Dr. Habil Hristo Kyuchukov (University of Silesia, Katowice, Poland); Prof. Dr. Habil Berrin Aksoy (Atilim University, Ankara, Turkey); Assoc. Prof. Brînduşa-Mariana Amâlînî, PhD (University of Bacau, Romania); Prof. D. Litt. Maya Pencheva (Sofia University, Sofia, Bulgaria); Prof. Peter Gärdenfors (Lund University, Lund, Sweden); Assoc. Prof. Dr. Zeynep Z. Atayurt-Fenge (Ankara University, Ankara, Turkey); Assoc. Prof. Dr. Habil Anna Bączkowska (University of Gdańsk, Poland); Assoc. Prof. Mihaela Culea, PhD (University of Bacau, Romania); Assist. Prof. Abdullah Ahmed Zughaibi (English Department, Jazan University, Saudi Arabia); Assist. Prof. Joanna Mikosz, PhD (Lodz University, Lodz, Poland); Assoc. Prof. Irina Ivanova, PhD (Shumen University, Shumen, Bulgaria); Assoc. Prof. Dr. Cihat Atar (Sakarya University, Sakarya, Turkey); Assoc. Prof. Mamadou Abdou Babou Ngom, PhD (Cheikh Anta Diop University of Dakar, Senegal); Assist. Prof. Mira Bekar, PhD (Saints Cyril and Methodius University of Skopje, Skopje, Republic of North Macedonia); Giulia Magazzù, PhD (Gabriele D’Annunzio University of Chieti- Pescara, Italy)

**SILC is indexed and watched** by SCOPUS, Index Copernicus, EBSCO, Directory of Open Access Journals, Scribd, GoogleScholar, Directory of Research Journals Indexing (DRJI), ROAD – Directory of Open Access Scholarly Resources, RINZ, MLA Directory of Periodicals, MLA International Bibliography, Dimensions, National Centre for Information and Documentation (ID 2775), ResearchBib, Mendeley, and MIAR.

**SILC is archived** in CEEOL (full texts, electronic), Bulgarian National Library St. St. Cyril and Metodius (full texts, print and electronic), Index Copernicus (full texts, electronic), and the Bulgarian Portal for Open Science (full texts, electronic).

*The Editorial Board bear no responsibility for the content or accuracy of the articles.*

© Individual contributions: respective authors

© *Studies in Linguistics, Culture, and FLT*

© Asenevtsi Publishing, Sofia

e-ISSN 2534-9538; p-ISSN 2534-952X

https://doi.org/10.46687

ICV 2022: 85.23

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.
Contents

PREFACE ................................................................................................................................. 5

HOW DO TEACHERS PERCEIVE TRANSLANGUAGING? TEACHERS’ PERCEPTIONS ABOUT TRANSLANGUAGING PRACTICES IN THE EFL CLASSROOM
Tuntun Sinaga1, Gede Eka Putrawan ...................................................................................... 8

MULTILINGUAL PRACTICES OF ALGERIAN EFL LEARNERS IN DIGITAL ENVIRONMENTS: A FUNCTIONAL APPROACH
Kamila Ammour .................................................................................................................... 27

PARATEXTUAL REFRAMING OF VISUAL ELEMENTS IN AL JAZEERA’S COVERAGE OF THE 2022 CONFLICT BETWEEN RUSSIA AND UKRAINE
Karina AlOteibi, Ahmad S Haider, Hadeel AlSaed ................................................................. 44

ANALYSING THE ALLOGRAPHIC NOTES IN THE TURKISH TRANSLATION OF AN ECOLOGICAL WORK: SILENT SPRING
Gökçen Hastürkoğlu .................................................................................................................. 70

OPTIONS FOR SUBTITLING ENGLISH MOVIE LYRICS INTO ARABIC
Sundus Hassan, Ahmad S Haider ............................................................................................. 82

ANALYSIS OF THE INTERFACE BETWEEN LANGUAGE COMPETENCE AND CONCEPTUAL METAPHOR IN TRANSLATION STUDIES
Ivaylo Dagnev, Zlatka Chervenkova ...................................................................................... 105
COULD MARRIAGE BE A GLORIFIED TRANSACTIONAL RELATIONSHIP? A COGNITIVE BLENDING APPROACH TO ANALOGIES OF MARRIAGE IN DHOLUO
George Ouma Ogal, Vicky Khasandi-Telewa, Evelyne Mahero......... 126

POWER AND LOVE VERSUS DEATH: “DEATH CONSTANT BEYOND LOVE” BY GABRIEL GARCÍA MÁRQUEZ
Kuğu Tekin.................................................................................................................. 141

SPACE IN WILLIAM SHAKESPEARE’S THE TRAGEDY OF HAMLET, PRINCE OF DENMARK
Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu, Daniela Anisiei ................................. 152

ANGLICISMS IN THE MACEDONIAN POLITICAL DISCOURSE: A SERIOUS THREAT OR A WELCOME ADDITION
Silvana Neshkovska................................................................. 169

BOOK REVIEW: A TOPOGRAPHY PLAGUED BY MARGINALITY IN VICTORIAN NOVELS
Veronica-Loredana Balan.......................................................... 190

BOOK REVIEW: AGATHA CHRISTIE’S POIROTS IN WORD AND PICTURE: STRATEGIES IN SCREEN ADAPTATIONS OF POIROT HISTORIES FROM THE VIEWPOINT OF TRANSLATION STUDIES
Antony Hoyte-West.......................................................... 195
PREFACE

The first issue of volume 12 of *Studies in Linguistics, Culture, and FLT* for 2024 covers various topics related to the fields of linguistics, methodology, cultural studies, literature, translation studies and last but not least there are also two book reviews.

The first two articles in the journal are in the field of FLT. "How do teachers perceive translanguaging? Teachers’ perceptions about translanguaging practices in the EFL classroom" by Tuntun Sinaga and Gede Eka Putrawan deals with the question of EFL pedagogy and the implications translanguaging carries with its use. The answers to the posed questions are ambivalent and contradictory as there are teachers in Indonesia who are against these practices and insist on monolingual instruction.

The next paper is by Kamila Ammour and is titled “Multilingual practices of Algerian EFL learners in digital environments: A functional approach”. The interrelation between the teaching of a foreign language and the new digital technologies is put to the fore. Here again, emphasis is put on teachers’ reactions expressed in the data collection survey by indicating the transfer of face-to-face communication skills to virtual contexts, thus adopting English within digital learning settings.

“Paratextual reframing of visual elements in Al Jazeera’s coverage of the 2022 conflict between Russia and Ukraine” presented by Karina AlOteibi, Ahmad S Haider, and Hadeel AlSaed analyses the visual elements in some English articles on the Russia-Ukraine war in comparison with their Arabic equivalents. Surprisingly enough, the findings show that “Al Jazeera occasionally produces various, varied, and incongruent interpretations of the narrative” which may distort and even change the whole idea of the presented story.

Again, with a focus on translation, Gökçen Hastürkoğlu provides a study on the allographic notes in the Turkish translation of the ecological work *Silent Spring*, thus raising awareness about some environmental issues. The analysis of the translated version of the book has shown that the translator has decided to use a lot more paratextual elements, explaining even terminology that is considered familiar to the general public.

Yet another paper dwells upon translation issues, this time commenting on various options for subtitling English movie lyrics into Arabic. The authors Sundus Hassan and Ahmad S Haider touch upon the difficulties and the complexities of subtitling as regards content and form and the constraints that are imposed on the narrative as an audio-visual mode.
The translation of metaphors is the object of attention in “Analysis of the interface between language competence and conceptual metaphor in translation studies” by Ivaylo Dagnev and Zlatka Chervenkova. The researchers explore the interrelation between language competence requirements and conceptual metaphor studies. It turns out that metaphorical competence is of crucial importance for a successful translation. The results are based on a survey of an article from the Economist translated by 3 groups (2 non-professional and 1 professional) with the help of the Metaphor Identification Procedure proposed by the Pragglejaz Group in 2007.

“Could marriage be a glorified transactional relationship? A cognitive blending approach to analogies of marriage in Dholuo” is the title of a study by George Ouma Ogal, Vicky Khasandi-Telewa and Evelyne Mahero. It elaborates on the issues of how cultural resources and experiences influence the conceptualization of marriage in Dholuo by applying the Conceptual Integration Theory as a point of orientation. The findings were conducted on the basis of 66 analogies, thus concluding that conceptual mental spaces provide a model for interpreting marriage as an “abstract concept”.

The next three articles are related to literature studies.

Küğu Tekin’s paper “Power and love versus death: ‘Death constant beyond love’” by Gabriel García Márquez” deals with the philosophy and literary aesthetics of Gabriel García Márquez’s political satire expressed in different ways in the discussed short story. Issues such as transience of life, mortality, ambition for power and corruption are presented and analysed in the story.

“Space in William Shakespeare’s The Tragedy of Hamlet, Prince of Denmark” by Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu and Daniela Anisiei dwells upon the influence of space on different characters and upon the power and ability of those characters to change these spaces. Binary oppositions such as private vs. public, natural vs. artificial/ unnatural, order vs. disorder are discussed in relation to the links between spaces and characters’ personalities.

Silvana Neshkovska with her “Anglicisms in the Macedonian political discourse: A serious threat or a welcome addition” provokes linguists with the widespread use of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse as is the case with most languages. As she wonders “the question that arises is whether the general public endorses or condemns such a linguistic strategy”. A questionnaire that is provided for respondents of all ages and educational levels tries to give an answer to their sensitivity of that issue as for the purity of Macedonian as their mother tongue.
Finally, the journal contains 2 book reviews.

One of them by Veronica-Loredana Balan on *A Topography plagued by marginality in Victorian novels* by Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu problematizes the issue of gendered stereotypes as regards marginality and otherness of individuals in 19th century Victorian novels especially in cases in which these people were trying to climb the social ladder or to retain their newly achieved social position. Traditional roles and moral values are also touched upon as well as some binary oppositions such as “private vs. public, nature vs. culture, surface vs. depth, appearance vs. reality, man vs. woman, hunters vs. hunted, free vs. confined, possessors vs. possessed”. All of these questions are related to a period in which society was exposed to a number of political, scientific and social changes.

The other book review is by Antony Hoyte-West on *Agatha Christie’s Poirots in word and picture: Strategies in screen adaptations of Poirot histories from the viewpoint of translation studies* by Lucyna Harmon. The author presents a picture of over 70 television and cinematic versions of Agatha Christie’s works from the perspective of the Polish literary and translation studies scholar Lucyna Harmon. The different strategies and techniques applied in the filmed adaptations are interpreted with the help of a thorough taxonomy Harmon herself has invented. Harmon uses a content-based analysis and compares the original text to the translated adaptations commenting on their being either faithful or unfaithful as to the way Poirot and some other characters are presented.
HOW DO TEACHERS PERCEIVE TRANSLANGUAGING? 
TEACHERS’ PERCEPTIONS ABOUT TRANSLANGUAGING 
PRACTICES IN THE EFL CLASSROOM¹

Tuntun Sinaga¹, Gede Eka Putrawan²
¹,²Universitas Lampung (Bandar Lampung, Indonesia)

Abstract: The study of translanguaging as pedagogy, which challenges the monolingual approach to language education policy, has become an important aspect of investigation in recent years. However, translanguaging is challenged by recent data showing that teachers have ambivalent feelings and attitudes towards translanguaging practices and the evidence on teachers’ perceptions of the pedagogical approach in EFL teaching contexts in Indonesia is currently inconclusive. Therefore, our purpose was to describe how EFL teachers perceive translanguaging as pedagogy in the EFL classroom, which was conducted through a descriptive/interpretative approach. A questionnaire was used to collect data which were analyzed through both quantitative and qualitative methods of analysis. The findings indicate that teachers appear to have ambivalent perceptions of translanguaging. Some hold the view that EFL should be taught monolingually, while the others accept translanguaging practices. However, those who have a negative perception of translanguaging also see that the pedagogical approach is important in their EFL classes. The limitations and implications of the study’s findings for EFL education in Indonesia are also discussed.

Keywords: pedagogy, English as a foreign language, translanguaging, classroom, teachers’ perspective

About the author: Tuntun Sinaga is an associate Professor in the Department of Language and Arts Education at Universitas Lampung (Bandar Lampung, Indonesia, 35145). His research interests include culture in ELT and bi/multilingualism in ELT.

e-mail: tuntun.sinaga@fkip.unila.ac.id; ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3716-3765

About the author: Gede Eka Putrawan is a lecturer at the Department of Language Education and Arts at Universitas Lampung in Indonesia. His research interests include translation, translation and ELT, translanguaging, and language maintenance.

e-mail: gputrawan08@fkip.unila.ac.id; ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7717-3634

Copyright © 2024 Tuntun Sinaga, Gede Eka Putrawan

Article history: Received: 4 April 2023; Reviewed: 1 July 2023; Revised: 31 January 2024; Accepted: 20 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024.

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.


¹. The authors would like to express their gratitude to all EFL teachers who participated in the present study. This work was supported by Institute for Research and Community Service, Lampung University [grant number 1440/UN.26.21/PN/2020].
Research in English Studies and FLT

Introduction

The study of translanguaging pedagogy, which has gained ground in bilingual and multilingual education in a short period of time (Cenoz & Gorter, 2017a), has become an important aspect of investigation in recent years. Translanguaging is a normal mode of communication in which bilingual individuals engage with each other “to make sense of their bilingual worlds” (García & Li Wei, 2014, p. 22). It refers to pedagogical practices in which bilingualism is used as resource for learning, rather than being perceived as something that needs to be solved (Garcia, 2012). The term translanguaging, which is the English equivalent of the Welsh term trawsieithu, was originally coined by Cen Williams (1994, 1996 as cited in García & Li Wei, 2014). Translanguaging originally referred to a pedagogical practice in which students were asked and allowed to use one language after the other repeatedly on purpose for receptive and productive purposes. For example, students were asked to read in English and write in Welsh and vice versa (Baker, 2011 as cited in García & Li Wei, 2014).

Translanguaging is not only about going from one language to another, like code-switching or “the shift between two languages in context” (García, 2011, p. 147), rather it suggests a basic principle that bilinguals possess a single linguistic repertoire from which they strategically select features in order to communicate effectively (Garcia, 2012). Therefore, translanguaging is different from code-switching since it does not simply switch in and out of two different monolingual codes, instead it integrates two languages in unity to achieve successful communication (Cahyani et al., 2018). Translanguaging focuses on bilinguals’ observable communicative practices rather than languages themselves (Garcia, 2011). In other words, this idea stresses the need to shift from understanding bilingualism as two separate languages to viewing them as fluid and versatile.

There is now much evidence to support the view that translanguaging is beneficial to education, particularly in English as a foreign language (EFL) teaching contexts (see, for example, Barahona, 2020; Escobar, 2019; Romanowski, 2019; Torres et al., 2020). However, translanguaging as pedagogy is challenged by recent data showing that teachers also have ambivalent feelings and attitudes towards translanguaging practices. Al-Bataineh and Gallagher (2018) found that future bilingual (Arabic/English) teachers’ attitudes toward translanguaging are inconsistent and ambivalent. Wang (2019) also found that teachers have an ambivalent attitude to language choice in the classroom. Some find it hard to provide a place for multilingualism in the classroom, while others accept translanguaging pedagogy enthusiastically. Vaish (2019) found that children with a ‘superdiversity’ of language backgrounds in schools, where along with her research team she implemented translanguaging pedagogy, have negative attitudes towards their teacher’s attempt to use their mother tongues. The
students had various linguistic backgrounds and the teacher was likely to be fluent only in one pair of languages, thus, using their home language in the classroom required the class to be divided into as many groups as there were languages in the class.

In Indonesia, where English is still a foreign language, for example, Ariatna (2016) stated that the Indonesian government had undertaken major reforms in English education through the adoption of communicative language teaching (CLT) as the national goal and the introduction of English as a subject in elementary schools because Quinn (1975 as cited in Ariatna, 2016) found that English language teaching in Indonesia had not been sufficiently successful. Moreover, Darjowidjojo (1996 as cited in Ariatna, 2016, p. 5) argued that high school graduates in Indonesia were “not able to comprehend even simple texts written in English, let alone use the language orally for communicative purposes.” In other words, the teaching approach which put much emphasis on monolingual pedagogy was still prevalent in Indonesia even though major constraints existed such as teacher expertise, student participation, class size, limited teaching time, a grammar-based syllabus combined with a non-communicative exam (Ariatna, 2016). Therefore, Nagy (2018) argued that using languages shared by both students and teacher could encourage students to make use of their full linguistic potential through a well-planned and well-designed learning activity within the EFL classroom. Moreover, as stated by Stathopoulou (2016), in today’s multilingual world individuals were expected to be equipped with multiple intercultural tools such as sociolinguistic sensitivity, mediation and negotiation skills, as well as cultural and linguistic awareness in order to be successful in life. Escobar (2019) argued that translanguaging had the ability to bridge the gap between teachers and students, content and language, as well as school and community.

Based on the arguments above, the evidence suggests that the data on translanguaging within EFL teaching in Indonesia are currently inconclusive. Therefore, our purpose was to describe how EFL teachers perceive translanguaging as pedagogy in their EFL classes.

**Literature review**

*Translanguaging as pedagogy*

Today, the term ‘translanguaging’ is used in different ways, but its original meaning as a pedagogical strategy with “the planned alternation of input and output” as it emerged in the Welsh context remains the same (Cenoz & Gorter, 2017a, p. 3). However, scholars have also extended the term from classroom contexts (“classroom translanguaging”) to different contexts (“universal translanguaging” and “neurolinguistic translanguaging”) (Lewis et al., 2012, p.
The term translanguaging itself suggests a basic principle that bilinguals have a single linguistic repertoire from which they strategically make a selection of features to communicate successfully (Garcia, 2012). To put it simply, translanguaging refers to bilinguals’ language practices to make teaching and learning more successful; in this sense, their bilingualism is used as a resource (Garcia, 2012).

English as medium of instruction, which higher education institutions relied on in South Africa, led to protest movements that emphasized monolingual tradition as a form of decolonization of the universities within the country. Through translanguaging this issue was addressed. Translanguaging as pedagogy could give university students freedom from social injustice through English monolingualism and they positively responded to translanguaging practices (Hurst & Mona, 2017). Translanguaging pedagogy in schools, which was investigated by Menken & Sánchez’ (2019) was not simply a teaching approach, it was “emblematic of a larger ideological stance that has proven transformative to schools as a whole” (p. 761). They further emphasized that translanguaging pedagogy had disrupted monolingual approaches both in theoretical and practical ways (Menken & Sánchez, 2019). Translanguaging offered more equitable and empowering language learning opportunities to bilingual students and through the pedagogy they showed great improvement to their metalinguistic awareness, bilingual identities awareness (García-Mateus & Palmer, 2017), and developed their multilingual identities (Cenoz & Gorter, 2017b).

In secondary schools in Poland, where students were mostly multilingual, teachers came to the conclusion that translanguaging practices had an impact on students’ performance and they acquired the content delivered by teachers more rapidly, which ultimately led to development of linguistic proficiency (Romanowski, 2019). Translanguaging through dynamic language integration was a linguistically responsive pedagogical approach that helped bilinguals acquire knowledge in science lessons (Infante & Licona, 2018). Teachers in Italy, Austria, and Great Britain believed that prior language knowledge played a crucial role in the learning process. It was also advisable to provide teachers with specific training on how to derive benefit from language interactions and how to value their students’ home language so that they had the competence to effectively teach multilingual students (De Angelis, 2011).

**Teachers’ perceptions about translanguaging in the EFL classroom**

Translanguaging, which is a crucial tool for communication, proved to be essential to English language teaching (Kampittayakul, 2018). Teachers’ translanguaging practices helped students improve their understanding of what teachers were saying, which resulted in their ability to participate in the class
Turkish EFL teachers had fairly ambivalent feelings towards translanguaging in the EFL classroom. Most of them stated that the use of L1 (Turkish) helped students with a low level of language proficiency. However, less than half of them avoided the use of Turkish for class activities and explanation of problems which were not related to content. In some situations, they positively believed that translanguaging was of importance in their EFL classes; however, they found it hard to utilize the pedagogical approach due to their institutions’ policy and their students’, parents’ and colleagues’ expectations (Yuvayapan, 2019). In Norway, language teachers believed that multilingualism was a positive asset with great potential. They made use of Norwegian and English frequently when teaching L3. They also believed that different language interactions in the classroom helped students enhance their language learning, but this situation did not exist in their classroom practices (Haukås, 2016). Prospective bilingual teachers were reported as having inconsistent attitudes towards translanguaging with opposing views (Al-Bataineh & Gallagher, 2018).

Teachers and students also had conflicting opinions on translanguaging practices in EFL classes in Costa Rica. They believed translanguaging, resembling the grammar translation method, limited the development of their cognitive processes for their EFL acquisition. However, some believed that teachers’ and students’ L1 (Spanish) can be used in EFL classes under certain conditions and for specific purposes as well (Escobar & Dillard-Paltrineri, 2015). Indonesian and English were used in EFL classes for explaining grammatical rules, and increasing students’ motivation and encouragement. In addition, teachers also made use of their local language, Minang, to maintain the relationship between themselves and the students (Zainil, 2019). Another local language, Konjo, was used by EFL teachers in Indonesia through translanguaging in EFL classes. The teachers positively believed that translanguaging created effective communication in which students derived much benefit from the situation (Rahmawansyah, 2019). They perceived that translanguaging had a positive influence in the EFL classroom (Anwar et al., 2019). What is of great value was the willingness of both teachers and students to implement translanguaging practices and create translanguaging space accordingly, in order to achieve success in EFL education (Turnbull, 2018).

**Method**

This research is qualitative in nature using a descriptive/interpretative approach, which was “oriented to providing thorough descriptions and interpretations of social phenomena, including its meaning to those who experience it” (Tesch 1991, pp. 17-25 as cited in Dey, 2005, p. 2). The data were collected by using a questionnaire. The authors explained the aim of the study to participants under investigation in great detail and guaranteed anonymity and confidentiality. By
completing the questionnaire, they gave their consent to the use of the data for research purposes.

**Participants**

An online questionnaire was completed by twelve senior high school EFL teachers in Lampung, Indonesia. They were employed as teachers at different institutions, including both private and public high schools. The survey was randomly carried out over a period of one month, 10\textsuperscript{th} March – 8\textsuperscript{th} April 2020. The majority were female with only one male participant in the age range of 35 – 57 years old. They have been teaching EFL for 19.50 years on average, with a minimum of three and a maximum of thirty-two years of teaching experience.

**Instruments**

An online questionnaire was used to collect data in the current study. The questionnaire developed by Nambisan (2014) received a few modifications with twelve open-ended and four closed questions with six to nine sub-questions for each closed question. The questionnaire was delivered to and filled out by the participants electronically using a survey administration application, Google Forms. The questionnaire was used to investigate how EFL teachers perceived translanguaging practices in their classes. The questionnaire was pilot-tested to ensure that the instructions and statements in the questionnaire were clear, understandable and reasonable in length (Schleef, 2014). It was also aimed at assessing the design and appropriateness of the questionnaire to the participants and making sure that it could achieve the research purpose (McQuirk & O’Neill, 2016).

**Data analysis**

The collected data in this study were analyzed through both quantitative and qualitative data analysis. The former referred to the method by which the responses of participants were quantitatively analyzed in a straightforward and comprehensible manner to determine the proportion of participants who held positive or negative views regarding translanguaging, while the latter referred to identifying themes or patterns and conducting a classification procedure to subjectively interpret participants’ responses to 12 open-ended questions (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005).

**Findings and Discussion**

The main aim of the present study was to describe EFL teachers’ views concerning translanguaging as pedagogy in their classes.
At the beginning of the survey, the teachers were asked about their view on the benefit of L1 inclusion and the language of instruction in their classes. Most of them (83.3%) do not believe that L1 is beneficial in EFL classes and the rest (16.7%) have the opposite belief, with a total of 10 and 2 respondents respectively. By contrast, most of them (83.3%) state that they use both Indonesian and English in their EFL classes, only 2 (16.7%) of them state that they use English. On the one hand, they do not believe that L1 is beneficial, on the other hand, the majority of them use two languages, Indonesian and English, in their EFL classes. These two facts seem to support the previous findings that state teachers have ambivalent feelings towards translanguaging (Al-Bataineh & Gallagher, 2018), but they accept and use translanguaging practices in the classroom (Wang, 2019).

**Teachers’ observation on the students’ translanguaging practices for different purposes in their EFL classes**

Regarding their observation on their students’ translanguaging practices, their responses to the questions are presented in Table 1 as follows.

| How often do you observe or encourage your students to practice translanguaging ...? | Frequency |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| to discuss content or activities in small groups | Never | Not often | Somewhat often | Often | Very often |
| 1 (8.3%) | 5 (41.7%) | 4 (33.3%) | 0 (0%) | 2 (16.7%) |
| to provide assistance to peers during activities | 0 (0%) | 2 (16.7%) | 6 (50%) | 2 (16.7%) |
| to explain problems not related to content | 1 (8.3%) | 2 (16.7%) | 6 (50%) | 0 (0%) | 3 (25%) |
| to enable participation by low proficiency students | 0 (0%) | 1 (8.3%) | 9 (75%) | 0 (0%) | 2 (16.7%) |
| to respond to teacher’s questions | 0 (0%) | 6 (50%) | 4 (33.3%) | 2 (16.7%) | 0 (0%) |
| to ask permission | 6 (50%) | 3 (25%) | 2 (16.7%) | 1 (8.3%) | 0 (0%) |

Table 1 above gives information about teachers’ observations on the students’ translanguaging practices for different purposes. They somewhat often observe their students to practice translanguaging when enabling students with low proficiency to participate during the class (75%), followed by providing assistance to peers during activities and explaining a problem that is not related to content with a total of 50% and 50% respectively. Discussing content or activities in small groups and responding to teacher’s questions have an identical pattern,
33.3% and 33.3% respectively. Students’ translanguaging practice when they ask permission is never (50%) and almost never (25%) observed by the teachers. Discussing content in small groups, providing assistance to peers, explaining problems not related to content, and enabling students with low proficiency are activities that are done using L1 which are often and very often observed by the teachers. This finding indicates that teachers allow their students to practice translanguaging in their EFL classroom, allowing them to use all their languages for effective communication. The finding is also reinforced by their statements. Here are the excerpts of the statements (translation and emphasis added).

When they need to clarify theory or concept that might lead to misunderstanding (Teacher 1)

When they are asked to understand command or suggestions (Teacher 10)

When they haven’t found appropriate vocabulary (Teacher 11)

When they don’t understand the meaning of a word, I allow them to consult their bilingual dictionary (Teacher 3)

To well comprehend my instructions, I speak in English first, then I provide them with the Indonesian version as well (Teacher 12)

When I give them an assignment, they discuss the instruction on how to work on the assignment with their classmates (Teacher 6)

When they have to explain the meaning of an utterance that is less accurate (Teacher 2)

These facts suggest that teachers have understanding of translanguaging practices by their students in EFL classes. These findings are in line with Rasman’s (2018) findings that state that L1 does not stop students from learning EFL. Translanguaging practices in the classroom help them learn EFL through learner-learner interactions. In other words, the teachers provide translanguaging space for their students.

Teachers’ beliefs about the importance of students’ translanguaging practices in classroom contexts

Talking about the importance of translanguaging practices, the teachers’ responses to the questions on the belief about students’ translanguaging practices in the EFL classroom within different contexts are presented in Table 2 as follows.
Table 2. Teachers’ belief about the importance of students’ translanguaging practices in the classroom contexts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How important do you believe it is for students to practice translanguaging ...?</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to discuss content or activities in small groups</td>
<td>6 (50%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to provide assistance to peers during activities</td>
<td>4 (33.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to brainstorm during class activities</td>
<td>5 (41.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to explain problems not related to content</td>
<td>5 (41.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to enable participation by low proficiency students</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to respond to teacher’s questions</td>
<td>5 (41.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to ask permission</td>
<td>8 (66.7%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 above shows the teachers’ beliefs about the importance of students’ translanguaging practices in their classes. It is apparent that the trend of their responses falls into two categories, not important and important. Most teachers believe that translanguaging to enable participation by low proficiency students is important (91.7%). Similarly, the majority believe that students’ translanguaging practices when providing assistance to peers is important for students (66.7%). Students’ translanguaging practices for brainstorming during class activities, explaining problems not related to content, and responding to teacher’s questions have a similar trend, which is believed to be important by teachers, rising to 58.3% of each. Only half of the respondents believe that discussing content in small groups through translanguaging practices is important (50%). By contrast, most teachers do not believe that it is important for students to practice translanguaging when asking permission (66.7%). The teachers also made some statements to confirm the findings in Table 2 above. Here are the excerpts of their responses (translation and emphasis added).

Translanguaging practice through L1 inclusion is important for students when they have to make confirmation (Teacher 1)

When students face difficulties in understanding a topic. When they want to review or conclude a topic. It is to convince themselves that they have got the right understanding related to the topic delivered (Teacher 7)

Translanguaging and L1 are important for students to help them build characters (Teacher 9)

This finding indicates that the teachers under investigation have a positive belief about translanguaging practices in the EFL classroom. It is apparent that they believe translanguaging practices through the use of L1 in EFL classes help their students learn English, which is in line with Lasabaster (2013).
Frequency of teachers’ translanguaging practices in classroom contexts

The teachers’ responses to the frequency of their own translanguaging practices in their EFL classes for different situations are shown in Table 3 below.

Table 3. The frequency of teachers’ translanguaging practices for different situations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How often do you practice translanguaging...?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Never</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to explain concepts</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to describe vocabulary</td>
<td>2 (16.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to give directions</td>
<td>3 (25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for classroom management</td>
<td>4 (33.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to give feedback to students</td>
<td>2 (16.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to praise students</td>
<td>9 (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to build bonds with students</td>
<td>1 (8.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to quickly clarify during activities</td>
<td>2 (16.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to help low proficiency students</td>
<td>1 (8.3%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 above illustrates the frequency of teachers’ translanguaging practices for different situations. It shows that most of the teachers somewhat often explain concepts through translanguaging practices (75%) and help students with low English proficiency (41.7%). The other situations in which teachers somewhat often practice translanguaging have a similar pattern, ranging from 8.3% - 33.3%. Most of the teachers never praise their students using their students’ home language (75%). The other aspects in which teachers never use their home language also have a similar pattern, ranging from 0% - 33.3%. Teachers also often (25%) help students with low English proficiency using their home language, followed by the situations in which they often explain concepts (16.7%) and quickly clarify during activities (16.7%). Teachers often describe vocabulary, give directions, manage the class, give feedback to their students, and build bonds with students, which is 8.3% in each case. They very often help their students with low English proficiency using a home language of their students (16.7%) and build bonds with their students (8.3%). The data in Table 3 above are also supported by the teachers’ arguments as follows.

The students’ home language is used in a situation when I need to repeat instructions (Teacher 1)
I translanguage (starting to use my students’ home language) when they get lost after I check their comprehension (Teacher 6)

I practice translanguaging to check if students have understood my explanation or not (Teacher 8)

Translanguaging through use of students’ home language is used to give advice to students. It is to make them understand well my explanation (Teacher 3)

When making an announcement, I use my students’ home language. For example, I have to tell them about the upcoming test/quiz (when, what topic, how, what I expect). I also use their home language when announcing information from the school management to my students (Teacher 4)

This finding suggests that teachers utilize their students’ home language to help them learn EFL. The majority of them occasionally practice translanguaging in their classes, most often for helping students with low proficiency, explaining concepts, quickly clarifying during class activities, and describing vocabulary. This is in line with Anderson and Lightfoot (2018) who state that it is only a tiny minority of teachers who actively provide translanguaging space during language activities in the classroom. Furthermore, if judiciously used, students’ home language is a valuable resource (Bruen & Kelly, 2014) that teachers somewhat often make use of in their EFL classes. Teachers who practice translanguaging during their EFL classes can provide them with more opportunities to learn the language (Copland & Yonetsugi, 2016). This is also similar to Zainil’s (2019) finding that teachers alternate between Indonesian and English to explain concepts such as grammatical rules.

The importance of teachers’ translanguaging practices in classroom contexts

The teachers’ responses to the importance of teachers’ translanguaging practices in different situations are presented in Table 4 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How important is it for teachers to practice translanguaging ...?</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>to explain concepts</td>
<td>Not important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to describe vocabulary</td>
<td>3 (25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to give directions</td>
<td>4 (33.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for classroom management</td>
<td>6 (50%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to give feedback to students</td>
<td>6 (50%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to praise students</td>
<td>10 (83.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to build bonds with students</td>
<td>3 (25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to quickly clarify during activities</td>
<td>3 (25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to help low proficiency students</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4 above gives facts about the importance of translanguaging practices for teachers in their EFL classes. Most of them state that it is important to practice translanguaging when explaining concepts, describing vocabulary, giving feedback to students, and quickly clarifying during activities, 66.7% in each case. When praising students, translanguaging is not important to practice (83.3%), followed by giving directions and classroom management (50% and 50% in each case). The other activities for which it is not important for teachers to practice translanguaging have a similar pattern, ranging from 25% - 33.3%.

The scenarios in Table 4 in which most teachers believe translanguaging plays an important role in EFL teaching contexts are supported by their statements in the following excerpts.

When students are really in a confused state of what to say in English (Teacher 11)

It is beneficial and important for students when I try to explain English verb tenses, to make comparisons between Indonesian and English (Teacher 2)

It is beneficial for students when they still find it difficult to understand a lesson (Teacher 5)

We practice translanguaging when students get a problem to understand English. Therefore, a teacher needs to translate English into students’ home language to make them understand (Teacher 7)

A teacher wants to be close to students. Yes, through their first/home language (Teacher 10)

When I give advice to students, I speak not in English (Teacher 3)

Indonesian or L1 is very beneficial for English learning to establish a relationship or build bonds, for example their home language is used for telling jokes. Most of students find it hard to get the message when teachers tell jokes in English (Teacher 4)

It is important and beneficial when a teacher explains a new difficult concept (Teachers 9, 10)

It is beneficial when used to refer to something that requires verification (Teacher 6)

In a situation when the class is dominated by low proficiency students, the use of Indonesian in my EFL classes is beneficial (Teacher 12)

The finding, in which translanguaging is used to explain concepts is in line with Zainil’s (2019) finding. Translanguaging used to verify and check students’ comprehension is in line with Zein’s (2018) findings. The teacher’s statement that students’ first/home language is used in EFL classes under certain conditions when the class is dominated by students with low English proficiency resonates with Escobar and Dillard-Paltrineri’s (2015) findings.
In addition, they state that it is also important to practice translanguaging to motivate students and check their comprehension. Here are the excerpts of their responses (translation and emphasis added).

When my students look lazy in the classroom, it is important to practice translanguaging to courage them (Teacher 10)

Students’ home language plays an important role to motivate my students (Teacher 5)

It is used to check if students have understood or not about the content I have delivered (Teacher 8)

The statistics above are in line with Zainil’s (2019) finding that translanguaging is used to motivate and encourage students. Translanguaging is also used to check if students have understood the content delivered by teachers, which is similar to Zein’s (2018) finding.

**Teachers’ general perceptions about translanguaging practices in their EFL classes**

When responding to the final question about their general perceptions about the translanguaging practices in their EFL classes, they have a variety of beliefs. They state that students’ first/home language should not be used in the EFL classroom and the frequency of language other than English use should be taken into account. Below are excerpts of their responses (translation and emphasis added) to their general perceptions about the translanguaging practices in their EFL classes.

Teachers play a very important role in EFL classrooms. If you want your students to improve their English, please stop using L1 in an easy conversation (Teacher 10)

In my opinion, when we are in English classrooms, we need to use English to make it a habit. If students use their L1, they will find it hard to speak English well. This is actually a mainstream issue. Students have been learning English since they were in elementary school, but they cannot speak English well because they have never practiced English during the class (Teacher 7)

As an English teacher, it is necessary to use English so that students can get a chance to listen, speak, read, and write in English. A teacher should be a model for them. A teacher should provide much input to students. Either intentionally or not, they will imitate it. It is to make them internalize English and motivate them to use English both inside and outside of classrooms. If they are allowed to use their L1, it will make them afraid of using English, afraid of making mistakes (Teacher 8)

The frequency of use should be 40% for L1 and 60% for English (Teacher 1)
L1 use is important, but the portion should be decreased based on levels of students (Teacher 2)

Somehow, mixed language (Indonesian and English) use in EFL classrooms for low proficiency students can give them confidence in learning and participating in class discussions (Teacher 4)

L1 use in EFL classrooms is just fine as long as it is accompanied by the use of English. Thus, students can learn from the two languages (Teacher 5)

L1 is necessary to help students understand cases in English classrooms (Teacher 9)

Their responses suggest that some of them have a negative perception of translanguaging practices which involve L1 in the EFL classroom and others accept the pedagogical practices. In other words, they have two contrasting views on translanguaging in EFL teaching contexts in the classroom. This is in line with Zein’s (2018) finding that some teachers support translanguaging practices, and others support the monolingual approach for EFL teaching. However, it is apparent that those who hold the opposing view on translanguaging see that this pedagogical approach is important and still use L1 in their EFL classes. This is also in line with Al-Bataineh & Gallagher’s (2018) finding that states that bilingual teachers’ attitudes toward translanguaging practices are inconsistent, with two opposing views. Our finding is also the same as Wang’s (2019) finding that teachers have ambivalent attitudes to language choice in their language classes.

This finding also indicates that they believe that the EFL teaching and learning process should result in native-like proficiency which is still influenced by the so-called monolingual bias (Firth & Wagner, 2007; May, 2014 as cited in Rasman, 2018). Rasman further adds that it is unnecessary and impossible to achieve (Rasman, 2018) because multilingualism and human communication has now become more complex (Kramsch & Hua, 2016). The goal of English language learning, therefore, is to become a second language user, not a native speaker. In its literal meaning, it is not possible for a second language user to become a native speaker because by definition someone cannot be a native speaker of any language other than their first language (Cook, 2007).

**Conclusion**

Teachers who participated in this study appear to have ambivalent perceptions of translanguaging. They have contrasting views on translanguaging as pedagogy in the EFL classroom. Some hold the view that EFL should be taught monolingually, while the others accept translanguaging practices. However, those who have a negative perception of translanguaging also see that the pedagogical approach is important in their EFL classes. This implies that they still believe in the traditionally defined language teaching approach, monolingual
pedagogy. However, they actually do not fully apply the monolingual approach (Brevik & Rindal, 2020). This situation, as stated by Zein (2018), represents a transition from the monolingual pedagogy, which discourages the use of L1, to translangaging pedagogy, which intentionally uses and values L1s. Therefore, the assumption that states monolingualism is normal and possibly more advantageous is a set of beliefs that translanguaging rejects (Makalela, 2016 as cited in Seals et al., 2020).

The findings of this study have some implications for EFL teaching and learning. Since translanguaging is still in its infancy with a promising future (Cenoz & Gorter, 2017b), it is of great importance to acknowledge translanguaging, which is an effective tool for multiple pedagogical practices in multilingual contexts (Carstens, 2016), especially in teacher training (Zein, 2018) to make teachers or prospective teachers more aware of translangaging. They can be professionally trained on how to use multilingual approaches and practices for educational purposes in language teaching contexts (Gkaintartzi et al., 2019). They should have the same mindset that multiple language use through translanguaging practices is allowed, to encourage students to make use of their full linguistic potential (Nagy, 2018).

However, this study is not without its limitations. Since the limited number of participants taking part in this study and the empirical data as evidence in this context are inadequate, we have made a careful assumption about the phenomenon under investigation. In other words, we have interpreted the findings as teachers’ perceptions of translanguaging practices in their EFL classes. Thus, we cannot generalize about our findings as conclusive evidence in the whole country, but we have shed light on a somewhat preliminary picture of translanguaging in our research context. Therefore, to understand this phenomenon in EFL classrooms in the Indonesian context more deeply, we stress the necessity of conducting further research on the issue under discussion through the observation of naturally-occurring translanguaging practices in EFL classrooms with a larger number of teachers and students participating. More advanced qualitative and quantitative data analyses, such as structural equation modeling and factor analysis, need to be taken into account by future researchers. In so doing, we would be able to provide more precise findings and reliable conclusions with an in-depth understanding of this issue in EFL classroom contexts in Indonesia that could be used as a foundation to make a major contribution to EFL education.
References


Cook, V. (2007). The Goals of ELT: Reproducing native-speakers or promoting multicompetence among second language users? In J. Cummins & C. Davison (Eds.),


MULTILINGUAL PRACTICES OF ALGERIAN EFL LEARNERS IN DIGITAL ENVIRONMENTS: A FUNCTIONAL APPROACH

Kamila Ammour
Mouloud Mammeri University of Tizi-Ouzou, Algeria

Abstract: The recent academic discourse has been prominently centred on the scrutiny of the intricate relationship between language and emerging technologies. In this regard, the present study sets out to explore the multilingual practices of Algerian EFL learners in digital environments, taking students at Mouloud Mammeri University of Tizi-Ouzou as a case in point. The study targets three main objectives. First, it attempts to scrutinise the participants’ use of different languages to fulfil different communicative functions. Second, it seeks to bring to light their motives for making choices among their linguistic repertoire. Third, it delves into the utilization of English as a foreign language within virtual environments. This case study draws on a theoretical framework of the sociology of language choice from a functional specialisation perspective (Jacobson, 1960; Halliday et al., 1964; Appel & Muysken, 2005). To this end, the mixed-methods research is adopted. A questionnaire was designed to collect data, which were analysed using descriptive statistical techniques and interpretive analysis. Findings highlight participants’ subconscious language choice across different situations, indicating the transfer of their face-to-face communication skills to virtual contexts. Additionally, the findings suggest that social media platforms have a beneficial effect on the adoption of English within digital learning settings.

Keywords: Algerian EFL learners, Digital Learning Environment, Functions of language, Multilingualism, Sociology of language choice.

About the author: Dr Kamila Ammour is a senior lecturer at the department of English, Mouloud Mammeri University of Tizi-Ouzou. She holds a PhD in English Language with a specialisation in English Language Teaching. Her teaching areas include research methodology, writing academic research, general linguistics, applied linguistics, sociolinguistics, psycholinguistics and ELT. She is now investigating issues pertaining to English Language Teaching & learning, Web Didactics, Sociocultural Approach to Literacy, and Critical Discourse Analysis.

e-mail: kamila.ammour@ummto.dz; ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7100-7291

Copyright © 2024 Kamila Ammour

Article history: Received: 16 December 2023; Reviewed: 21 February 2024; Revised: 4 March 2024; Accepted: 18 March 2024; Published: 15 April 2024.

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Introduction

In Algeria, like many communities in the world, multilingualism is a norm rather than an exception. Indeed, a glance at the Algerian historical background helps to understand the coexistence of several languages in the country. Those languages can be categorised into three groups: mother tongues, national languages, and foreign languages. Varieties of Berber and Algerian Arabic are the mother tongues spoken in different parts of the country. The classical Arabic and Berber are the two national languages as stated in the Algerian constitution. As far as foreign languages are concerned, French has a particular position in the Algerian linguistic repertoire as it has been described by Kateb Yacine as “butin de guerre” [the spoils of war]. In addition to French, English is increasingly gaining ground in Algeria as a second foreign language.

Nowadays, Virtual communication becomes an integrated component of our daily life. According to Duggan and Brenner (2013), two-thirds of internet users indulge into virtual communication through social networks and virtual communities. Algerian EFL students, like their peers worldwide, are increasingly engaging on social media platforms to exchange and share information. Being multilingual, Algerian EFL students face a double challenge when communicating online. The first aspect concerns the enhancement of online communication skills, while the second pertains to the selection of language within EFL communities during various communicative situations.

Exploring the link between multilingualism and the social networking sites is likely to lead to a better understanding of students’ digital literacy skills and would provide insights into the impact of new technologies on the Algerian EFL students’ academic achievement. In this regard, the overall aim of the study is to investigate the use, the choice as well as the reasons behind the selection of one language among several others to express different communicative functions in multilingual digital context. Accordingly, the research questions developed for the study are:

1. How do Algerian EFL students use their multilingual linguistic repertoire in virtual settings?

2. What are the reasons behind the participants’ conscious or subconscious choice of languages in online settings?

3. How do Algerian EFL students perceive the use of English in virtual communication?
Review of the Literature

Multilingualism in Algeria

During the last decades, much scholarly attention has been oriented towards the study of multilingualism. The latter is an interdisciplinary phenomenon that can be analysed from different perspectives. To serve the purposes of the present study, two definitions of the concept are provided from an individual and a social perspective. According to Li (2008, p. 4) a multilingual individual can “communicate in more than one language, be it active (through speaking and writing) or passive (through listening and reading)”. As regards societal multilingualism, it refers to the use of different languages within a group or a social community. Its scope is wider as it embraces issues related to language policies, the status of language users in society, etc. (Edwards, 2007).

As far as the Algerian context is concerned, Algeria is officially a bilingual country, but de facto multilingual. Indeed, Algeria was the target of a variety of invasions in its history leading to the coexistence of many language varieties. Montagnon (1998, p. 21) asserts that Berber is the oldest language in the Maghreb region, used by the indigenous and most ancient population of Algeria. With the Arab conquests in the seventh century, much of the Algerian population was converted to Islam, despite resistance from some Berber groups, particularly in regions like Aures and Kabylia, where Berber remains the primary language for most individuals (Ammour, 2020, p. 78).

The Algerian constitution of 1963 designated Modern Standard Arabic, also known as Classical Arabic, as the official language. In April 2002, Berber was granted recognition as a ‘National language’, seen as pivotal to Algerian identity alongside Classical Arabic and Islam. Subsequently, in 2016, Tamazight was elevated to the status of a national and official language, rendering Algeria officially bilingual according to its constitution. However, it is important to note that Classical Arabic predominates in formal contexts, while Berber is predominantly utilized within certain educational spheres. In their day-to-day interactions, Algerians utilize a range of vernacular languages, including various Berber dialects (such as Kabyle, Chaoui, etc.), Algerian Arabic with its diverse accents, as well as French and English.

Multilingual Practices

In multilingual settings, mixing two or more languages is becoming a norm. According to Hudson (1996), code-switching is an immediate consequence of multilingualism. Multilingual speakers switch through different languages or different varieties or dialects of the same language within the same conversation not due to a lack of knowledge but to perform different communicative functions.
Trudgill (2002, p.81) states that “the same speaker uses different linguistic varieties in different situations and for different purposes.”

Code mixing or code switching has been perceived and defined differently by different scholars. From a linguistic standpoint, scholars like Halliday (1978), Poplack (1980) and Romaine (1989) describe code switching according to the syntactic or morphological mixtures taking place within the conversation. Two main types are depicted. The first type relates to inter-sentential code switching. A speaker starts a sentence in one language, then utters another sentence in another language or dialect. The switch takes place at the sentence or clause boundaries. The second type of code switching is best illustrated in Poplack’s research title “Sometimes I’ll start a sentence in English y termino en español”. This type is called intra-sentential code switching; it occurs within the clause or the sentence. Halliday (1978, p.65) defines this type as “a process within the individual: the speaker moves from one code to another and back, more or less rapidly in the course of a single sentence”.

From a social standpoint, scholars (Gumperz, 1982; Hudson, 1996) categorise code switching into ‘situational’ and ‘conversational’, which is also known as ‘metaphorical’. The former is determined by the social situation. Put differently, different languages or different language varieties are employed according to the setting (home, school, work), the social activity (public speaking, formal negotiations, special ceremonials, verbal games, etc.) or the audience (friends, family members, strangers, social inferiors, government officials, etc.). This type of code switching is more apparent in diglossic situations (Blom & Gumperz, 1972 in Gumperz, 1982, p. 60). In this context, Hudson (1996, p.52) states: “language choice depends on the circumstances and thus the choice is controlled by social rules which members of the community learn from their total linguistic knowledge.”

Conversational or metaphorical code switching relates to a change in language without any change in the sociolinguistic situation. The reason of shift is more semantic-oriented. Gumperz (1982, p.162) explains this type as follows

The language switch relates here to particular kinds of topics or subject matters rather than to change in social situation. The semantic effect of metaphorical switching depends on the existence of regular relationships between variables and social situation of the type just discussed. The context in which one of a set of alternates is regularly used becomes parts of its meaning, so that when this form is then employed in a context where it is normal, it brings in some of the flavor of this original setting.

Conversational code switching is generally used as a communication strategy to achieve specific communicative functions.

In EFL contexts, code switching is perceived as “the use of a first or third language within a stream of speech in the second language” (Brown, 2007,
Numerous studies documented in the literature have endeavored to examine code switching in EFL classrooms, primarily focusing on pedagogical aspects. These investigations analyze various facets such as teachers’ discourse (e.g., Rabab’ah & Al-Yasin, 2017), the incorporation of the mother tongue in classroom interactions, or the effects of code switching as a teaching strategy on learners’ academic performance (e.g., Kumar et al., 2021).

In contrast to previous research, this study aims to investigate EFL learners’ utilization of multiple languages in diverse online communication contexts. The primary objective is to explore code switching as a multilingual practice and communication strategy among Algerian EFL students engaged in virtual interactions.

**Language Choice: A Functional Approach**

The present study draws upon an analytical framework related to the sociology of language choice from a functional specialisation perspective. At the core of the framework lies the idea that language use involves various functions of the language system. It integrates deterministic and person-oriented approaches to language choice within the same framework.

The functioning of languages in bilingual and multilingual settings, requires a particular set of norms for the speakers, and a functional specialization of the languages involved. Following the functional framework of Jakobson (1960) and Halliday et al. (1964), Appel and Muysken (2005) suggested a model to explain the switching between languages on the basis of the choice of a given language. Six functions are distinguished.

Within the domain of linguistic functions, language serves various fundamental roles. The Referential Function primarily involves the transmission of knowledge through language, often considered the cornerstone of language use (Appel & Muysken, 2005, p. 29). In multilingual contexts, specific subjects may be more appropriately discussed in particular languages. The Directive Function, on the other hand, is focused on influencing the behavior and actions of others and takes various forms, directly engaging the listener in interactions. It utilizes customary greetings, modes of address, questions, formal expressions, imperatives, and exclamations to establish and facilitate interaction among participants. The Expressive Function, on the other hand, is a means for speakers to convey their emotions and unique identities, although it may present challenges for monolingual individuals (Appel & Muysken, 2005, p. 30). The Phatic Function is primarily employed for social purposes, such as initiating or concluding conversations, confirming the connection between sender and receiver, and designating the in-group within the communication context. It relies on conventionalized openings, closings, and turn-taking signals to establish and maintain a communication channel. The Metalinguistic Function
uses language to reveal the speaker’s perspectives and awareness of linguistic conventions. Finally, the Poetic Function focuses on the creative and playful aspects of language, aiming to emphasize information through various forms of wordplay and linguistic creativity, making the use of language enjoyable (Appel & Muysken, 2005, p. 30).

To explain the relationship between different functions of language and language choice, Appel and Muysken (2005, p. 30) state that “different languages may fulfil different functions in the lives of bilingual speakers, and in bilingual conversations a choice for one particular language may signal the primary functions appealed to at that moment”.

**Methods**

**Data Collection Procedure**

This empirical study was carried out with 180 students from Mouloud Mammeri university of Tizi-Ouzou during the academic year 2021-2022. The study involved Master students enrolled in the Department of English. Convenience sampling was employed as the sampling method, which is a form of nonprobability sampling where individuals from the target population who meet specific practical criteria are included for study purposes (Dörnyei, 2007). The criterion of selection was the participants’ participation in EFL chatting groups in social media.

In order to reach the maximum number of participants and ensure validity of the study, a questionnaire was designed as the most appropriate instrument. This research tool was used to yield two types of data: the students’ multilingual habits in online conversations as well as their perceptions and opinions about their different practices. Consisting of 7 closed-ended items, and 6 open-ended ones, the designed questionnaire is based on two models of research: quantitative and qualitative.

The questionnaire is divided into three main Sections. The first section consists of information about the respondents including their mother tongue(s), the foreign language(s) they speak, and their participation in online EFL chatting groups. The second section is devoted for the participants’ multilingual practices online to explore the languages they use to fulfil different communicative functions. In addition, some open-ended questions are asked to request details of the participants’ awareness and their motives for choosing a specific language for a specific situation. The last section is composed of two items aiming to get insights about the participants’ use of English in online conversations.
**Data Analysis Procedure**

To analyse the data collected from the questionnaires, it was important to start by categorising them into quantitative and qualitative data. Quantitative data were analysed by means of descriptive statistics to describe the frequencies and the means. As regards the qualitative data, they were interpreted by means of content analysis. Both types of data were interpreted on the basis of the theoretical framework. The findings as well as their interpretation are presented in the next section.

**Results and Discussion**

This empirical study was conducted to explore the way Algerian EFL students make use of their linguistic repertoire in online settings. As the main aim of any research is to give answers to research questions, the findings are grouped and discussed according to the issues raised at the outset of the research.

**Participants’ Profile**

In order to circumscribe the profile of the participants and ensure that they meet the criterion selected for the empirical study three questions were asked:

1. What is/ are your mother tongue(s)?
2. What is/are the foreign language(s) that you speak?
3. Are you a member of any group of EFL learners in social networks?

A common feature among all the participants is their foreign languages repertoire; all of them speak French and English. Regarding their mother tongues, they can be categorised into three categories as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Mother tongue (s)</th>
<th>Foreign Language (s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>73%</td>
<td>Berber</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19%</td>
<td>Algerian Arabic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8%</td>
<td>Berber &amp; Algerian Arabic</td>
<td>French and English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As regards the second question, all the participants participate in online conversations within EFL groups. Accordingly, all of them meet the criterion of selection to participate in the empirical study.
Online Multilingual Practices across Different Communicative Functions

In order to account for the online multilingual practices of the participants, 7 questions were asked. The first item of this section was:

What are the languages that you use to communicate online with EFL students?

In addition to their mother tongues, all the participants stated that they use different languages in online conversations including: French, English and Classical Arabic. This confirms the multilingual character of the Algerian society. Moreover, it seems that the Algerian EFL students transfer their linguistic abilities from real face-to-face communication to virtual contexts.

The next five items aim to exactly determine the targeted communicative functions of each language used online.

- Tick the communicative function(s) in which you use English online.
- Tick the communicative function(s) in which you use Berber online.
- Tick the communicative function(s) in which you use Algerian Arabic online.
- Tick the communicative function(s) in which you use Classical Arabic online.
- Tick the communicative function(s) in which you use French online.

The participants were asked to tick among a list of functions the ones in which they respectively use Berber, Algerian Arabic, Classical Arabic, English, and French.

- Specific topics
- Sharing knowledge
- General truth
- Greetings
- Imperatives
- Expressing feelings and emotions
- Asserting identity
- Focusing on important points of the conversation
- Discussing issues related to language
- Riddles, jokes, puns, etc.
The following table summarises the findings of the five items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Communicative Events</th>
<th>Corresponding Communicative Function</th>
<th>The Language(s) Used</th>
<th>Frequency (the cumulative percentage of all communicative events corresponding to the function)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Specific topics</td>
<td>Referential Function</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing knowledge</td>
<td>Referential Function</td>
<td>Classical Arabic</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General truth</td>
<td>Referential Function</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>51.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Referential Function</td>
<td>Algerian Arabic</td>
<td>32.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Referential Function</td>
<td>Berber</td>
<td>25.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greetings</td>
<td>Directive Function</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>82.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imperatives</td>
<td>Directive Function</td>
<td>Berber</td>
<td>81.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Directive Function</td>
<td>Algerian Arabic</td>
<td>79.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Directive Function</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressing feelings and emotions</td>
<td>Expressive Function</td>
<td>Berber</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asserting identity</td>
<td>Expressive Function</td>
<td>Algerian Arabic</td>
<td>91.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expressive Function</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expressive Function</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focusing on important points of the</td>
<td>Phatic Function</td>
<td>All languages</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>conversation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussing issues related to language</td>
<td>Metalinguistic Function</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riddles, jokes, puns, etc.</td>
<td>Poetic Function</td>
<td>Berber</td>
<td>92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Poetic Function</td>
<td>Algerian Arabic</td>
<td>91.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Poetic Function</td>
<td>Classical Arabic</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table displays results related to the participants’ use of different languages in different online communicative events. Of the six functions, the only one expressed exclusively in one language is the metalinguistic function expressed in English. Being EFL learners, this result is not surprising. To improve their linguistic abilities, EFL learners engage in real communication in English to discuss issues related to language as a system like the peculiarities of the foreign language, grammatical structures, the use of idiomatic expressions, etc.

All the other functions are expressed by using different languages. However, it is clear from the displayed results that not all the languages are used in the same way, for the same purposes, or in the same rates. “The fact that speakers select different languages or varieties for use in different situations shows that not all languages / varieties are equal or regarded as equally appropriate or adequate
for use in all speech events”. (Romaine, 2003, p. 517). So, we can, safely, claim that the participants have a variety of languages or language varieties with different functions at their disposal; they switch among languages across different communicative events.

What can be concluded from the analysis is the Algerian EFL students’ perception of their mother tongues and foreign languages. Unlike what was expected, the participants perceive Algerian Arabic and Berber in the same way as a symbol of their identity and of their ‘Algerianity’. The results have shown that both are used for directive, expressive, phatic, and poetic functions with almost the same rates whatever the mother tongue of the participant is. They are used to hold everyday conversations, to express feelings like happiness and sadness, and to assert their identity. As Holmes (2001, p.35) suggests, “a speaker may similarly switch to another language as a signal of group membership and shared ethnicity with an addressee”.

Classical Arabic’s use, even though it is an official language in Algeria, is confined to two different functions ‘referential’ and ‘poetic’. As far as French and English are concerned, the two languages are still perceived as languages of science and knowledge. They are mainly used for ‘referential’ function to discuss or debate content-related issues. It is worth noting that a slight difference is noticed between French and English. Since the participants are EFL students, English is exclusively used for the metalinguistic function.

In a nutshell, the participants classify their languages according to the context in which they are used. In other words, communicative objectives imply a certain functional separation.

**Conscious and Subconscious Practices**

In order to understand the functional separation of languages, and better explore the reasons behind the code switching among languages as well as reasons for the classification established by the participants, two questions are asked:

- Could you explain why and how do you make choices among your linguistic repertoire when communicating online?
- Are you conscious of the selection of languages when you chat online? why?

Some of the answers given by the participants for the first item were:

- “Switching among languages is inevitable. We use different languages in our daily life. It is the same thing online”.
- “Since we speak different languages, we cannot limit ourselves to the use of a single langue. I think that using different languages is something that we should take profit of”.

- “Sometimes I switch to other languages because I don’t find the correct word or expression in English”.

- “The mother tongue is very important for my identity. Whenever I chat online, I feel the need to express and show myself as a unique individual by expressing my identity”.

- “There are things that I cannot explain but I think that each language should be used in a specific situation. I cannot tell jokes in English; I cannot speak about religion in French or English; I should use classical Arabic”.

- “Telling jokes in Berber or Algerian Arabic is not as nearly as expressive as telling them in English”.

As far as the second item is concerned, here is a summary of the collected data:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Conscious</th>
<th>Unconscious</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>26.8%</td>
<td>73.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When asked to explain their degree of awareness about their practices, the participants’ answers can be grouped into two categories. The first category relates code switching to the status of each language in their daily life. As it has been said earlier, the participants are transferring their face-to-face practices to virtual settings. Switching among the mother tongues in addition to French, which has a particular status in Algeria, is unconscious among Algerian students in this area of the country. Belmihoub (2018, p. 2) holds that “code-switching using a Berber variety, Derja, and French is common among Berber speakers”. Similarly, Gumperz (1982, p. 61) explains the unconsciously of speakers when using different codes within the same conversation as follows.

> participants immersed in the interaction itself are often quite unaware which code is used at any one time. Their main concern is with the communicative effect of what they are saying. Selection among linguistic alternants is automatic, not readily subject to conscious recall.

The second category relates to participants who are aware of their switching depending on the aim and the topic of the conversation, in addition to their mastery of the language. They reported that they switch to Classical Arabic whenever they want to discuss religious-related subjects. In addition, they switch from foreign languages to mother tongues as a consequence of their lack of knowledge. Conversely, they switch from mother tongues to foreign languages to discuss knowledge-related issues. This type of switching relates to metaphorical code switching to fulfil the referential function. The same results are reported in an empirical study in real interaction by Appel & Muysken. They state
this type of switching [referential function] is the one that bilingual speakers are most conscious of. When asked why they switch they tend to say that it is because they do not know the word for it in the other language, or because the language chosen is more fit for talking about a given subject. (2005, p. 118)

The Use of English in Virtual Contexts

The final section of the questionnaire aimed to uncover the participants’ perspectives regarding the utilization of English in virtual communication. Two specific questions were posed:

Do you notice any difference when using English in face-to-face communication or online communication?

As an EFL student, how do you feel when using English to communicate online?

As reported by the participants, they acknowledged a disparity between using English in physical and virtual environments. They mentioned that they feel less anxious online as they have enough time to think. In addition, conversations with their classmates online are more beneficial, motivational and helpful in sharpening their linguistic skills as they do their best to use English. This result is in line with what was reported in the literature on the topic in relation to anxiety and online communication. In their study, Huang and Hwang (2013) found that virtual settings represent less stressful environments for learning. Similarly, according to Al-Qahtani (2019) learners are likely to improve their communication skills in virtual settings.

In a nutshell, the participants admitted that virtual communication improves their communicative competencies in several languages in general and in English in particular.

Conclusion

The growing integration of digital devices in our daily life calls for an exploration of how people engage in digital events and socialise through virtual interaction. Algerian EFL students, like their counterparts around the world, have embraced the modern technologies to help them transfer and share knowledge. Indeed, they are increasingly engaging in technology-mediated interaction.

Although multilingual communication has been widely studied through spoken data analyses, research on online communication is relatively recent. The present study has attempted to determine the way Algerian EFL students make use of their linguistic repertoire in online conversations. It has been found that they transfer their face-to-face practices to virtual settings. In addition, they unconsciously set a classification of languages across a variety of language
functions. As regards English, it was found that the online context provides Algerian EFL learners a new opportunity to freely and fluently practise their English for the sake of improving their linguistic skills and overcome their anxiety.

The present study suffers from a methodological limitation which is common among survey studies. The data collection tool is a questionnaire; accordingly, the results are highly dependent on the participants’ answers and opinions. A corpus-based study, in the future, would deepen the scope of this area of research and bring to light the use, rather than the perception, of different languages in online conversations.

References


Appendix

The Questionnaire
This questionnaire is part of an empirical study investigating Algerian EFL students’ multilingual practices in online interaction. You are kindly requested to answer all the questionnaire items by ticking off the appropriate box (es) or by providing a full answer when necessary. We promise to keep all the questionnaires anonymous, so, please answer honestly. We thank you in advance for your collaboration.

The Participants’ Profile
1. What is/ are your mother tongue (s)?
2. What is/are the foreign language (s) that you speak?
3. Are you a member of any group of EFL learners in social networks?

Online Multilingual Practices across Different Communicative Functions
4. What are the languages that you use to communicate online with EFL students?
5. Tick the communicative function (s) in which you use English online.
   - Specific topics
   - Sharing knowledge
   - General truth
   - Greetings
   - Imperatives
   - Expressing feelings and emotions
   - Asserting identity
   - Focusing on important points of the conversation
   - Discussing issues related to language
   - Riddles, jokes, puns, etc
6. Tick the communicative function (s) in which you use Berber online.
   - Specific topics
   - Sharing knowledge
   - General truth
   - Greetings
   - Imperatives
- Expressing feelings and emotions
- Asserting identity
- Focusing on important points of the conversation
- Discussing issues related to language
- Riddles, jokes, puns, etc.

7. Tick the communicative function (s) in which you use Algerian Arabic online.

- Specific topics
- Sharing knowledge
- General truth
- Greetings
- Imperatives
- Expressing feelings and emotions
- Asserting identity
- Focusing on important points of the conversation
- Discussing issues related to language
- Riddles, jokes, puns, etc.

8. Tick the communicative function (s) in which you use Classical Arabic online.

- Specific topics
- Sharing knowledge
- General truth
- Greetings
- Imperatives
- Expressing feelings and emotions
- Asserting identity
- Focusing on important points of the conversation
- Discussing issues related to language
- Riddles, jokes, puns, etc.

9. Tick the communicative function (s) in which you use French online.

- Specific topics
- Sharing knowledge
- General truth
- Greetings
- Imperatives
- Expressing feelings and emotions
- Asserting identity
- Focusing on important points of the conversation
- Discussing issues related to language
- Riddles, jokes, puns, etc.

10. Could you explain why and how do you make choices among your linguistic repertoire when communicating online?

11. Are you conscious of the selection of languages when you chat online? Why?

**The Use of English in Virtual Contexts**

12. Do you notice any difference when using English in face-to-face communication and in online communication?

13. As an EFL student, how do you feel when using English to communicate online?

*Thank you*
PARATEXTUAL REFRAMING OF VISUAL ELEMENTS IN
AL JAZEERA’S COVERAGE OF THE 2022
CONFLICT BETWEEN RUSSIA AND UKRAINE

Karina AlOteibi¹, Ahmad S Haider², Hadeel AlSaed³

¹,²,³Department of English Language and Translation, Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan
²,³MEU Research Unit, Middle East University, Amman, Jordan

Abstract: Since it started in February 2022, the Russian-Ukrainian War has gained the interest of numerous news organizations. The reframing of visual elements of ten news items about the Russian-Ukrainian War is examined in this study. The Arabic versions are extracted from the Al Jazeera website, while the original articles were taken from The Atlantic and Foreign Affairs. Baker’s narrative theory is used in this paper (Baker, 2018). Comparing the visual elements in the English articles to their Arabic equivalents allowed researchers to pinpoint how they are paratextually reframed in the translated versions. The findings showed that Al Jazeera occasionally produces various, varied, and incongruent interpretations of the narrative. This could lead to multiple and, occasionally, dissimilar perspectives on the same story. The findings showed that Al Jazeera utilized paratextual reframing strategies involving visual elements, such as images, videos, and typographical features, to reframe the Russian-Ukrainian War. The research suggests that while the original media outlets initially framed the war according to their agenda, Al Jazeera altered this frame in the translated text. As a result, the target audience’s perception of the event under examination may change during the entire process.

Keywords: Russian-Ukrainian conflict, paratextual framing, visual elements, Al Jazeera, Arabic

About the author: Karina AlOteibi is an MA holder in Audiovisual and Mass Media Translation at the Applied Science Private University. Her main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, pragmatics, and translation studies.
e-mail: karinaoteibi1990@hotmail.com

About the author: Ahmad S Haider is an associate professor in the Department of English Language and Translation at the Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan. He received his Ph.D. in Linguistics from the University of Canterbury/New Zealand. His current research focuses on how political events are socially, discursively, and linguistically represented in media, combining Corpus Linguistics and (Critical) Discourse Analysis. His main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, and translation studies. Dr. Haider has built different large Arabic and English corpora. He professionally masters different Corpus Linguistic software packages.
e-mail: a_haidar@asu.edu.jo

About the author: Hadeel AlSaed is an associate professor at the Department of English Language and Translation Applied Science Private University (ASU). Dr. Saed received her Ph.D. in Curriculum and Methods of Teaching English from the University of Jordan in 2012. Her main areas of interest include second-language learning, first-language learning, translation studies, socio-linguistics, syntax, and phonetics. Dr. Saed has published many research articles in prestigious journals.
e-mail: h_alsaed@asu.edu.jo

Copyright © 2024 Karina AlOteibi, Ahmad S Haider, Hadeel AlSaed

Article history: Received: 18 December 2023; Reviewed: 18 February 2024; Revised: 18 February 2024; Accepted: 26 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Introduction

The Russian-Ukrainian War is one of the recent events that captured the attention of the entire world. According to Al-Duleimi and Al-Ebadi (2016), media outlets frequently have an ideological bias in favor of one of the parties to the conflict (Dibas, Rabab’ah & Haider, 2022). Hence, News reporters and translators may be impartial in their reporting (Al-Salman & Haider, 2021).

After the Revolution for Dignity in February 2014, Russia seized control of Crimea from Ukraine and backed pro-Russian separatists in their conflict against Ukrainian troops in the Donbas region. After that, things became worse, and on February 24, 2022, Russia attacked Ukraine in full force. According to Western officials, this war may be the biggest in Europe since 1945 in terms of scope. A humanitarian crisis was caused by the battle. Sanctions on Russia were imposed by the US, the EU, and other nations. Arab communities have been engaged in conversations regarding the adverse impacts of the Russian-Ukrainian War on the economies of multiple Arab nations due to the ongoing conflict.

There are claims that the strongman archetype, exemplified by Putin, serves as a source of inspiration for Arab populations, influencing global dynamics. Putin is depicted as the leader who countered Western efforts to democratize Eastern Europe, established Russian energy dominance over the West, intervened in the US presidential elections, and supported the stability of the Syrian regime. Additionally, the war has already had an impact on several industries in the Arab world, including tourism, agricultural imports, and the oil and gas industries. The Assad regime in Syria stands out as the sole Arab government with a genuine pro-Putin stance, while the majority of other Arab states prioritize their relationships with the West. However, this does not imply that Arab countries and the Kremlin are in conflict. Instead, they often view Russia as a significant global power that remains relevant in their region and occasionally undertakes initiatives that serve their interests.

While there are limited studies examining the reframing of narratives in media translation (Al Sharif, 2009; Allawzi, Al-Jabri, Ammari & Ali, 2022; Qin & Zhang, 2018; Smadi, Obeidat & Haider, 2022), this research holds significance for its examination of the reframing of the Russian-Ukrainian War, a contentious issue with global ramifications1.

The paratextual visual elements of ten news items about the Russian-Ukrainian War are examined in this piece of research. The Arabic articles are collected from the Al Jazeera website, while the original articles were taken from The

Atlantic and Foreign Affairs. This article argues that when translated into the target language, the source materials undergo a process of reframing in order to conform to the agenda of the media outlets from which they originate. These are:

1. What are the visual elements that Al Jazeera used in reframing the Russian-Ukrainian War narratives?

2. How do paratextual reframing techniques of visual elements impact the narratives surrounding the Russian-Ukrainian War?

Review of Related Literature

Political Media and Translation

The spread of political media depends heavily on translation. However, as Bhatia and Ritchie (2014) noted, the translation of political media necessitates careful consideration of linguistic, cultural, and political elements. This is because political media frequently uses colloquial terms, cultural references, and political views that might be challenging to translate accurately.

The public heavily relies on mass media outlets as a source of important information on current events (Haider, 2019a; Haider & Hussein, 2020). However, due to limitations in time and space, these outlets inevitably have to filter out certain events, stories, and aspects. Although many media outlets assert their impartiality and claim to prioritize news based solely on its newsworthiness, they frequently face accusations from journalism watchdogs and political think tanks of demonstrating systematic bias in their selection process (Al-Abbas & Haider, 2020). This ongoing criticism underscores the challenges of maintaining journalistic integrity in today’s media landscape. They claim that the outlets tend to favor either the owners’ and journalists’ interests or cater to the preferences of their target audience (Abu Rumman & Haider, 2023; Haider, 2019b). This phenomenon, known as media bias, has been extensively studied in the literature related to political science, economics, and communication (Niculae, Suen, Zhang, Danescu-Niculescu-Mizil & Leskovec, 2015). Theoretical explanations categorize media bias based on where choices are made about what to report. This encompasses the selection of topics and specifics addressed (issue and facts bias), the manner in which information is conveyed (framing bias), or the approach taken in discussions (ideological stance bias) (Niculae et al., 2015).

Political media can also be translated with a particular audience in mind. For example, Koskinen (2014) suggests that political speeches can be translated to emphasize certain political ideologies or values. This action can significantly impact how the public perceives political discourse. One of the decisive criteria
differentiating talented translators from others is the political background knowledge of the translators about culture-specific and sensitive characteristics of both SL and TL cultures (Schäffner, 2007).

Media outlets can use different ideological strategies to reach their goals shaped by political and ideological agendas. For example, Shunnaq (1992) sheds light on monitoring and managing methods. In the former scenario, the media outlet endeavors to elucidate events by presenting available evidence without interference, whereas in the latter, it seeks to manipulate and shape events to align with its political agendas. As a result, the media outlet is seen as an event observer when it employs the monitoring strategy. In contrast, it is regarded as a component of the event itself in the managing strategy.

News translation has specific characteristics that distinguish this translation’s branch from any other type. These qualities include using straightforward, direct, and appropriate language for all reading levels, which is the main objective of news translators, as news is intended for a broad audience rather than a particular social class. Furthermore, news translators need to adhere to the policies of the news agency, as they are tasked with adapting news articles to a specific context within a limited time, space, and cultural constraints. Furthermore, news translators frequently fulfill roles as proofreaders and back-translators. Moreover, they must prioritize objectivity over faithfulness to the source text, as objectivity is a fundamental principle of news agencies (Bielsa, 2007).

**Empirical Studies**

Various research studies have explored the translation of political texts into different languages, analyzing the utilization of reframing strategies in the process. For example, Alibabaee and Shokohipoor (2016) investigated the impact of wartime periods on political text translation, concentrating specifically on MEMRI’s tactics for constructing and disseminating chosen narratives. This empirical study revealed MEMRI’s deliberate use of translation strategies in paratextual elements such as titles, headings, and introductions by studying 37 selected dispatches through narrative theory and framing. These devices sought to underscore Iranians’ perceived hostility toward Israel and occasionally incorporated imagery to call Iran’s credibility into question. According to the study, these methods are consistent with MEMRI’s tendency to present Iran as a potential threat to Israel, revealing light on the intricate interplay of translation, conflict, and framing strategies in political discourse.

Garritzen (2018) examined the often-overlooked role of paratexts in shaping textual production and reception. This empirical study expands on this topic by delving into John Richard Green’s *Short History of the English People*, a late Victorian phenomenon, using an interdisciplinary lens including book history,
historiography, and literary criticism. This study reveals the transformational impact of paratexts in scholarly discourse by methodically investigating paratexts in the original 1874 edition and comparing them to those in four posthumous editions prepared by Alice Stopford Green. It highlights how paratexts influence the acceptance and success of academic literature, as well as how the book’s meaning and worth change through time. The paratexts of the *Short History* serve as dynamic entry points that shape readers’ understanding of the narrative, from its inception as a proto-social history to its transformation into a vehicle for promoting English patriotism and, ultimately, advocating a nationalist interpretation of Irish history. This study emphasizes the importance of widening our understanding of scientific narratives to include paratextual aspects, highlighting the complex processes of knowledge transmission and presentation to readers.

The study on the Arabic translation of Joe Sacco’s *Footnotes in Gaza* by Dubbati and Abudayeh (2018) combines narrative theory and discourse analysis to investigate the translator’s paratextual effects. According to the research, the Palestinian translator sees himself as an activist working to change people’s perceptions of the Palestinian cause. The translator depicts Palestinians as victims of Israeli oppression and heroes of resistance through paratextual interventions, aligning with his political sympathies and Arab readers’ expectations. While these interventions do not fundamentally change the source text’s tone, they provide valuable insights into the translator’s role in reframing narratives in translation, especially in the context of politically charged works, distinguishing it from instances of deliberate misrepresentation in Arab-Israeli conflict translations.

The study of Persian translations of Western-authored political texts about the Iran-Iraq war by Yalsharzeh, Barati, and Hesabi (2019) using narrative theory and the concept of narrative framing reveals the significant role of paratextual elements in reframing and ideologically positioning the readers. Using framing approaches to analyze the paratexts, particularly the prefaces and footnotes, the study demonstrates that paratexts are powerful ideological devices, reflecting and replicating existing ideological systems while giving counter-narratives. Paratexts are more than just an introduction; they offer a second chance to reject Western narratives and promote native ones. The authorship of paratexts actively contributes to the connotation and molding of societal reality. The research focuses on the institutional foundations of discursive processes in translation. It emphasizes the political consequences of paratexts in justifying and challenging war narratives, providing insights into Iranian institutional and ideological narratives to not only translation studies but also political science. It also depicts paratextual authorship as a process characterized by disparities and tensions, emphasizing its importance in framing and contesting narratives.
Another study by Tao and Gu (2020) on the diachronic reframing of the Chinese classic *Xiyou ji* (Journey to the West) in English provides a comprehensive exploration of the transformation and popularization of Chinese literature in the Western context over the last century. The study, which employs paratextual analysis and narrative theory, illustrates how renowned translators kept the basic narrative structure while changing the genre and narrative tone, providing a new perspective on the story. In other words, they reframed the narrative under multiple paratextual elements.

Smadi et al. (2022) investigated the role of translation in reframing various narratives of the Christchurch Mosque Shootings. Their focus was on how translators utilized the paratextual components of 12 pairs of English and Arabic articles to reframe the terror assault and propagate the ideological attitudes of the media outlets they work for. By examining the social media sites of one of the investigated media outlets, namely MEMRI, they showed the possible impact of media translation in shaping public perceptions and opinions regarding the image of Islam in the West.

The study by Mowafy and Mohamed (2023) emphasizes the importance of paratextuality in affecting the reception and perception of translated texts. It uses the case of George Orwell’s *Animal Farm* in Arabic translations as an example of how paratextual features can influence the cultural stereotyping and ideological framing of a literary work, particularly in the context of the Arab Spring protests. The study shows how paratexts function as sites for translational and editorial intervention, influencing readers’ comprehension of the story. The examination of paratextual features in four selected translations illustrates how each translator retells the story, emphasizing its political implications at the expense of its other literary and cultural nuances. This inclination toward a political interpretation, reinforced by the paratextual features, limits the novella’s potential for multilayered readings and ignores its fairy tale parts.

After a thorough examination of the existing literature, and as far as the researchers are aware, no prior studies have investigated the paratextual reframing of visual elements pertaining to the 2022 Russian-Ukrainian War in translation. This study seeks to rectify and bridge this research gap.

**Methodology**

**Investigated Media Outlets**

As previously noted, this study scrutinizes three media outlets. It compares the English source texts from *The Atlantic* and *Foreign Affairs* with the Arabic target articles published by *Al Jazeera*. 
Al Jazeera

Established in 1996, *Al Jazeera* is a renowned news network headquartered in Qatar, boasting a global presence with over 80 offices worldwide. Notably, *Al Jazeera* Arabic emerged as the first independent news outlet in the Arab world committed to delivering extensive news coverage and live discussions (AlOteibi, Haider & AlSaed, 2023). By challenging traditional media taboos in the region, such as featuring Israeli officials and interacting with Arab governments, *Al Jazeera* has played a pivotal role in providing the Arab populace with access to modern journalism.

This network represents a prominent Arabic-language news channel that has exerted a substantial influence on the media environment in the Arab region (AlOteibi et al., 2023). *Al Jazeera*’s editorial approach is guided by a set of core principles. Initially, the network strives to provide a unique angle distinct from mainstream media by presenting thorough coverage of news events from both local and global viewpoints. Additionally, it endeavors to act as an impartial and fair source of information, encouraging analytical thinking and offering diverse perspectives. *Al Jazeera* upholds principles of free expression and advocates for democratic ideals. It openly discusses human rights concerns and supports pro-democracy movements across the Arab region, aiming to amplify the voices of marginalized individuals and groups (Figenschou, 2013).

The Atlantic

Founded in Boston in 1857, *The Atlantic* is a highly respected American magazine and multi-platform publisher known for its wide-ranging content covering politics, business, international relations, culture, arts, technology, and science. Over the years, it has built a strong reputation nationwide for championing meaningful careers and spotlighting emerging poets and writers. Beyond that, *The Atlantic* serves as a platform for insightful writers to express their perspectives on pressing contemporary political matters, including but not limited to abolition, education, and various other crucial issues shaping our world today (AlOteibi et al., 2023). Additionally, the magazine plays a vital role in fostering public discourse and intellectual exploration.

*The Atlantic* remains committed to fostering open-minded discussions that encourage robust intellectual exploration and welcome diverse viewpoints for its audience. Without aligning with any specific political or ideological agenda, it promotes thoughtful analysis and places significant value on critical thinking. Consequently, its editorial team emphasizes the importance of questioning conventional beliefs by considering ideas from various political perspectives while also advocating for thorough reporting on global issues like international conflicts, diplomacy, and development to facilitate a comprehensive understanding of global complexities.
**Foreign Affairs**

*Foreign Affairs,* an American magazine established by the Council on Foreign Relations (CFR) in 1922, has transformed over the years into a multi-platform media entity offering a range of services, including print publications, websites, mobile applications, and social media channels (AlOteibi et al., 2023). Its audience comprises a diverse array of international subscribers with varying interests.

The nature of the publications of *Foreign Affairs* transcends mere coverage, delving into in-depth intellectual analysis that independently sheds light on diverse viewpoints, devoid of any particular ideological framework that aligns with or opposes any specific stance. The magazine’s editorial team leans towards conducting thorough investigations and analyses rooted in credible information. Their goal is to furnish readers with a comprehensive understanding of intricate global matters, recognizing that these issues often carry multiple interpretations and call for a range of policy recommendations.

**Data Collection and Corpus Size**

This study’s primary focus lies in articles originally composed in English and subsequently translated into Arabic. A parallel corpus was compiled to investigate this, containing ten pairs of articles covering the Russian-Ukrainian War. These articles were published between February and October 2022. The English source texts totaled 22,170 words, while the Arabic translations contained 19,416 words. The initial set of five English source articles originated from *The Atlantic* media platform, while the subsequent five were obtained from the website of *Foreign Affairs* Magazine. The Arabic translations of all ten articles were sourced from *Al Jazeera’s* official website. The collected data were then categorized into two primary sub-corpora based on language: an English sub-corpus consisting of original English texts (source language/SL) and an Arabic counterpart featuring the Arabic translations of the English articles (target language/TL).

**Procedures**

This research followed the procedures listed below:

- Selecting a newsworthy event that was widely reported by the media. The 2022 Russian-Ukrainian War was chosen.
- Seeking out Arabic and English-language news outlets and broadcasters who covered the event. Three major news organizations: *Al Jazeera*, *Foreign Affairs*, and *The Atlantic*, were chosen.
- Ten sets of articles, each consisting of both Arabic and English versions, were sourced from the websites of the three news organizations.
Contrasting the visual elements of English and Arabic articles.

Recognizing the instances where visual elements were para-textually reframed

Analysis and Findings

This section examines the paratextual framing strategies used by Al Jazeera and their role in reframing the Russian-Ukrainian War. These strategies include images, videos, and typography. News outlets employ a combination of visual and linguistic communication modes to convey meaning and distribute information. Visual communication involves the transmission of information, ideas, and facts through symbols and images.

In political discourse, visual elements refer to any visual component, such as images, videos, symbols, and typography, used to convey or reinforce a message. They play a critical role in media discourse, as they can evoke emotions, convey complex ideas, and influence the audience’s perception of political events.

Media translation is an essential aspect of political discourse analysis as it involves translating visual and verbal elements across diverse languages and cultural contexts. Al Jazeera, in its translation, frequently uses many types of different visual components, and such paratextual features could influence the story’s interpretation of critical events (AlOteibi et al., 2023).

Images

Images, which include all forms of photos, cartoons, and maps, are fundamental aspects of media. They can influence and modify the receivers’ perceptions of a news article before they ever start reading it. In reframing narratives, Al Jazeera sometimes replaces images under the main title or adds new images throughout the text in the article.

Images under the articles’ headlines are the first aspect that catches the eye of the reader, and this could be the reason why they play a significant role in reframing narratives in media translation. Al Jazeera, in almost all investigated cases, replaced the main picture under the title with a new one to convey a particular point of view that serves its agenda. Table 1 shows examples of changing images under the titles.
Table 1. Examples of image framing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT (Al Jazeera)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td><img src="image5.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image6.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td><img src="image7.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image8.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In example 1, *Al Jazeera* replaced the image of the source article, extracted from *The Atlantic*, with a new image in the target text. In the source image, a Crimean Tatar is holding the Crimean Tatar flag. This flag and the Ukrainian national flag have the same colors, namely blue and yellow. However, *Al Jazeera* replaced this image with Crimean Tatar women protesting against the war with a poster in Russian that reads “НЕТ-ВОЙНЕ!” (Lit. No war!). Thus, *Al Jazeera* made it clear to its audience that the Crimean Tatars were against the war. It should be noted that since the annexation of Crimea by the Russian Federation in 2014, Crimean Tatars have reportedly been subjected to harassment and discrimination by Russian authorities, with cases of torture, arbitrary detention, and enforced disappearance.

In example 2, the article talks about Russia’s potential use of nuclear weapons in Ukraine. The source image, which shows a close-up of Putin in a newspaper, does not directly relate to the topic and provides no specific information about the article’s content, which could be seen as a lack of relevance to the reader. On the other hand, the image used by *Al Jazeera*, which shows modern military equipment, is more directly related to the article’s topic. Using military equipment in the image suggests a sense of potential danger, implying that Russia may be preparing for military action. The target image is also more visually striking and attention-grabbing than the source one, which is an attempt to engage the reader more effectively.

As for example 3, *Al Jazeera*, to some extent, used a similar image but deleted the caption of the source article’s image. The English caption in the source article “Destroyed Russian tanks and armored personnel carriers, Izium, Ukraine, September 2022” expressed the situation of the Russian forces and let the readers know exactly who owns the battered tanks. *Al Jazeera* did not translate the caption, so the audience may be confused as to which party the wrecked tanks belong to. Such gestures may make the article more intriguing and urge the audience to read the entire article. In addition, it may implicate a “middle-of-the-road” position toward the war.

Finally, in example 4, the source image showing the Russian flag eating the Ukrainian flag suggests Russia’s hostile and aggressive stance towards Ukraine. This image is highly metaphorical and suggestive, as it portrays the act of one nation consuming another, which can be seen as a form of dominance and subjection. On the other hand, the image used by *Al Jazeera* suggests a more specific scenario. The tank is a symbol of military power, and its presence on the map indicates that Russia is invading Ukrainian territory. The world map provides a broader context and a sense of geographical zone, which helps the reader understand the scope and scale of the conflict. Also, the flags used in both images as symbols are significant and represent national identity and sovereignty.
As discussed earlier, images are crucial for documenting events, illuminating concepts, and summarizing ideas. Moreover, images heavily influence the audience’s reaction to news articles. While the English sources of the narratives have not inserted any images/photos throughout their articles except for the ones under the main title, *Al Jazeera* extensively inserted images in its translations to better attract target readers visually. Table 2 shows examples of adding images throughout the text.

**Table 2. Example of adding images throughout the text**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT (<em>Al Jazeera</em>)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><em>Foreign Affairs</em></td>
<td>-</td>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Source</td>
<td>ST</td>
<td>TT (Al Jazeera)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In example 5, *Al Jazeera* inserted a new image with a caption in the middle of the article. The Arabic caption in the TT is translated as, “In early September, the Russians were surprised by an intense Ukrainian attack targeting their forces around “Kharkiv,” leading to the defeat and chaotic retreat of the Russian troops on the 10th of the same month and their chaotic retreat (Reuters).” This caption, along with the image, shows what happened to the Russian forces in September 2022 and how they were defeated. Also, the caption distances *Al Jazeera* from its content by ascribing it to Reuters; in this way, they relieve themselves of responsibility for any given information.

In example 6, the image can be analyzed through paratextual framing, as it visually illustrates the article’s central message. An image showing two people holding the Ukrainian flag and a sign that reads “STOP PUTIN’S WAR” in *Al Jazeera*’s translation of the article provides a human face to the conflict, showing
that ordinary people are negatively affected by the war. Moreover, this image is most likely meant to invoke feelings of support for Ukraine and condemn Russia’s involvement in the conflict, aligning with Al Jazeera’s political stance. The channel has been known to provide extensive coverage of the conflict, often taking a pro-Ukrainian stance (Mohamed, 2023). According to Baker (2006), using images that highlight the human impact of the conflict, such as the one described, is a common tactic applied in the media to generate sympathy and support for one side of the conflict.

In example 7, the image extracted by Al Jazeera portrays a group of people protesting and holding Crimean Tatar and Ukrainian flags. The caption in Arabic under the image translates as “Today, as they defend their country against the full and harsh invasion of Russian forces, Ukrainians and Crimean Tatars are also defending their right to live together in one homeland.” The image and its caption imply that the protesters in the picture are against Russia’s invasion of Ukraine and they are defending their right to coexist in a single nation. In place of a clear territorial war, the picture reframes the Ukrainian conflict as a fight for autonomy and the right to peaceful coexistence. Moreover, using the flags further emphasizes the concept of national solidarity in the face of foreign invasion. The word “invasion” in the caption suggests that the Russian forces are not welcome in Ukraine, and the reference to the “harsh” nature of the invasion further highlights the idea of the struggle against an aggressive external power.

In example 8, the image represents the abandoned old house in the Chornobyl zone, which most probably creates a haunting and creepy atmosphere. In 1986, the world witnessed a disaster at Chornobyl that devastated both the environment and human lives. Abandoned buildings like the one pictured remain visual reminders of past trauma and continued security concerns. Al Jazeera’s recent focused coverage of Russian activities in Chornobyl relates to the discussion in the article, which has raised concerns about the region’s security and the risks of further contamination. Al Jazeera apparently used this image to catch the reader’s eye and highlight how challenging the Chornobyl situation was.

Overall, it should be noted that such images are not entirely objective. Regarding paratextual image framing, Al Jazeera tends to replace the source images under the main title as well as to add images throughout the text for explicitly political purposes, which may influence readers’ understanding of a topic. Furthermore, news articles choose images carefully with an aim to improve entertainment quality while effectively communicating its essence to readers. However, we must view these images critically by never forgetting the possible biases and motivations behind such choices embedded within editorial contextual framing, usually invisible to us as media consumers.
Videos

A video is a sequence of moving images that convey information or messages through visual and auditory means. It is a medium that combines sound and images to create a narrative or tell a story and is considered to be one of the most effective forms of content for capturing and controlling the attention of viewers (Mendez, 2017). According to Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007), videos can be used for various objectives, such as entertainment, education, promotion, and communication. In recent years, the popularity of videos has grown exponentially and has become an essential part of media translation.

Al Jazeera frequently adds videos to its translations of articles related to the Russian-Ukrainian war, which helps rethink the narrative of the conflict. The reformulation of narratives in media translation involves the presentation of information that challenges the dominant and predominant narrative and offers alternative points of view (Chesterman, 2016). Al Jazeera may challenge the dominant narrative of the war and offer a more nuanced picture of the situation by presenting videos that reflect other viewpoints and shed light on the conflict’s human cost (Sibson, 2012). Additionally, using videos in media translation can help increase audience engagement. DeLane (2019) noted that videos are more likely to be shared on social media and have a more elevated attention rate than text-based content. Table 3 shows examples of adding videos throughout the translated text.

Table 3. Example of adding videos throughout the text

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>TT (Al Jazeera)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>ايناركوأ ايسور مجاهت اذامل ..ملاعلا تاديدهت مغر زيوب تضربق؟ةسارشلا هذهب</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
<td>Putin’s grip despite world threats... Why is Russia attacking Ukraine with such ferocity?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td><a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H0NlrNbeY0A&amp;t=85s">Video</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>برحلا يفرط ىلع هعاقيإ ضرفب أدب ايناركوأ يف ءاتشلا لصف</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
<td>Winter in Ukraine has begun to impose its rhythm on both sides of the war.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Source</td>
<td>TT (Al Jazeera)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td><img src="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=es2sOGUcZoI&amp;t=166s" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>یوونلا لیبونريشت قطم یلع ططسانت فیس ورلا تاویلا</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
<td>The Russian forces have taken control of the Chornobyl nuclear power plant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td><img src="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ukBhaxB4qRg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>یلع فیس ورلا برحلا تاف دمخت سلا دمتسالا زربأ یلع فیرجت اینارکوا</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
<td>Get to know the most prominent weapons used in the Russian war on Ukraine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td><img src="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FuAKTXWHdC0" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In example 9, the video inserted by *Al Jazeera* provides a detailed analysis of the Ukraine conflict’s roots and explores the main motives for the Russian attack. In addition, it highlights how severe economic sanctions imposed on Russia and threats of diplomatic and economic isolation from Western nations did not stop Putin from insisting on invading Ukraine to overthrow its current government. The video adds an essential dimension to the news article and gives a comprehensive view of the situation, making it more accessible and informative to the target audience.

In example 10, the video added by *Al Jazeera* represents the ongoing battle in Ukraine and how the opposing troops are frantically trying to gain an advantage before the weather worsens. It also draws attention to how the conflict affects civilians, in particular, how it may endanger electrical facilities and infrastructure and have a negative effect on the population. In addition, such videos portray the conflict’s human impact, which the original text may have yet to convey adequately. Consequently, this helps shift the story’s focus from a purely political or economic philosophy and perspective to a more human-centered one. According to Munday (2016), audiovisual elements such as videos often significantly impact audiences as they are more engaging and can convey emotions more effectively.

In example 11, the video provides important information about the current situation in northern Ukraine, where Russian forces have taken control of the Chornobyl nuclear power station. In addition, the video includes an interview with an expert in the field of nuclear energy, emphasizing the potential environmental risks posed by this action. Most probably, the viewer feels empathy and concern for the situation when interviews and video footage from the affected areas are included. Using such videos in translation is crucial for reframing narratives in the media. Videos can aid in challenging dominant narratives and delivering a more nuanced knowledge of complicated subjects by giving audiences access to various ideas and perspectives. In this way, videos can be incredibly helpful in fostering a stronger sense of empathy and cultural understanding.

In example 12, the video inserted by *Al Jazeera* most likely attempts to inform its Arabic-speaking audience about the types of weapons that both sides have used in the ongoing war in Ukraine. The video highlights the use by the Russian military of modern weapons such as tanks, fighter jets, bombers, attack helicopters, and thermobaric bombers, as well as the deployment of US and British missiles by the Ukrainian military to fight Russian forces. Moreover, by displaying the diversity and sophistication of the weaponry utilized in the war, the video may be intended to illustrate the gravity of the situation and the risk of escalation. It might also be interpreted as a call for greater international action and attention to put an end to the recent violence in Ukraine.
Overall, integrating videos in articles can help people understand them better since videos provide a visual depiction of the events and situations being addressed, which can help viewers understand the context and implications of the events being discussed. Moreover, videos can feature interviews with involved parties or expert analysis, offering additional insights that can further enrich the audience’s knowledge. They can also stimulate and provoke the audience’s emotions, which strengthens the article’s message. It is also worth noting that *Al Jazeera*’s choice to include such videos to its audience is motivated by the importance of visual media in attracting and maintaining viewers, as visual media are more engaging and successful in transmitting and conveying information than textual media (Cruse, 2006). Therefore, adding videos to the translation can enhance the news story’s overall quality, making it more accessible to a broader audience.

At some points, when analyzing the translation of *Al Jazeera*, one could feel that this channel is engaged in steganography. The concept of steganography involves concealing secret and sometimes private information within a cover media, such as an image, audio, or video file, in a way that it remains undetected by unintended recipients (Meghanathan & Nayak, 2010). The technique provides a hidden means of exchanging information while also protecting intellectual property rights; since the channel frequently uses visual materials in their translations, one would suspect that they wish to transmit concealed information to their intended audience. The concept of hidden meaning is used in both steganography and the philosophy of reframing narratives in media translation. The purpose of steganography is to conceal information within a cover media in such a way that unwanted recipients cannot easily detect it. The hidden message is embedded within the cover media and can only be detected by using proper steganalysis algorithms. Similarly, the theory of reframing narratives in media translation involves the concept of hidden meaning by manipulating and exploiting the narrative framing of a message. This can be done by changing the way the message is presented or adding new elements such as images, video, and audio to change its meaning. Once again, the aim is to subtly shape the audience’s perception of the message without being too obvious.

**Typography**

The typographic design is closely linked to visual and pictorial aspects (Gambier & Van Doorslaer, 2010). Typography is the practice of arranging type to enhance the readability, legibility, and visual appeal of written text. When it comes to media translation, this practice is crucial as it helps to convey the tone, style, and cultural sensitivity of the source text to the target audience in an appropriate manner. Well-designed typography can improve the clarity, consistency, and
impact of a translated message, while poorly performed typography, on the other hand, can reduce the message’s influence and the user’s experience.

Typography is undoubtedly important in media accessibility since it facilitates reading and understanding for viewers with sensory disabilities, as pointed out by (Díaz-Cintas, Orero & Remael, 2007). Moreover, Gambier and Van Doorslaer (2010) stress the cultural and linguistic implications of typography in multimedia translation, where typography can convey cultural norms, identities, and values. By manipulating the typography and layout in a translation, a translator can stress or downplay certain aspects of the source text or convey a particular tone or message to the target audience. Table 4 shows examples of paratextual typography framing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT (Al Jazeera)</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Literal Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>But even if some of Ukraine’s heating systems can be repaired, Moscow will attack again and again. According to the investigative news outlet Bellingcat, a secret military unit composed of 33 engineers based in Moscow is carefully directing the Kremlin’s targeting of Ukraine’s civilian infrastructure.</td>
<td>In Al Jazeera’s translation, “Bellingcat” is underlined and in blue. The reader will be directed to the other online article by clicking on it.</td>
<td>So, Moscow can attack it time and time again. According to the investigative journalism platform ‘Bellingcat,’ there is a secret military unit consisting of 33 engineers based in Moscow that carefully directs the Kremlin’s air-strikes targeting Ukraine’s civilian infrastructure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td>Now, with Russia’s invasion, the norm against territorial conquest has been tested in the most threatening and vivid way since the end of World War II.</td>
<td>The phrase “Russia’s invasion” is not underlined and does not suggest any link as in the ST.</td>
<td>Now, with Russia’s invasion of Ukraine, this norm appears to be under a challenging test in a frightening and explicit manner for the first time since World War II.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Source</td>
<td>ST</td>
<td>TT (Al Jazeera)</td>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td>Build walls from reeds and grass, Dig wolf pits and trenches. Grow accustomed to living with neighbors day after day. Your homeland is where they understand you when you talk in your sleep.</td>
<td>نم اناردج أونبا، شئاشحو صوب، قدانخ اورف، سايذل ارف، يف اوچرزا، ملكسونن، غم شرياعشنا، دوي آمري ناريچ، موي، نشيج و هوكنسطو، اننطع رخآل ملكفم، يف نوملكتت، ملكون.</td>
<td>The source text is shown in italics with a font size of 16.5, while the target text is in bold with a font size of 18.</td>
<td>Build walls from reeds and grass, Dig pits and trenches for wolves. Cultivate in your heart co-existence with neighbors day after day, Your homeland is where others understand you when you talk in your sleep.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>NO ONE CAN read Vladimir Putin’s mind. But we can read the book that foretells the Russian leader’s imperialist foreign policy.</td>
<td>اَّنِم ٌّيأ عسي اللقع أرقي نأ اننكل، نيتوب أرقن نأ عيطتسن يذلا باتكلا، حالمب آبن،تيج ناخلا فسايايسلا،تيهليبرم،واييس، ويسورا ميغزلل.</td>
<td>In the translation, the typography is minimal, without any bold or italized words, as in the ST.</td>
<td>No one among us can read Putin’s mind, but we can read the book that predicted the features of the Russian leader’s imperialist foreign policy.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In example 13, in Al Jazeera’s translation, the word “Bellingcat” is underlined and in blue, which makes it stand out from the rest of the text. This typographical choice gives the source of information more credibility, as it implies that it is coming from a reputable news outlet. Additionally, both source and target texts provide us with links once we click on the word “Bellingcat.” Readers will be redirected to the website with another article titled: “The Remote Control Killers Behind Russia’s Cruise Missile Strikes on Ukraine.” Assuring that the target audience would comprehend the text similarly to the source audience by using this typography style in the TT is crucial for producing an accurate and culturally suitable translation. It is also assumed that in this way, Al Jazeera wants to win the trust of its viewers since its translation, in this example, is neutral and balanced. Therefore, this paratextual framing strategy can influence readers’ perception of the information presented and increase their trust in the source.

In example 14, the underlining of “Russia’s invasion” in the ST draws attention to it and highlights its importance in the discussed context. Furthermore, by clicking on this phrase, readers will automatically be taken to a new page with

---

2. The process through which certain words or expressions are made more visually noted to emphasize their priority or significance is known as highlighting.
an article titled “What Putin Really Wants in Ukraine, Russia Seeks to Stop NATO’s Expansion, Not to Annex More Territory,” thus providing additional information and context to the reader and drawing the reader’s attention to this specific event. However, in the TT, the underlining is not present, potentially changing how the reader perceives the phrase and suggesting that the translator did not consider this particular aspect of the text significant for the Arabic audience. Furthermore, while the underlined words in the ST suggest a link to a specific article, Al Jazeera did not provide this additional information in their translation. This action may cause confusion or a lack of context for the reader, who may want to find out more about the Russian invasion. Because of this, using special typographical features in the translation, in general, plays an essential role in highlighting specific terms, expressions, and events in a way that speaks of the importance of what is being said. Conversely, the absence of certain typographical features can change how the reader perceives the text. Consequently, typography is an essential consideration when interpreting and understanding a text since it has a significant impact on the overall message.

In example 15, the translation’s use of specific typography draws the reader’s attention to the poem’s lines and emphasizes their value in relation to the text as a whole. For example, the source text is shown in italics with a font size of 16.5, while the target text is in bold with a font size of 18. The ST’s use of italics sets the lines apart from the rest of the text and suggests that they are part of a poem. It also creates a visual distinction between the poem and the surrounding text, emphasizing it and grabbing the readers’ attention. While in the TT, writing the verse of the poem in bold makes the lines stand out even more than they do in the ST. The larger font size and boldness make the lines visually dominant and underline their significance in the translation. Also, using a bigger font size than the surrounding text (which is in 16) indicates that the poem is a subordinate element to the rest of the text. In addition, bold typography suggests a degree of urgency or intensity in the meaning and connotation of the verses, encouraging the reader to concentrate more on them.

In example 16, the translator has not effectively used typography to convey the same degree of emphasis and negative connotation as the ST. Specifically, the words “NO ONE CAN” are in all capital letters, which brings a sense of focus and draws attention to the fact that Putin’s ideas and thoughts cannot be directly known. Lupton (2014) emphasizes the expressive prospect of typography by stating that it can convey emotions, moods, attitudes, and personalities. She also highlights the role of typography in shaping the reader’s understanding and creating a visual aspect for the message. In the given translation, the typography is minimal, without any bold or italicized words to emphasize points or skew readership. The only exception is the use of diacritical marks, such as the shadda and sukun, which are used to show how particular Arabic letters and
words should be pronounced. This lack of typographical features makes the translation appear more neutral and balanced.

In general, the use of paratextual framing techniques, such as typography, can often reframe the presentation of a story or event in media translation. This can mean changing the narrative’s focus and principle while minimizing other details or creating entirely new stories based on the source material. Typography, according to Baker’s paratextual framing methods, can influence the reader’s story interpretation. It is part of the text’s paratext, which includes any items outside the text’s main body that can influence the reader’s reception. Moreover, typographic decisions like font size, color, and layout can convey the intended audience and the source text’s genre, tone, and cultural background. Baker (2018) argues that a selective highlighting framing strategy can be used manipulatively. For instance, selective highlighting can be achieved using bold, italics, or underlined fonts to engage the reader in specific words or phrases.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Through the examination of the employment of paratextual framing strategies, it is evident that Al Jazeera contributed to the reframing of the Russian-Ukrainian War for Arab readers. According to the analysis, various paratextual reframing of visual elements techniques were utilized to form and portray the narratives in various ways. Specific visual elements such as images, videos, and typographical features accompanying the articles influenced the readers’ interpretation by framing the narrative through carefully selected visual elements. The analysis demonstrates that these paratextual techniques are powerful tools for constructing and conveying narratives in diverse ways.

In the realm of media, such techniques play a pivotal role in molding public opinion, as they can emphasize certain aspects of a story, evoke emotional responses, and guide viewers or readers toward particular viewpoints. The strategic deployment of images, videos, and typographical features within media narratives significantly influences public discourse and shapes a collective understanding of critical events and issues. It highlights the need for media consumers to critically analyze the paratextual elements presented to them and be aware of how they can influence their perceptions and attitudes toward various cases and issues in our interconnected world.

Analyzing the paratextual visual components within the selected ten news articles on the Russian-Ukrainian War reveals how Al Jazeera framed the conflict narrative. While Al Jazeera aimed for a balanced approach, it appeared to lean favorably towards Ukraine in several instances, displaying empathy for its plight. This suggests that their translation efforts may have been influenced by biases or contextual factors that favored Ukraine over Russia. In summary, Al Jazeera’s coverage of the Russian-Ukrainian War lacked neutrality, veering
more towards a pro-Ukraine stance while expressing sympathy for its cause. To form informed perspectives on the matter, it is critical for individuals to critically evaluate multiple sources of information.

This paper holds several implications that should be considered. First of all, it highlights the influential role of media outlets like Al Jazeera in shaping narratives and perspectives on conflicts. Secondly, it also emphasizes the power of media institutions to shape public opinion through translation and framing choices. Thirdly, using various framing devices in translation creates varying views of the same story, underscoring the significance of translators in influencing audience perception. Finally, identifying framing devices sheds light on how narratives are constructed and manipulated.

The findings also hold implications for initiatives aimed at conflict resolution. Framing can reshape narratives in ways that greatly impact how the public perceives conflicts and their potential solutions, potentially bolstering diplomatic initiatives and peacebuilding endeavors. It is essential for policymakers, journalists, and those involved in conflict resolution to navigate these varied narratives effectively.

Furthermore, the impact of political and cultural settings on framing decisions must be acknowledged. Factors such as the audience’s cultural background, geographical dynamics, and editorial policies can all impact Al Jazeera’s reframing techniques. This emphasizes the importance of media diversity, as it can lead to contradictory narratives of a story in media debate. Additionally, this study emphasizes the significance of fostering media literacy and cultivating critical thinking skills among viewers, enabling them to recognize reframing tactics and prejudices within news reporting. Lastly, it underscores the criticality of adhering to ethical journalistic and translation standards that prioritize precision, impartiality, and openness to maintain the integrity of media content.

References


ANALYSING THE ALLOGRAPHIC NOTES IN THE TURKISH TRANSLATION OF AN ECOLOGICAL WORK: SILENT SPRING

Gökçen Hastürkoğlu
Atılım University, Ankara, Turkey

Abstract: Paratextual elements play a crucial role in original and translated works, serving as a bridge between the creators and the recipients of the works. Analysing these elements can provide a deeper understanding of the motives of the authors, publishers, and translators. This study aims to investigate the allographic notes, specifically the translator’s notes, in the Turkish translation of Silent Spring, a work that raises awareness about environmental impacts of DDT on ecology. The study also seeks to reveal, in such an ecological context, the translator’s approach and motives in using footnotes categorized as factual and interpretive notes and their functions. The qualitative analysis indicates that the factual notes outnumber the interpretive notes and the main function of the translator’s notes is to provide definitional and explanatory information about the ecology-related terminology which is in line with the genre of the text and the characteristics of the target readers.

Keywords: allographic notes, footnotes, paratextual elements, translator’s note, pragmatic functions, Rachel Carson

About the author: Assoc. Prof. Gökçen Hastürkoğlu, PhD, is an associate professor doctor at the Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Department of English Translation and Interpretation, Atılım University, Ankara, Turkey. After completing her undergraduate degree at Hacettepe University, Translation and Interpretation Department, she has earned her MA in the field of English Language and Literature. She has completed her PhD in the field of English Linguistics. Her research interests are translation pedagogy, ecotranslation, cognitive linguistics, medical translation, translation of children’s literature, and translation criticism.

e-mail: gokcen.hasturkoglu@atilim.edu.tr
ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0219-7850

Copyright © 2023 Gökçen Hastürkoğlu

Article history: Received: 11 December 2023; Reviewed: 7 February 2024; Revised: 13 February 2024; Accepted: 18 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Introduction

Although paratextual elements, such as titles, subtitles, pseudonyms, forewords, dedications, epigraphs, prefaces, intertitles, footnotes, epilogues, and afterwords, have long been present in published works together with other textual elements and have served crucial communicative and pragmatic functions within texts, as Batchelor (2018) put it, it was not until the publication of Genette’s work *Seuils* (1987) (translated as *Paratexts. Thresholds of Interpretation* in 1997) that researchers began to pay attention to paratextual elements surrounding and accompanying the text. According to Genette, paratextual devices can be found both within the book (peritexts) and outside the book (epitexts) (1997, p. xviii) and in its most general sense, the paratext encompasses “what enables a text to become a book and to be offered as such to its readers and, more generally, to the public” (p. 1). It can be put forth that the paratextual components bring a work to life, facilitating the interaction between the author, translator, publisher, editor, and reader. Therefore, it is imperative to consider paratextual elements as integral parts of a work during analysis, rather than excluding them from the main body of the text.

Although Genette did not focus on translation in his work, paratextual elements within the context of translation studies have gained attention from translation researchers in recent years. As translators tend to assume the role of an author in a work, their notes can potentially serve significant functions. Thus, among the paratextual elements, analyzing the translator’s notes can provide valuable insights into the translator’s approach to the text and the reasons behind their particular translation choices.

Within this framework, this study intended to reveal the pragmatic functions of the translator’s notes in one of the most influential works, *Silent Spring* (1962), written by Rachel Carson, a renowned nature author and former marine biologist. *Silent Spring* had a profound impact not only in the United States but also worldwide, creating awareness in terms of environmental issues. The work primarily focuses on the deadly impact of human activities, particularly the use of dichlorodiphenyltrichloroethane (DDT), a persistent organic pollutant, and other dangerous chemicals on the natural environment. Carson discusses various plant and animal species, illustrating how they can be irrevocably harmed and how the world’s food supply has been contaminated. After its initial publication, *Silent Spring* was translated into numerous languages, including German (1962), French, Swedish, Danish, Dutch, Finnish, and Italian (1963), Spanish, Portuguese, and Japanese (1964), Icelandic (1965), Norwegian (1966), Slovenian (1972), Chinese (1979), Thai (1982), Korean (1995), and finally Turkish (2004). Based on this brief background, the rationale for selecting *Silent Spring* as the data of the present study can be better understood. *Silent Spring*, due to its motive and content, encompasses a wide range of ecology-
related terminology and field knowledge, while addressing environmental issues. Relatedly, as Cronin foregrounded, “eco-translation covers all forms of translation thinking and practice that knowingly engage with the challenges of human-induced environmental change” (2017, p. 2). Translating ecological works requires the self-positioning of the translator which means that the translator should act dominantly regarding the selection of the translation strategies used in the process. Therefore, this study aims to investigate the translator’s approach during the translation process of a worldwide famous ecological work, specifically his use of notes categorized as factual notes, interpretive notes, and discursive notes, and the functions of these notes, as well as their translations.

**Theoretical Background**

Translation studies have increasingly focused on the role and significance of paratextual elements in recent years. Genette (1991) posited in his study that it is rare to encounter a text in isolation, devoid of accompanying elements such as author’s name, publisher, preface, illustrations, foreword, title, and more (p. 261). As the analysis of each of them is crucial for the deeper understanding of the entire context, Genette recommended categorizing paratexts based on their position, distinguishing between peritexts that surround the main text and epitexts that lie outside its boundaries, each serving important functions concerning the text.

Paratextual elements serve significant pragmatic functions both within and outside the text. As for Genette, the pragmatic status of a paratextual element is “defined by the characteristics of its situation of communication: the nature of the sender and the addressee, the sender’s degree of authority and responsibility, the illocutionary force of the sender’s message…” (1997, p. 8). Among the various paratextual elements, notes as peritexts, assume a particularly communicative function compared to the other components. Whether they are author’s notes, translator’s notes, editorial notes, or publisher’s notes, they directly communicate with the reader shaping the reception and interpretation of the work.

The translator’s notes, which is the main issue of the present study, can be scattered throughout the text “emerging and becoming visible at specific moments during the reading of the text” (op. cit., p. 151). Translators tend to employ notes with different intentions and each note serves a variety of functions as it directly reaches the target reader. Genette broke down notes into four categories which are discursive, allographic, auctorial, and fictional, focusing on their functions. The functions of notes can be listed as providing definitions or explanations, references, supporting evidence, or additional arguments; clarifying figurative meanings; identifying quotations or translations; commenting on uncertainties or complexities; providing statements to forestall potential objections (1997, p. 326).
Building on Genette’s comments on the functions of notes, Maloney (2005) also dealt with the typology of notes based on their functions. He categorized notes into three types: factual, interpretive, and discursive, whose boundaries can sometimes overlap. Factual notes which are also considered as supporting evidence, serve the function of providing specific information to the reader. Factual notes can take on many different forms including definitional, explanatory, intertextual, and historical notes. Maloney also introduced another categorization, following Genette’s lead, based on the creator of the note. Allographic factual notes are created by writers who write something for someone else’s work such as a translator, an editor, a copy editor, a scholar, a publisher, etc., while autographic factual notes are created by authors or narrators (Maloney, 2005, pp. 28-30). The second type of notes, interpretive notes, can be written by an allographic or autographic writer to provide “a perspective, aside, or comment on an event or description in the main narrative”, and “they have a particular voice and point of view and can influence a reader’s engagement with a text to a greater degree than factual notes” (pp. 41-42). Discursive notes, the third type of footnotes, take on various forms. One is that they are closely related to the main body of the text. “This narrative might run parallel, informing the reader of an analeptic or proleptic aspect of the main narrative, diverge off on a tangential story about a particular character or plot line, or tell an entirely new story. Discursive notes can also contain authorial or narrator asides or glosses, meant to be read in dialogue with the main narrative” (pp. 48-49). Like the other two forms of footnotes, discursive notes can be created by the author, translator, publisher, or other parties involved in the production of the text.

As previously mentioned, although Genette did not specifically address the issue of paratexts within the frame of translation studies in his renowned work, there are notable scholars such as Tahir-Gürçağlar who focused on the paratextual nature of translation itself. She argued that paratexts in translation constitute an independent field of study as although paratexts in translated texts can be perceived as an integral part of the target texts, “they also have an independent existence since they stand physically separate from the translated text and are more likely to meet the reader before the translation itself” (Tahir-Gürçağlar, 2011, p. 113). According to Batchelor, paratexts are regarded “as any material additional to, appended to or external to the core text which has functions of explaining, defining, instructing, or supporting, adding background information, or the relevant opinions and attitudes of scholars, translators and reviewers” (2018, p. 27). Hermans also conducted research on paratext in the context of translation, with a specific focus on the visibility and dominance of the translator in the translated text through paratextual elements. He argued that it is through the paratextual elements that translators can “signal their agenda” (1996, p. 33).
In addition to theoretical approaches, there are some case studies analysing the translation of paratextual elements in various contexts. To name a few, Yuste Frias (2012) investigated the typographical image of the title letters in children’s literature and concluded that equivalence cannot be achieved in the translation of this paratextual element; thus, it cannot create the same effect on young readers. The study suggested that the translation of a work should not be published without its corresponding paratranslation. Tekten (2019) conducted a comparative analysis of two Turkish translations of the collected short fiction of Poe focusing on the paratextual elements, particularly the annotations used by two different translators. The study analysed the translator’s decisions and evaluated the translations within the context of Venuti’s strategies of foreignization and domestication. The findings demonstrated that investigation of paratextual elements in translated texts provides insights into the position of publishing houses, as well as the voice and identity of the translator. Shreve and Angelone (2010) identified different functions of translator’s notes, including providing cultural explanations, clarifying ambiguities, and justifying translation choices. Buendia (2013), by providing examples from the eighteenth-century and nineteenth-century Spanish translations of English novels, focused on the contextual, pragmatic, and functional features of the translator’s notes concluding that the translator’s notes have an effect on the work’s reading, interpretation and reception in the target system.

Despite the growing attention to paratextual elements in translation studies, there is still a need for further research in this area, particularly in relation to specific genres, languages, and cultural contexts. The present study aims to contribute to the existing literature by investigating the translator’s notes in terms of their categorization as factual, interpretive, and discursive, and the functions of these notes, as well as their translations in the Turkish translation of Silent Spring, a non-fiction work on environmental issues written by Rachel Carson.

Data Analysis and Results
The analysis of the data revealed that the translator’s intrusion into the text was evident through the frequent use of the translator’s notes as footnotes in the target text. This approach was observed to be different from the author’s approach, as she did not give any footnotes while writing such an informative piece of work. The author revealed her approach towards footnotes at the beginning of Silent Spring, in which the reader encounters the author’s note which is recognized as one of the most influential paratextual elements in the work. She stated:

I HAVE NOT WISHED to burden the text with footnotes but I realize that many of my readers will wish to pursue some of the subjects discussed. I have therefore
The author’s note was transferred to the Turkish version without any interruption by the translator:

Okurları dipnotlarla sıkmak istemedim, ancak çok sayıda okurun tartışılacak konuları takip etmek için daha ayrıntılı bilgi sahibi olmak isteyeciklerinin de farkındayım. Bu nedenle kitabin sonundaki eklere bölümünde yararlandığı temel bilgi kaynaklarının listesi, bölüm ve sayfalarına göre düzenlenmiş biçimde verilmiştir. (Carson, 2011)

In the author’s note section, the author explicitly mentioned her preference for providing an appendix as an additional paratextual element to assist readers in further investigating the issues discussed in the work. This aligns with Genette’s observation that the basic function of the original authorial note “is to serve as a supplement, sometimes a digression, very rarely a commentary (…) we know that many authors, rather than appear pedantic, prefer either to abstain from using notes or to limit them to a minimal apparatus of references” (1997, p. 327). Although the author chose not to write any footnotes in the original text, the translator included 134 footnotes in the target text scattered across 77 pages, which is approximately 25.92% of the translated work’s pages (excluding the references and appendix sections). These footnotes were found to be abundant, with some pages containing multiple notes. This marked difference between the original and translated texts in terms of the use of footnotes highlights how visible the translator decided to act in the translation process. The “Translator’s Notes” in the Turkish edition were abbreviated as “ÇN” (for “Çevirmenin Notu”), and the literal translations of these footnotes were provided in this study with the abbreviation “TN” (denoting “Translator’s Note).

In addition to the section of Author’s Note, the target text also includes the “Translator’s Foreword” section at the beginning of the target text. In this section, the translator, Çağatay Güler, provided information on Rachel Carson and offered comments on *Silent Spring*, primarily focusing on the significance of the work for the environment. In terms of translation, however, Güler does not provide detailed information or mention his translation strategies. He only stated “Sessiz Bahar’ın çevirisi aslında bir görevin çok geçce olsayarına getirilmesi olarak kabul edilmelidir. Gözden kaçan eksiklikler konusunda uyarlarınızrı esirgemeeyeceğinizi umuyorum.” (Carson, 2011, p. xiv) (translated literally as “The translation of *Silent Spring* should be regarded as the fulfillment of a task, albeit too late. I hope you will be kind enough to point out any shortcomings.”). Güler concluded this section by expressing his gratitude to individuals who contributed to the translation.

In terms of the type of notes used, it was found that out of 134 notes in the target text, only two of them can be categorized as interpretive notes, while the rest are...
factual notes. There were no discursive notes identified. This is thought to be due to the fact that the genre of the work is not fiction, but rather an informative text that provides factual information on ecology and the environment to the reader.

When analysing the categorization and functions of the translator’s notes in depth, it is noteworthy that the Turkish translation of *Silent Spring* is abundant in factual notes. These notes were observed to serve various purposes, such as offering definitional, explanatory, intertextual or historical information. The translator opted to include additional information such as definitional explanations or intertextual references in the translation process in order to enhance the reader’s understanding of the text more, although Carson did not act in the same way in the writing process.

One of the examples for the translator’s factual notes can be the footnote that provides a definition and description of DDT. As previously mentioned, the main focus of the work is to highlight the harmful effects of DDT; however, the author of the original text did not include any information on DDT as footnotes, while the translator chose to give the dictionary definition and additional information through the translator’s note. The footnote is as follows:

DDT: Dikloro difenil trikloretan bileşği için kullanılan kısaltma. II. Dünya savaşları sırasında ve sonrasıda yaygın kullanıma giren böcek öldürücü kimyasal. Başlangıçta çok etkili olmasına karşın zamanla böceklerde DDT ye karşı direnç gelişti. Çevrede çok uzun süre alma özelliği olduğundan kullanımı yasaklanmıştır. (ÇN) (p. 18). (literal translation: “Abbreviation used for Dichloro Diphenyl Trichloroethane compound. An insecticidal chemical that came into use commonly during and after World War II. Although it was very effective at the beginning, insects developed resistance to DDT in time. Its use was prohibited due to its ability to stay too long in the environment. (TN)”).

A different set of examples can be found among those for which the translator may have assumed that the target reader is unfamiliar with, as evident in the footnote provided for the term “kızılağaç” (p. 69). The note says: “sweet fern: Eğreltiye benzeyen hoş kokulu yaprakları olan Amerika çalısı (ÇN)” (literal translation: “American shrub with fragrant fern-like leaves (TN)”). Similarly, the footnote for the term “mum mersini” (p. 69) is as follows: “bayberry, wax myrtle: Minika, mum mersini, bir tür mersin ağacı (ÇN)” (literally translated as “Minika, candle myrtle, a type of myrtle tree (TN)”). These examples suggest that, in accordance with the genre of the text, there are many terms in the original text that may not be commonly known to Turkish speakers, prompting the translator to include both the definition of the term and its English and Latin equivalents.

It should also be noted that the footnotes are not always for the terms which are foreign to the target culture. It was found out that the translator tended to
provide a note even for a term which is frequently and commonly used in the target language. In one of the instances, the translator provided a translator’s note for the term “organik”, “organic” in English and wrote a footnote “organic: Organik bitki ya da hayvan. Canlılarla ilgili” (p. 18) (literal translation: “organic: Organic plant or animal. Related to living things (TN”)”). As it can be observed, the translator wrote the Turkish term initially, and then gave the dictionary definition of the term. Another example can be the footnote for the term “mutasyon” that can also be regarded as unnecessary, and contrary to the approach of the original author. The translator, in his note, wrote the Turkish term and then the dictionary definition of it and lastly, presented additional information on the term. He noted:

mutasyon: Genlerde kendiliğinden ya da ışın kimyasal maddeler vb. etkilerle ortaya çıkan herhangi bir değişiklik, DeVries bu türlerde birden bire çıkan değişiklikler için kullanmıştır. (ÇN).” (literal translation: “mutation: Any change in genes that occurs spontaneously or as a result of radiation, chemicals, etc., DeVries used it to refer to sudden changes in species (TN)”)

Additionally, the translator included factual notes that consisted of dictionary definition of terms accompanied by the Latin version in parenthesis or without parenthesis. For instance, when describing the term “rakun” (raccoon in English), the translator provided a footnote:

rakun: Tilkiden biraz büyük, ayyıa benzezen, alaca halkalı bir kuyruğu olan ve ağaçta yaşayan bir Kuzey Amerika hayvanı (Procyon lotor (ÇN)” (p. 46) (literal translation: “raccoon: A North American animal that is slightly larger than a fox, looks like a bear, has a pied ringed tail, and lives in trees (Procyon lotor) (TN)”)

This demonstrates that the translator’s presence in the translation process is frequently evident, even for concepts related to ecology that are known to the reader. While these notes serve the purpose of providing definitions and additional information, it is important to acknowledge that footnotes can be distracting for the reader. Although the author of the original text decided to avoid burdening the text with footnotes, the translator adopted the opposite approach and overlooked the potentially distracting nature of footnotes mentioned here.

It can also be observed that the translator sometimes employed morphological analysis of the ecology-related terms while providing the English version followed by the definition as evident in the examples of “böcek öldürücü”, and “canlı öldürücü” (p. 7). For the former, he wrote “’insecticide’; ‘insect’ (böcek, haşare) + cide (öldüren). (ÇN)” (literal translation: “’insecticide’; ‘insect’ (insect, pest) + cide (to kill). (TN)”), and for the latter, “’biocide’; bio (canlı, hayat) + cide (öldüren). (ÇN)” (literal translation: “’biocide’; bio (alive, life) + cide (kill) (TN)”

Interestingly, in some parts, the translator only provided the English version of the term as a footnote without giving any explanation, such as the translator’s note of “Soil Bank” (p. 9) for “Toprak Bankası” in the translated text (literal translation: “Soil Bank”). Another example can be the footnote of “The Ecology of Invasions” (p. 10) for “İstilaların Ekolojisi” (literal translation: “The Ecology of Invasions”).

The translator sometimes gave historical factual notes to the readers such as the note for “Borjiyalar” (p. 17). He wrote:

Borgia ailesi: Roma Katolik Kilisesine 11 kardinal, üç papa, bir İngiliz Kraliçesi, bir Aziz veren kökenini 14. yy İspanya’sından alan; 15. ve 16. yy larda İtalya, İspanya ve Fransa tarihinde önemli etkiler yapmış bir aile (…). (ÇN)” (literal translation: “The Borgia family: A family with origins in 14th century Spain, which gave the Roman Catholic Church 11 cardinals, three popes, an English Queen and a saint, and had a significant impact on the history of Italy, Spain and France in the 15th and 16th centuries. (...) (TN)”).

As observed, the translator provided historical information about the Borgia family through a footnote, although the source text author did not feel the need to give information on Borgias to the source text reader.

In terms of the interpretive notes, as Buendia stated, through interpretive notes, the translator does not only say something, but he or she does something.

The main characteristic of discursive notes is that the translator does not only ‘say something’, but also comments on something and expresses an opinion about it, that is to say, ‘do something’. It is their illocutionary force that creates this difference between saying and doing; the communicative intention of these paratextual messages is not restricted to providing verifiable information as they also express a particular judgement and/or attitude. In using these notes, the translator is purposefully guiding the interpretation of the text and accords it with a socially acceptable meaning (p. 159).

When the data was analysed, it was revealed that there are only two interpretive notes in the target text through which the translator had the chance to comment on the issue. The first example is the footnote provided for interpreting Darwin’s principle of the survival of the fittest (p. 7). This principle was translated as “en uyumlu durumda bulunan soyunu sürdürür ilkesi” (p. 8) and despite the nonexistence of a note in the source text, the target text included a footnote as follows:

Darwin’in bu ilkesi çoğu kez yanlış anlaşılır. Burada ortama uyum sağlaymanın seçilmesi söz konusu değildir. Ortamın koşullarına en uygun olanın seçilmesidir. Sadece yüksek dallardaki yapraklardan başka yiyecek yoksa ancak buraya uzanabilecek boyda olan yerdeki canlı beslenebildiğinden yaşamaktadır. (…) (ÇN) (literal translation: “This principle of Darwin is often misunderstood. Here, the question is not of selecting those who are adapted to the environment. It is the
selection of the one best suited to the conditions of the environment. If there is no food other than the leaves on high branches, only the creature on the ground that is tall enough to reach there can feed and survive (…) (TN)\textsuperscript{15}).

The second example for interpretive notes is the footnote provided for the sentence: “To the question ‘But doesn’t the government protect us from such things?’ the answer is, ‘Only to a limited extent’” (p. 180) which was translated as “‘Fakat devlet bizi bu tip şeylerden korumaz mı?’ sorusuna cevap ‘sadece belli bir sınırına kadar’ dır” (p. 181). The footnote in the target text is as follows:

Aslında sigara, bitkisel hormonlar vb gibi maddelerin tehlikesinden söz edenlere karşı çıkarken ‘bu kadar tehlikeli olsa hükümet bunun satışına izin verir mi?’ yaklaşımının bir diğer örneği (ÇN)”. (literal translation: “In fact, while opposing those who talk about the danger of substances such as cigarettes, herbal hormones, etc., it is another example of the ‘if it were so dangerous, would the government allow its sale?’ approach (TN)\textsuperscript{16}).

As it can be inferred from the two interpretive notes from the Silent Spring, the function of such notes is to comment on the concept, or to provide a point of view, rather than giving referential or dictionary definitions.

**Conclusion**

In a translated text, paratextual elements, some of the most significant of which are notes, play a crucial role. Notes in a translated work serve various functions similar to those in source texts, such as providing factual information, offering additional information, explaining particular words or terminologies, referencing, or presenting opinions. These notes help readers to deeply understand the text, and analysing them in the translated text helps reveal the approach and intention of the translator in the translation process. Translators’ notes, often in the form of footnotes, allow translators’ voice to be heard as they directly communicate with the reader, making their presence visible to the reader while fulfilling crucial functions. Within this framework, this study intended to analyse these allographic notes in the Turkish translation of Silent Spring, for the sake of revealing, in such an ecological context, the translator’s approach and motives in using footnotes categorized as factual and interpretive and their functions.

Taking into account the fact that the function of translator’s notes may vary depending on the genre and characteristics of the target audience, it was found out that as the data analysed is not a work of fiction, but an informative text type, the main function of the translator’s notes is to provide objective information or explanations to help readers thoroughly grasp the topic, rather than present subjective comments or interpretations.
The study also revealed that while the author of the source text did not feel the need to provide explanations for some of the linguistic items, especially ecological terminology, the translator, on the other hand, felt the need to give such definitions or explanations. This highlights the fact that the source text author and the translator may have different perceptions of the target reader: the former may have assumed that the addressee already possesses ecological background knowledge, while the latter may have believed that the target reader may lack such background information. The approach of the translator resulted in his visible stance in the target text as he presented detailed information on the content whether necessary or not. Thus, it can be asserted that the author and the translator were revealed to adopt different approaches towards the text: while the author of the original text opted for writing the text without footnotes considering their interruptive nature, the translator assumed the role of an author in a sense and produced a text full of footnotes, taking the risk of creating a less fluent text for the target reader.

References


OPTIONS FOR SUBTITLING ENGLISH MOVIE LYRICS INTO ARABIC

Sundus Hassan¹, Ahmad S Haider¹,²

¹,²Department of English Language and Translation, Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan

MEU Research Unit, Middle East University, Amman, Jordan

Abstract: Subtitling lyrics poses a problem regarding conveying the content and the form, which include meaning, rhyme, rhythm, and other musical features. This requires having well-trained professional translators to master the rendering of those features in the target language, bearing in mind the constraints imposed by subtitling as an audio-visual mode. This study examines the Arabic subtitled version of English movie lyrics and explores the translator’s options in rendering their content and form. To this end, sixteen lyrics were extracted from five movies that have been subtitled. The compiled lyrics were classified into different categories based on the translation options proposed by Franzon (2008). The option of “translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration” was used 11 times, while the option of “aesthetic translation” was opted for four times. “Not translating the lyric” was used only once, while the option of “creating new lyrics for the music” was not adopted in any of the five movies. The study recommends two research areas: exploring dubbed Arabic versions of English movie lyrics and analyzing subtitled lyrics in other language pairs.

Keywords: Audio-visual Translation (AVT), Lyrics, Subtitling, Arabic-English

About the author: Sundus Hassan is an MA holder in Audiovisual and Mass Media Translation at the Applied Science Private University. Her main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, and translation studies.

e-mail: sundushassan6@gmail.com

ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0009-0007-4052-1758

About the author: Ahmad S Haider is an associate professor in the Department of English Language and Translation at the Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan. He received his Ph.D. in Linguistics from the University of Canterbury/ New Zealand. His current research focuses on how political events are socially, discursively, and linguistically represented in media, combining Corpus Linguistics and (Critical) Discourse Analysis. His main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, and translation studies.

e-mail: a_haidar@asu.edu.jo

ORCID iD: http://orcid.org/0000-0002-7763-201X

Copyright © 2024 Sundus Hassan, Ahmad S Haider

Article history: Received: 2 December 2023; Reviewed: 21 February 2024; Revised: 7 March 2024; Accepted: 8 March 2024; Published: 15 April 2024

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.


1. This research received grant no. (51/2023) from the Arab Observatory for Translation (an affiliate of ALECSO), which is supported by the Literature, Publishing & Translation Commission in Saudi Arabia.
Introduction

According to Chiaro (2012), audio-visual translation (AVT) is the process of translating the verbal elements of audio-visual works and products from one language (the source language) to another. AVT differs from other forms of translation as it is experienced simultaneously through watching and listening rather than being read separately from the source text. Dubbing and subtitling are the most popular branches of AVT (Alrousan & Haider, 2022; Debbas & Haider, 2020). Dubbing involves replacing the dialogue, making the characters appear to speak the target language (Chiaro, 2012). Contrarily, subtitling involves converting the spoken mode of AV products into written captions, typically presented at the bottom of the screen (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007).

Not many people conduct studies on the translation of lyrics. In contrast to other genres of translation, Low (2005) asserted that interpreting songs presents-particular demands. To successfully translate songs the translator must understand and consider musical elements such as rhyme, rhythm, note value, harmony, duration, and phrasing.

In this study, 16 English-to-Arabic song lyrics are examined. Translation challenges arise when attempting to express the meaning and structure of lyrics, which fall under the literary genre umbrella and include many musical aspects. In addition, the Arabic language increases the complexity when considering the poem’s poetic elements, such as rhythm, rhyme, alliteration, and so on.

For those characteristics to be rendered correctly in the target language, it is necessary to have highly qualified professional translators. Additionally, the representation of those elements in Arabic and English is incongruent, which adds to the difficulties and responsibilities faced by translators. In the field of translation studies, lyrics translation is not an often-studied topic. According to many researchers (Admiati & Hartono, 2019; Åkerström, 2010; Gritsenko & Aleshinskaya, 2016; Reus, 2020), lyrics translated from English into Russian, Swedish, Dutch, and Indonesian were all of high quality. An area that needs more exploration is the translation of Arabic lyrics from English.

The present study investigates the subtitled versions of 16 lyrics of five Netflix movies through addressing the following question:

*What are the subtitling options used in rendering the content and form of movie lyrics from English into Arabic?*
Review of Related Literature

Theoretical Framework
The history of AVT started in the twenty-first century when television, DVDs, and media became more popular (Al-Abbas & Haider, 2023; AlBkowr & Haider, 2023; Jarrah et al., 2023; Saideen et al., 2024). This increased the demand for audio-visual translation. Cinema, opera, theater, and other live events required translation services, especially when channels and networks became national and international and more languages were involved (Díaz-Cintas & Anderman, 2008).

AVT can be applied to many genres including entertainment such as films and music. Susam-Sarajeva (2008) argued that the place music has in everyday life resulted in interest in the study of lyric translation. A lyric, according to Gioia (2005, p. 10), is “a short poem that expresses thoughts and feelings of a single speaker.” The connection between movies and lyrics is that both carry the same entertainment mission. Similarly, Greenall et al. (2021, p. 16) described lyrics as “words bound to a piece of music in a song.”

Salmon (2010) reported that a good translator must pay attention to the musical background and save the poetic features of a lyric, including melody, rhyme, and rhythm. Considering that songs and lyrics are part of poetry, Low (2003) pointed out that to translate a poem, one should observe the purpose of the translation. He argued that people previously assumed that since poetry is presented in written form so would the translation. However, this is not applicable all the time. Furthermore, translated poems cannot replicate all features of the original, neither in form nor content. In addition to the general challenges of translating lyrics and poetry, film lyric translation is further complicated by context. The translator must, therefore, consider the effects of the lyrics on the plot.

Another musical principle to be considered is singability, which must be applied to ensure the final musical product’s modeling and sense of musical harmony. Many scholars agree with this principle and argue that using musical features will achieve a worthy translation of lyrics and singability (Franzon, 2008; Khoshsaligheh & Ameri, 2016). In the current paper, the 16 compiled lyrics are considered a singable part of a movie, highlighting the need to translate such content carefully.

Empirical Studies on Movie Lyrics Translation
As mentioned in the previous section, the translation of lyrics is included under the umbrella of literary works containing songs and poetry. This section brings to light some remarks which characterize the translation of songs and poetry. The increasing demand for translating audio-visual materials led to an
increase in demand for lyric translation. Therefore, studies on subtitling lyrics became more popular. This section sheds light on some empirical studies in this domain.

In the context of film lyrics translation, Penilaras (2016) investigated the subtitled lyrics of *The Princess and the Frog*. The study identified six techniques for translating song lyrics: literal, modulation, reduction, establishing equivalent, borrowing, and generalizing. Additionally, Iitola (2017) investigated how musical characteristics, such as rhythm, rhymes, naturalness, and linguistic quality, were translated in *Frozen (Frosty Adventure)*. In addition, the research also compared the singability of two subtitles of the same lyrics. The analysis showed that the Blu-Ray subtitles were largely singable while the television subtitles were only partially singable. The results indicated that the dubbed rendition was more singable but less faithful in meaning.

In the same vein, León Alonso (2019) analyzed both English and Spanish versions of selected songs from Disney animation films based on translation techniques, syllabic structures, emphasis, rhyme, and methods that can be applied to song translation. The study concluded that discursive creation and functional equivalence are the most common techniques in translating selected songs. The reason behind using such techniques more than literal translation is that they contribute to reaching the desired naturalness in the target language and make adapting the original song’s rhythm easier. In addition, literal translation was also used in cases of accurate rendering of meaning, syllabic structure, and consistency. The aforementioned studies tackled the translation of songs based on translation techniques. However, Abu-Rayyash and Haider (2023) conducted their analysis based on song translation options, following Franzon’s (2008) song translation options. They concluded that Netflix’s subtitles used four options to translate English lyrics into Arabic. These include neglecting the music in translating the lyrics (literal subtitling), which was used 60% of the time, not translating the lyrics (deletion), which was seen in 17% of the cases, and adapting the translation to the music (aesthetic subtitling), which was used in (8%) of the times. The researchers also found an additional option combining the three above-mentioned options, namely (blended subtitling) which was observed 15% of the time.

Additionally, Saperi et al. (2022) investigated language and cultural similarities of the English subtitles of a song lyric, namely “Keris Sakti,” which was extracted from the animated Netflix movie *Upin & Ipin: The Lone Gibbon Kris*, and translated from Malay. They applied a qualitative descriptive method to analyze and compare the data. The researchers found that the translation holds many inaccuracies due to the cultural differences between the two languages. They also found that the role of translators is to preserve the meaning intended
underlying the songs, ensuring that no misinterpretation and misunderstanding occur among target language audiences.

Methodology

In this section, the researchers discuss the corpus of the study and the procedures followed in data collection and analysis. A parallel corpus of 16 lyrics retrieved from five English movies subtitled into Arabic by Netflix was compiled.

Source of Subtitles

For the sake of consistency, the selected movies were subtitled by Netflix translators. Netflix is the most popular platform in the Arab world (Abu-Rayyash et al., 2023). Netflix is a subscription-based platform that allows subscribers to watch TV shows and movies without commercials on an internet-connected device (Al-Abbas & Haider, 2021). It provides access to best-in-class series, documentaries, feature films, and movies. Netflix allows members to watch whatever they like anytime and without ads. What makes Netflix the best choice to extract data for this study is that it streams more than 30 languages and provides a subtitled version of most of the films it produces.

Corpus of the Study

For the purpose of this study, the researchers selected five movies, as shown in Table 1. For the movie to be included in the corpus, it needs to meet the following criteria: it (1) should be subtitled by Netflix, (2) should contain lyrics, (3) should have a high IMDB rating, and (4) all should have 7+ maturity rating.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Movie</th>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>Production Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>Animated musical film</td>
<td>2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>Computer-Animated Musical Comedy Film</td>
<td>2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>Musical film</td>
<td>2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>Computer-animated family comedy film</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>Computer-animated family comedy film</td>
<td>2022</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 shows the names of movies selected with their genre and production year.
Sixteen lyrics were found in the selected five movies. Table 2 shows the titles of the lyrics and the movie from where they were retrieved.

**Table 2. The Investigated Lyrics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Movie</th>
<th>Lyrics Number</th>
<th>Lyric Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Change’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mooncakes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Fly Away</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Rocket</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Keep the Beat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Vivo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>It’s Not Too Late</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>One More Song</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Wait until you’re opportunity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Lame set place on earth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Fiver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Dinga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>The Dark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Apart from you</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The subtitled versions of the movies were extracted directly from Netflix. After downloading the subtitles, the researchers saved them as an Aegisub file. The lyrics lines are then copy-pasted and aligned on an Excel sheet to ease the process of analysis. After the data was retrieved, the English script was aligned with the Arabic subtitled versions. The English and Arabic data were copy-pasted onto an Excel sheet. Each lyric was saved in a sheet with two columns. The first column includes the English source text, while the second column contains the Arabic subtitled target text.

**Study Procedures**

The processes followed in this study are as follows:

1. Writing the research questions: one research question was addressed.
2. Selecting the movies that contain lyrics to be investigated: 16 lyrics were selected from 5 movies.
3. Extracting the subtitled version directly from Netflix.
4. Examining the subtitled movie lyrics based on the translation options used.
5. Conducting a critical analysis of the data based on the previous literature.
Analysis and Findings

The translation of lyrics differs categorically from other types of translation, given that lyrics are considered literary works with poetic features. Therefore, subtitlers should give considerable attention to the musicality of lyrics while taking into account both form and content. This section is dedicated to providing a quantitative and qualitative analysis of the compiled parallel corpus of lyrics based on Franzon (2008) model.

Quantitative Analysis

For the purpose of this study, the compiled 16 lyrics were classified into different categories based on the translation options proposed by Franzon (2008). These are leaving the song untranslated, translating the lyrics but not taking the music into account, writing new lyrics to the original music, translating lyrics and adapting music accordingly, and finally adapting the translation to the original music. Table 3 shows the subtitling options for the 16 investigated lyrics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movie</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Lyric Title</th>
<th>Subtitling Option</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Change's</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mooncakes</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Fly Away</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Rocket</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Keep the Beat</td>
<td>Adapting the translation to the original music (Aesthetic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>Adapting the translation to the original music (Aesthetic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>It’s Not Too Late</td>
<td>Adapting the translation to the original music (Aesthetic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>One More Song</td>
<td>Adapting the translation to the original music (Aesthetic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Translating the lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Wait until you're</td>
<td>Translating the lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Opportunity</td>
<td>Translating the lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Lame set place on earth</td>
<td>Translating the lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to the classification of lyrics outlined in Table 3, the researchers counted the number of times each option was used, as Table 4 shows.

### Table 4. Frequency of translation options used in the investigated movies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation Option</th>
<th>Movie</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not Translating the lyrics</td>
<td>Over the Moon</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideraiton</td>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translating lyrics and adapting music accordingly</td>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adapting the translation to the original music (Aesthetic Translation)</td>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing new lyrics to the original music</td>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on the frequency count of translation options in Table 4, it can be noticed that only some of the options were used. For example, the options of *creating new lyrics for the music* and *translating lyrics and adapting music accordingly* were not adopted in any of the five movies.

**Qualitative Analysis**

As an AVT mode, subtitling is considered the most popular method in translating movies. According to Gottlieb (1992), subtitling constraints can be divided into formal or quantitative and textual or qualitative. The formal constraints are imposed on the subtitlers by the visual context of the film, but the textual are space- and time-related factors. Aminoroaya and Amirian (2016), on the other hand, discussed song translation constraints, including those of rhyme, rhythm, and image. Therefore, when dealing with subtitling constraints in addition to song translation constraints, it would be challenging for the subtitler to choose the suitable translation option when translating lyrics. This section discusses the options used by Netflix subtitlers in rendering the compiled lyrics.

**Not translating the lyrics (Deletion)**

Rendering lyrics from one language to another needs more skills than rendering other genres. Table 5 shows the number of times the option “Not translating the lyrics” was used in the subtitled versions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation Option</th>
<th>Movie</th>
<th>Subtitling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not translating the lyrics</td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows that the option of deleting the lyrics was used once. This suggests that Netflix aims to convey all aspects of the source text to provide viewers with the most understanding. *Not translating the lyrics* in subtitling a musical movie is not a recommended option to use. According to Garwood (2006, p. 93), lyrics are “narrational devices,” meaning that they significantly affect the plot, especially when carrying vital information regarding the characters or events. Aleksandrowicz (2019, p. 175) argued that “this option is applied mostly in subtitles when the translator prioritizes the content over the form,” which means that Netflix tends to provide the viewer the ability to understand the entire movie. Hence, the primary purpose of subtitling a movie is to reflect all aspects contained in the original language. Table 6 is an example of subtitling a lyric in a non-musical movie.
Table 6. Subtitling the English lyric “Fever” into English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Original Text</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>now, who got the fever for the flavor</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>who can dig the way that I flex on a track</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>I’m causin’ rampage,</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ricky Rick on point</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>with the 9-5 m style from my lips</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>They’ll be rollin’ the mad joints</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>A disco lick that’s deeper’</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Cause we got to get with the fever,</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>fever,</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>fever,</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Fever</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Secret Life of Pets follows a dog named Max whose life changes when his owner gets another pet dog, Duke. The song “Fever” appears in a scene where Max tries to trick Duke into misbehaving.

The lyric is written with an African English accent that compliments Max’s walk and feeling of pride. The lyric itself does not hold any essential information; in fact, there is a small conversation between Max and his friend in the middle of the lyric.

As shown in Table 6, the option “Not translating the lyrics” was used in this non-musical movie. This genre does not hold any conversation in the lyric itself. Considering that the lyric does not add any crucial information that affects the film plot, not subtitling the lyrics is acceptable, i.e., the main aim of subtitled movies is to provide the viewer with a complete understanding of the movie with a smooth, neat translation flow.

Translating Lyrics without taking the music into consideration (Literal Subtitling)

Bogucki (2004) argued that screen translators, i.e., subtitlers, are restricted by temporal, spatial, and other constraints, which make them narrow down the range of possible equivalents and translation strategies to the absolute minimum. In addition to these constraints, the type of translated materials may affect the process of subtitling. For example, Aminoroaya and Amirian (2016, p. 49) stated that “songs which appear in movies are an interdependence of words, music, and image. Each of these elements creates several constraints for translating a song”. Therefore, many subtitlers decide to stay on the safe side in translating movie lyrics and neglect the music by providing a literal translation.
Table 7 shows the number of times this option (literal translation) was used in the compiled corpus.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation Option</th>
<th>Movie</th>
<th>Subtitling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
<td>Over The Moon</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13: The Musical</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Secret Life of Pets</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverdance</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vivo</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 shows that the option of literal translation is used in subtitling all the lyrics in the movies *Over The Moon* and *13: The Musical*. These two movies are considered musicals, which contain plenty of lyrics that may affect the plot and contribute to the scenario. However, Netflix subtitlers did not use this option in *Vivo*, which is also considered a musical movie. Table 8 shows an example of Netflix subtitling of the lyric “*Mooncakes*” extracted from the musical movie “*Over the Moon***.”

Table 8. Subtitling the English lyric “*Mooncakes*” into Arabic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Original Text</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
<th>Back Translation</th>
<th>Translation option</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>♪ Stuff! Roll! Press! Smack! ♪</td>
<td>نجع أشياء</td>
<td>Stuff and knead</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>♪ Stuff! Roll! Press! Smack! ♪</td>
<td>.....</td>
<td>.....</td>
<td>Not translating the lyrics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>♪ Sift the flour, let the eggs crack ♪</td>
<td>أمور جمع فض ألوى حب</td>
<td>Sift this and add eggs</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>♪ Knead the dough on every hour ♪</td>
<td>أمور نجع سواس لوك</td>
<td>Knead always and every hour</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>♪ Then we start it all again ♪</td>
<td>لدي نحن نحن نحن أبدا سراي</td>
<td>We work perfectly</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>♪ Stuff! Roll! Press! Smack! ♪</td>
<td>نجع أشياء</td>
<td>Stuff and knead</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>♪ Stuff! Roll! Press! Smack! ♪</td>
<td>.....</td>
<td>.....</td>
<td>Not translating the lyrics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>♪ Form the dough around the filling ♪</td>
<td>نجع الدقيق يطغي نبضها</td>
<td>The dough covers the filling</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>♪ Brush with egg, and please no spilling ♪</td>
<td>نبضها نسيج، ضيبي يطغي</td>
<td>Cover it with eggs, this is important</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>♪ What a lovely gift they are ♪</td>
<td>زعم، يدهم فيآسنا</td>
<td>A gift to your dearest person</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Original Text</td>
<td>Subtitled Version</td>
<td>Back Translation</td>
<td>Translation option</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>♪ And there’s tradition In these Mooncakes ♪</td>
<td>لولح ورقنا اهنج عن</td>
<td>And we need the mooncakes</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>♪ And we make everyone with care ♪</td>
<td>بحلا للكب قرام تبالاو</td>
<td>With love and care</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>♪ Then we bake them Full of fondness, sweetness ♪</td>
<td>اهذب جنو، قدوپب، امود</td>
<td>We always bake it with sweetness</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>♪ Wafting through the air ♪</td>
<td>لفك يف اميا ألا</td>
<td>All days</td>
<td>Writing new lyrics to the Original Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>♪ And there is magic in these Mooncakes ♪</td>
<td>اهذن وروت يالات مت أرحى</td>
<td>then it will be filled with magic</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>♪ You can feel it all around ♪</td>
<td>يف هسمن اروچا</td>
<td>We touch around us</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>♪ Mooncakes, where the magic is found ♪</td>
<td>رمقلا يولح یوجت اپاریسیا</td>
<td>Mooncakes hold secrets</td>
<td>Writing new lyrics to original music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>♪ We need five more ♪</td>
<td>5دیرا</td>
<td>I want 5</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>♪ Or maybe twelve Because I’ve got the cousins coming ♪</td>
<td>ینیطع 6نال مفسد يفویص</td>
<td>Give me twelve because my guests are six</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>♪ And you know just how they are ♪</td>
<td>نویئایچ مه امیرال</td>
<td>They come for joy</td>
<td>Writing new lyrics to the Original music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>♪ They love these cakes ♪</td>
<td>کویریو امیرال</td>
<td>And mooncakes</td>
<td>Writing lyrics to the original music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>♪ So I think! You better give me twenty more ♪</td>
<td>لضفألا نم انيطعت نأ</td>
<td>It’s better to give us twenty</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>♪ Each one holds a message From the moon above ♪</td>
<td>یوجت کلارس کهیچا و</td>
<td>There is a message in it that you need</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>♪ “Cherish life and everything you love” ♪</td>
<td>دعسینلف بحلا</td>
<td>Let’s have love and life</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>♪ Magic in these Mooncakes ♪</td>
<td>رمقلا یولح ایجوت</td>
<td>Mooncakes have</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>♪ Magic in these Mooncakes ♪</td>
<td>رمقلا یولح ایجوت</td>
<td>Mooncakes have</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>♪ Hidden in these Mooncakes for you ♪</td>
<td>لصاح ارحس هنم للل امیسیس</td>
<td>Magic for you</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

_over the moon is a musical movie that contains a high number of lyrics. characters speak for themselves by singing and sharing their ideas through_
music. Therefore, the subtitler should be cautious in choosing the option to translate these lyrics.

Table 8 shows that the subtitles of the lyrics for “Mooncakes” used the option of Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration in rendering 20 out of 27 lines. The Netflix subtitler rendered the original text literally without taking into consideration any musical elements; there is no rhyme or rhythm in the target text. In contrast, when compared with the original, the target text is more concise and to the point. Considering subtitling constraints, choosing a literal translation approach seems more appropriate. However, this limits other qualities in the translation. For more clarification, consider line one in Table 10. The original text contains four words, “stiff, Roll, Press, and Smack,” which were rendered into two words, namely “stuff and knead.” The subtitlers condensed the words “roll” and “press” into one word, “knead,” a literal, yet more concise translation. Likewise, line three, “Sift the flour, let the eggs crack,” which rhymed with line one, was translated into “Sift this and add eggs,” without taking into account the musical elements included in the ST.

Other examples are found in lines eight and nine, which have both rhyme and rhythm, which were entirely ignored in the literal translation. Lines 25 and 26 also contain prosody, another musical aspect Franzon (2015) recommended considering. Prosody is the melodic quality of sentences in music. This aspect was lost alongside rhyme and rhythm in the literal renditions. Supardi and Putri (2018, p. 13) stated that “in literal translation, the SL is translated literally and focuses on the form and structure.” Therefore, literal translation is not the ideal option for musical films. Despite adequately maintaining the content, many stylistic features are lost.

Another example to be analyzed is the lyric “That Dark,” retrieved from the movie Riverdance. Table 9 shows the subtitling of the lyric “The Dark” with back translation and the option used in each line.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Original Text</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
<th>Back Translation</th>
<th>Translation Option</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Where the river foams ♪</td>
<td>⣽Where the river foams</td>
<td>⣽Where the river foams</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>And surges to the sea ♪</td>
<td>⣽And sea crashes</td>
<td>⣽And sea crashes</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Silver figures rise ♪</td>
<td>⣽Silver objects appear</td>
<td>⣽Silver objects appear</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>To find me ♪</td>
<td>⣽To find me</td>
<td>⣽To find me</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Riverdance is an animated movie about a boy and a girl traveling to a fantasy world and learning to appreciate life through dancing. The movie is not considered a musical movie. However, it contains plenty of music and dancing. The lyrics contained in the movie are meant to provide joy and render a sense of peace and happiness. They have no dialogue and do not affect the film plot directly.

Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration is a preferable option for translators. The two examples above show that the first used “concise literal translation” without considering musical elements such as rhyme, rhythm, or prosody. On the other hand, the second example extracted from the movie River Dance used “Literal Translation” without shortening any words. The analysis suggests that employing this option in Over the Moon did not affect the overall meaning but did not reflect the musical aspects of the genre.

Adapting the translation to original music (Aesthetic Translation)

According to Franzon (2008), if the music must be performed as originally initiated, it must be the translator who modifies the verbal rendering by approximating more loosely, by paraphrasing, or by deleting from and adding to the content of the source lyrics. In other words, this option may be the most viable to preserve the musical elements of songs. Here, the translator in this option tries to provide an aesthetic translation of the original lyric, not only by maintaining the meaning but also by adjusting the translation to suit the music.

From the subtitled versions of the collected data, the researchers found that only one movie adopted this translation option in subtitling the lyrics. Table 10 discusses the lyric “Keep the Beat” extracted from Vivo.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Original Text</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
<th>Back Translation</th>
<th>Translation Option</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>♪ The plan was get to a bus ♪</td>
<td>بولد للر، قللمجا، أنف طخ</td>
<td>To ride the bus we planned</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>♪ Next thing you know, the two of us ♪</td>
<td>نحن اهو، اندحو نان ثالا</td>
<td>There we are both of us alone</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>♪ Are floating, drifting somewhere new ♪</td>
<td>وفطن، كأا فرِجنن، إدي دج ناثلم</td>
<td>Floating and drifting somewhere new</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>♪ She said we’d take a shortcut ♪</td>
<td>اننإ تلاق، كلسنس، اًقيرط، اًرصتخم</td>
<td>She said we are going to take a short cut</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>♪ I’m trying to be a good sport, but ♪</td>
<td>نأ لواح، رمألا، لبِقت أ، منإو</td>
<td>Am trying to accept this but,</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>♪ I don’t see how we make it through ♪</td>
<td>فيك مهفا، ال، اح جنس</td>
<td>I don’t understand how are we going to make it</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>♪ Remember the size of the world before ♪</td>
<td>ميج راكد، نم ملاغلا، السبوق</td>
<td>I remember the size of the world was before</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>♪ It was you and I, just you and I ♪</td>
<td>تنأو انأ انك، اندحو</td>
<td>It was you and I alone</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>♪ And now the horizon holds so much more ♪</td>
<td>قفأا، نآلو، لبِقت سلما، اللام، ادل، لجاي، اقر شك</td>
<td>And know, the future horizon holds many hopes</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>♪ It’s either we succeed or we die ♪</td>
<td>امو جحنن، نأ، امو جحنن نأ، امو</td>
<td>It’s either we succeed or we die</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>♪ Yeah, it’s either or ♪</td>
<td>وا حجنن، لج، امو جحنن، نأ، امو</td>
<td>Yes, succeed or die</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>♪ All I can do when the road bends ♪</td>
<td>ين نكمي، ام، إرك، إم، هيل عف، ابل بظملا</td>
<td>All I can do to face road bends</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>♪ Is lean into the curve ♪</td>
<td>ليماذا، وه، هنم</td>
<td>Is to curve with it</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>♪ And all I can do When the tank’s run dry ♪</td>
<td>ين نكمي، إم، إرك، إم، هيل عف، نبج، هرهف، دفن، إبل لاقاطلا</td>
<td>All I can do when the power is done</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>♪ Is see what’s in reserve ♪</td>
<td>نيبيماذا، وه، نيبيماذا ينيرظت نيعا، وه</td>
<td>Is to know what waits for me</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Original Text</td>
<td>Subtitled Version</td>
<td>Back Translation</td>
<td>Translation Option</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>♪ And all I can do When the plans break down ♪</td>
<td>يننكمي ام لك نيح هلعف لشفت اتاططخيا</td>
<td>All I can do when the plans fail</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>♪ Is stay on my feet ♪</td>
<td>ادمصا نا وه</td>
<td>Is to survive</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>♪ And all I can do at the end of the day is play on ♪</td>
<td>ام لكو يننكمي يف هلعف فاططخ اتياهن رباشا نا وه</td>
<td>All I can do at the end of the journey is to persist</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>♪ Play on and keep the beat ♪</td>
<td>ارباشا عقي إلابو رمت سيا</td>
<td>Persist and the beat I keep</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>♪ I am here Just on another shore ♪</td>
<td>ندلا لوه انا نلحاك كعل</td>
<td>I am him, but on another shore</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>♪ Always in your corner ♪</td>
<td>اللعاب انميا</td>
<td>Always with you</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>♪ Watching you soar ♪</td>
<td>المات انققلات</td>
<td>I watch you shine</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>♪ Remember the size of the world before ♪</td>
<td>ممجح ركذت انلقم نم طاعلا</td>
<td>I remember the size of the world before</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>♪ Now it’s you and I Just you and I ♪</td>
<td>انحبحا نآلا تنا انن أو تنا اسحو انن أو</td>
<td>now it’s just you and me alone</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>♪ And now the horizon Holds so much more ♪</td>
<td>قفا نالو نيققفتسميا انا نل للجمي ءريثك</td>
<td>And now the future horizon holds us many hopes</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>♪ And it’s do or die ♪</td>
<td>امو جمج ننا نا امو</td>
<td>It’s earthier we succeed or die</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>♪ Yeah, it’s do or die ♪</td>
<td>وأ جمج ناجمج نا نا</td>
<td>Yes, either we succeed or die</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>♪ All I can do when the road bends ♪</td>
<td>يننكمي ام لك هلعف هجو يف كابطل اتاططخيا</td>
<td>All I can do to face the bumps</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>♪ Is lean into the curve ♪</td>
<td>اهعم ليما نا وه</td>
<td>Is to curve with it</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>♪ And all I can do When the tank’s run dry ♪</td>
<td>يننكمي ام لك نيح هلعف دفنت اتاططخيا</td>
<td>All I can do when the power is done</td>
<td>Aesthetic Translation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Vivo is an animated musical movie that follows Kinkajou, a pet who goes on an adventure to reunite with his master. Since the film is a musical, it is filled with lyrics that are sung by the characters to reflect their thoughts and advance the plot.

Table 10 shows that the subtitlers used the option of Adapting the translation to the original music, which can be described as “Aesthetic Translation” in 17 out of 31 lines. By examining the remaining 14 lines, it was noticed that the other option used by the subtitlers was “Literal Translation.”

In the source text, lines one and two contain an end rhyme as both lines end with the syllable “us”. This poetic feature was compensated in the Arabic renditions as the lyrics contain an end rhyme as well. However, the rhyming syllable became “na.”

According to Almuhareb et al. (2013), traditional Arabic poetry adheres to a relatively rigid rhyme scheme. Each stanza in a given poem must have the same last letter. As previously mentioned, lyrics in the movie Vivo directly affect the film plot. Therefore, using aesthetic translation is an excellent choice to render the meaning along with musical elements, and rendering the stylistic features of the text is very important. For example, line 25, “And now the horizon holds so much more,” was translated as “ةرثك اًلامآ انل لمحي لبقسملا قفأ نآلاو.” The subtitlers used the strategy of addition in order to render the stylistic feature of the original text. They translated “horizon” as “future horizon,” and the phrase “much more” was rendered as “much more hopes.” Ghazala (2018) considered stylistic translation a reflection of the various elements and purposes of the style of the source and target texts from the viewpoints of the author, translator, audience of the target text, and target language style. Thus, it is clear that style initiates and guides translation and stylistic translation is mainly used in literary works such as songs and lyrics.

Writing New Lyrics to the Original Music

In his five-option approach to translating songs, Franzon (2008) described this option by saying that a rewriter in a target language might pay far more attention to the music than the lyrics. This would be the case if the music made up most of the overall package and is considered a translational action, even if it is not translated in the traditional sense of the word. It was found that none of the investigated lyrics used this option fully. Franzon (2008, p. 9) argued
that “this option is probably most widespread in certain genres within popular music”; however, in the compiled data, the option of rendering new lyrics to the original music was not used except in limited lines of some lyrics. For example, the lyric “Mooncake” of the movie *Over the Moon*, contained particular lines that were translated using the option of *creating new lyrics to the original music* (see Table 11).

### Table 11. The subtitling of lines 13- 21 of the lyric “Mooncake”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Original Text</th>
<th>Subtitling</th>
<th>Back Translation</th>
<th>Translation option</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>♪ Then we bake them Full of fondness, sweetness ♪</td>
<td>اهژربخنو بدواملاپ بمود</td>
<td>We always bake it with sweetness</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>♪ Wafting through the air ♪</td>
<td>لوك ييف امآيآ</td>
<td>All days</td>
<td>Writing new lyrics to the original music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>♪ And there is magic in these Mooncakes ♪</td>
<td>اهدنغ كيناتمته رحس</td>
<td>then it will be filled with magic</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>♪ You can feel it all around ♪</td>
<td>يف هسملن زؤچلا</td>
<td>We touch around us</td>
<td>Translating Lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>♪ Mooncakes, where the magic is found ♪</td>
<td>رمقلا یولح مورصا</td>
<td>Mooncakes holds secrets</td>
<td>Writing new lyrics to original music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>♪ We need five more ♪</td>
<td>5 ديرأ</td>
<td>I want 5</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>♪ Or maybe twelve Because I’ve got the cousins coming ♪</td>
<td>يني طغأ نأل فنسد ييفويض</td>
<td>Give me twelve because my guests are six</td>
<td>Translating lyrics without taking the music into consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>♪ And you know just how they are ♪</td>
<td>نوکاچی جه مسلاپ</td>
<td>They come for joy</td>
<td>Writing new lyrics to the original music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>♪ They love these cakes ♪</td>
<td>کولجو ارمقلأ</td>
<td>And mooncakes</td>
<td>Writing lyrics to the original music</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11 shows an example of a case where the option of *Writing new lyrics to the original music* was used in a few lines of the lyric. The full lyric is largely translated using “Literal Translation,” as indicated above. However, lines 14, 17, 20, and 21 were the only four translated by creating new lyrics to the original music. The translation kept the rhythm and meaning related to the lines before and after. However, the translation is entirely different from the original text. In line 14, the original text “Waiting through the air” is subtitled into “All days,” which is in harmony with line 13, translated as “we always bake it with sweetness.” Lines 20 and 21, on the other hand, were rendered as new rhymed lines. The researchers noticed that using this option in limited cases would not
affect the overall meaning of the lyric but instead produce a stylistic and rhymed translation. This option may not be recommended in subtitling musical movies. Therefore, it was never used in any lyric of this study. If such an option is used in a complete lyric, it may change the overall meaning, content, and film plot, which these lyrics are meant to produce initially.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The researchers examined the examples extracted from the five movies: Over the Moon, Vivo, 13: The Musical, The Secret Life of Pets, and Riverdance. The five movies were subtitled by Netflix. Upon analyzing the corpus of data, it was concluded that Netflix translated the lyrics using three options that Franzon (2008) proposed. These are: (1) Not translating the lyrics, (2) Translating the lyrics without considering the music, and (3) Adapting the lyrics to the original music.

After examining the above corpus of subtitling lyrics extracted from Netflix movies, it was concluded that not all five options were used in translating lyrics. It was also noticed that the subtitler usually preferred to use the same option in a particular movie. This is sometimes related to the translator’s style or other factors, such as the movie’s theme and plot.

Not translating the lyrics is not recommended when the movie is musical. Translating the lyrics without considering the music (Literal Translation) is the most used option in subtitling the investigated lyrics. On the other hand, creating new lyrics is not used to render any lyrics fully investigated in this study. However, the translator used a few lines to keep the meaning flowing. “Aesthetic Translation” is a preferable option to use, as it keeps the sense of music along with the meaning. It makes the movie more exciting, and the viewer is likely to enjoy reading rhymed subtitles while seeing and hearing music at the same time. Furthermore, subtitling lyrics does not need to be singable because the viewers can access the foreign product in which they hear the song and absorb the joy and feel of the music. The film plot, musical elements, excitement, and the connotative meaning behind the lyrics are usually the most vital factors in movie production.

It was noticed that the first option, not translating the lyrics, which was used in subtitling the lyrics extracted from The Secret Life of Pets, had a neutral effect on subtitling. Not translating the lyrics in subtitling was the easiest choice to make. However, it may have affected the film plot and connotative meaning, especially in the case of musical movies, for they contain much crucial information. Vivo, Over The Moon, and 13 The Musical movies are considered musical movies. The lyrics which these movies contain are all expressive and informative. Therefore, the researchers found that it is not recommended not to translate musical movie lyrics. However, in the case of The Secret Life of Pets, which is considered a non-
musical movie, the lyrics were added to give the viewer a sense of excitement and joy for entertainment purposes, so it is considered acceptable.

The second option was used in subtitling 11 lyrics: “subtitling the lyrics without taking the music into consideration” or “Literal Subtitling.” The researchers came to the conclusion that this was the most common option in subtitling the lyrics. It was found that Netflix used this option as the most suitable one for adhering to the subtitling constraints. It was clear that translating the lyrics without considering the music would help produce well-spaced and timed subtitles.

As for the excitement of the movie, considering that the film plot was not affected, the excitement of the movie will be the same, and the same neutral effect applies to the connotative meaning.

Moving to the third and last option used only in Vivo, Adapting the lyrics to the original music, it was found that using this option in subtitling the lyrics could be the most suitable choice by Netflix. This option had a positive effect on all the film factors. As described in the previous examples, the researchers noticed that this option would provide a meaningful, singable, and technically sound translation. Current research findings showed that this option balances the subtitling constraints along with musical elements. However, using this option requires creativity to maintain the content and form of a song and then squeeze it into subtitles. Here, the researchers found that “adapting the translation to the original music” can be described as “Aesthetic Translation.”

The findings of the current study showed that a translator might not subtitle the lyrics on certain occasions, such as “Non-Musical Movies.” Netflix used three options in subtitling the lyrics; the most used option was “translating the lyrics without taking the music into consideration.” This study found that the most affected factors in movies when translating lyrics are the film plot, musical elements, excitement, and connotative meaning. Therefore, the effect of not translating the lyrics depends on whether the movie is considered musical or non-musical. On the other hand, subtitling the lyrics without taking the music into consideration has an adverse effect on both the film plot and musical elements. However, it neutrally affects the excitement factor and the connotative meaning. As for “Adapting the translation to the original music,” the researchers concluded that this is the most suitable option for subtitling lyrics because it balances between the subtitling constraints and the musical features. The researchers also concluded that in translating lyrics, the most important factors are the format and stylistic aspects. However, the researchers suggest that cultural aspects may be taken into consideration in further studies.
References


ANALYSIS OF THE INTERFACE BETWEEN LANGUAGE COMPETENCE AND CONCEPTUAL METAPHOR IN TRANSLATION STUDIES

Ivaylo Dagnev¹, Zlatka Chervenkova²

¹University of Agribusiness and Rural Development – Plovdiv; Medical College at Medical University Plovdiv (Bulgaria); ²University of Plovdiv

Abstract: The article seeks to explore the interface between language competence requirements as set by EMT and analyzed by PACTE and conceptual metaphor studies. The research strives to provide an assessment of an experiment conducted with three groups of translators – two non-professional ones, e.g. students of English philology in their 4th year with some translation practice and one group comprised of professional translators and university lecturers. Systematic knowledge of the theoretical underpinnings of Conceptual Metaphor Theory is privy to only one of the groups of non-professional translators. The experiment includes a translation of an article from the Economist by all groups. A number of metaphoric units (words and phrases) have been identified in the article on the basis of MIP procedures. The objective of the research is to gauge the importance of metaphoric competence for performing a successful translation. The results obtained from the current study, though not conclusive show that metaphoric competence plays a significant role in translators’ competencies. Metaphoric awareness may not be directly linked with Conceptual Metaphor Theory, but it proves vital to the quality of translation.

Keywords: metaphor translation, metaphorical competence, translation competence

About the author: Assoc. Professor Ivaylo Yordanov Dagnev, PhD is an Associate Professor of ESP and EAP at UARD – Plovdiv and a Senior Lecturer at the Medical College of Medical University in Plovdiv. He holds a PhD in linguistics and his particular areas of interest include Conceptual Metaphor Theory, Translation Studies, Cognitive Semantics, Discourse Studies, English for Specific Purposes and English for Academic Purposes. His PhD title is: Metaphorical Terms in Anatomy: An English-Bulgarian Comparative Study. He has submitted two habilitation papers. The primary one is entitled: ‘The "Scientific Medical Article" Genre in Bulgarian and English Academic Discourse’ and the second one written in English is entitled: ‘Medical Discourse - Implications of Inverse Translation for the Medical Research Article Genre’. He has published a book based on his PhD with the title: Metaphors and Shells in Anatomy: Bulgarian-English Cross-Linguistic Study.

e-mail: ivaylo.dagnev@mu-plovdiv.bg  ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8287-5307

About the author: Assist. Professor Zlatka Chervenkova is a Faculty Member of the Department of Philology at Paisii Hilendarski University of Plovdiv, English and American Studies. Her main interests are in the fields of Cognitive Metaphor Theory and Translation Studies.

e-mail: zlatka.chervenkova@uni-plovdiv.net  ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2092-9004

Copyright © 2024 Ivaylo Dagnev, Zlatka Chervenkova

Article history: Received: 20 December 2024; Reviewed: 14 February 2024; Revised: 27 February 2024; Accepted: 28 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024.

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Introduction

The phenomenon of metaphor

In recent times there have been proposed several major theories explaining metaphor intricacies. Drawing upon Aristotle’s treatment of the term and following Richards’ ideas (Richards, 1981) of metaphoric structure, modern scholars have tried to explain metaphor by putting forward the substitution theory, the comparison theory, the interaction theory, the conceptual metaphor theory, etc. There are two distinct views on which most theories on metaphor have been developed. On the one hand, there is the traditional view in which metaphor functions only at the level of language. The second view, advanced over the last thirty years or so, holds that metaphor is a conceptual device relating to thought and has an elaborate relationship with language.

The cognitive perspective

To understand the cognitive perspective, we should first establish its place in the realm of language and thought. The radical break from the purely linguistic understanding of metaphor is associated with the appearance of the Conceptual Metaphor Theory, as well as with the more discursive and culturally oriented translation theories proposed over the last thirty years. Ever since Lakoff and Johnson (1980) stormed the linguistic and philosophical community with their book *Metaphors We Live By*, the Conceptual Metaphor Theory (CMT) has undergone several phases, but in essence, its main tenets have not changed. According to CMT, metaphor is a cognitive device that allows us to understand and experience a relatively abstract subject matter in terms of a more concrete one.

Such a bold view has triggered much controversy and opposition. Perhaps the main issue of criticism which still seems to be relevant is as Cuccio (2018) expresses it, whether conceptual metaphors are part of individual people’s conceptual apparatuses and whether they are always used as online processing mechanisms.

As for the dichotomy of “dead” or “alive” metaphors, Müller (2008) argues, that metaphors operate on the level of language use and not on the one of language system. Accordingly, metaphoricality is a dynamic part of a cognitive activation process in an individual person at a given moment in time. Her claims are substantiated by empirical studies of multimodal metaphors that unite language, gestures, pictures, etc.

With a view to metaphor typology, Lakoff and Johnson (1980) first proposed three types of metaphor – orientational, ontological and structural. Orientational metaphors are those in which concepts are spatially related to each other, as in
“HAPPY IS UP”/”SAD IS DOWN” (e.g., “I’m feeling up”). This latter type of metaphor is grounded in our physical experience. Structural metaphors are those in which one concept is expressed in terms of a different structured, sharply defined concept, as is the case with the ‘ARGUMENT IS WAR’ mapping. Later Lakoff and Turner (1989) added image metaphors and redefined the ontological ones in terms of a folk model about nature called the Great Chain of Being, which specifies physical and behavioural attributes of human beings, animals, plants, natural objects, and artifacts. Examples of such metaphors are ‘PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS’ (e.g., “Achilles is a lion”), and ‘PEOPLE ARE PLANTS’ (e.g., “She is a tender rose”). Image metaphors map images onto images, which means that they do not map concepts into concepts, but only the structure and visual attributes (e.g., colour, shape, texture) of a conceptual domain onto the structure and visual attributes of another domain.

Translatability of metaphor: The cognitive stance

There are several major models which study the process of metaphor translation from a cognitive perspective. These are Mandelblit’s (1995), Schäffner’s (2004), Kövecses’ (2005) and Maalej’s (2008).

Mandelblit (1995) proposed the Cognitive Translation Hypothesis, positing that metaphoric expressions take more time and are more difficult to translate if they exploit a different cognitive domain than the target language equivalent expressions because the search for another conceptual mapping (another cognitive domain) causes delay, uncertainty and difficulty in the translation of different domain metaphors. On this basis, Mandelblit puts forward two schemes for the translation of metaphors:

1. Similar mapping conditions (SMC will obtain if both languages use the same domain)

2. Different mapping conditions (DMC will obtain if the two languages use different domains to express the topic of communication) (Mandelblit, 1995, p. 485).

If the first option occurs, Mandelblit believes that a translator should simply choose an equivalent target metaphor, but in the second case, the translator should render the ST[1] metaphor by choosing a TL simile, or by a paraphrase, a footnote, an explanation or omission (Mandelblit, 1995). Kövecses (2005) addresses the ways conceptual metaphors are expressed linguistically in different languages and by comparing the linguistic expression of a particular conceptual metaphor in two languages, different kinds of patterns emerge:

1. Metaphors of similar mapping conditions and similar lexical realization

---

1. ST – source text; SL – source language; TL – target language; TT – target text; STR - Structural metaphor; ORI – Orientational metaphor; ONT – Ontological metaphor.
2. Metaphors of similar mapping conditions but different lexical realisation
3. Metaphors of different mapping conditions but similar lexical realisation
4. Metaphors of different mapping conditions and different lexical realisation

Maalej's (2008) view on mapping conditions is very similar to Kövecses', although the former follows Hiraga (1991), who first came with the four schemes. Maalej argues that there is more to translation “than simply pairing or mapping parameters from an SL to a TL” and that metaphor translation is knowledge-based, involving culture-specific repacking or re-expression. Schaffner identifies five cases of translation procedures (Schaffner, 2004, p. 1267):

1. A conceptual metaphor is identical in ST and TT at the macro level without each individual manifestation having been accounted for at the micro-level.
2. Structural components of the base conceptual schema in the ST are replaced in the TT by expressions that make entailments explicit.
3. A metaphor is more elaborate in the TT.
4. ST and TT employ different metaphoric expressions which can be combined under a more abstract conceptual metaphor.
5. The expression in the TT reflects a different aspect of the conceptual metaphor.

As can be seen from above only the second and the third points of Schaffner’s cases are different from Kövecses’s (2005) scheme, as the former account for loss of metaphor (the second point) and metaphor complexity (the third point), while her other proposed cases are similar to Kövecses’s (2005). No matter how many schemes are employed it is obvious that all of them are firmly dependent on two aspects of metaphors; namely, mapping conditions and lexical realization.

**Translation Competence**

Until the 1990s, theorists have largely viewed the translation of metaphor as a purely linguistic phenomenon, neglecting the role of the translator and their competence. Nevertheless, the latter is at the very heart of applying the principle of dynamic equivalence, as it reflects the pragmatic aspect of the latter in a way that directly corresponds to the quality of a translated text. As PACTE (2017) and Albir et al. (2020) suggested, it is predominantly about “expert knowledge” being at the core of successful translation activity. The division of this knowledge type, when analyzing its working mechanisms into two major components e.g., “declarative” and “procedural” knowledge, and the proposed model clearly delineates the boundaries of translation competence and offers a methodology for achieving the latter. What, perhaps, is not taken into account in PACTE’s model is ‘metaphoric’ competence, the knowledge of which, as Andersen (2000) points out, lies first in the understanding of linguistic metaphors and
secondly in translating them “[a]ccording to a macro-strategy”. Andersen (ibid.) refers to metaphoric competence as “a whole range of competencies including translation competence with regard to metaphors”. This may imply that such a kind of competence is a different type of subcompetence in the PACTE’s model (2000, 2003, 2005, 2017; Beeby et al., 2009; Albir et al., 2020) as it does not exactly fit any of the subcompetences proposed by the group, but rather lies at the cross-section of them all.

Aims of the study
We are aiming to explore the interface between language competence requirements as set by The European Master’s in Translation (EMT, 2017) and analyzed by PACTE (2000, 2003, 2005, 2017; Beeby et al., 2009; Albir et al., 2020) and conceptual metaphor studies. Our main goal, based on the theoretical mechanism we have devised, is to prove or disprove the practical importance CMT may have on the translation process and translation training and, if it is possible, to find any relation between the quality of translation and knowledge of conceptual metaphor, that may be an indicator for a possible shift in translation teaching.

Methodology

Setup of the study
The study is based on an experiment, involving three groups of respondents – a control group, an experimental group, and a third one serving as tertium comparationis. Each group consisted of 14 respondents. The efficacy of this research design has been proven by a similar study involving two groups of professional and non-professional translators and a group of students carried out by Jensen (2005, pp. 183-209).

We gave all the groups an article, entitled “The APEC Summit and the Pacific Rim” from *The Economist* to translate at home, with a time limit of 90 minutes for all participants with kinds of reference tools of their choosing. As this assignment was not grade-bound, we relied on the students’ integrity and honesty in adhering to the required task conditions. The first group, which we dubbed for convenience “non-competent (group)” (NCG), included students of English philology in their fourth and final year at university and were not acquainted with CMT. The second group, dubbed “competent (group)” (CG), also consisted of students of English philology in their fourth year but acquainted with CMT in a special elective course on cognitive linguistics. The third group, which served as both a control group and as tertium comparationis, was dubbed “professionals” or “PROs”, and comprised professional translators and lecturers at the Department of English Philology, all of whom had some knowledge of
CMT. The professional translators, all of them well-established in the field of written translation, were used as a yardstick of quality, with the major caveat that we did not ascribe to their translations the mark of perfection. CMT was not gauged as a factor with the PROs, as knowledge of the theory in Bulgaria spread over the last ten years and was not part of the latter graduate curriculum. The presence of the PROs in the study is of crucial importance for another reason, as they stand for a certain representative norm of the translation community in the country and thus can be used to gauge professionalism as far as the students’ groups are concerned.

**Metaphor identification**

We have identified 45 conceptual metaphors – both conventional and deliberate, the latter in the sense of Steen’s understanding as “[i]nviting or forcing language users to attend to both source and target domain to adopt a different perspective as they are processing the sentences of the text.” (Steen, 2010, p. 93). We used the Metaphor Identification Procedure (MIP) proposed by the Pragglejaz Group (Group, 2007) to find and identify metaphors. In simple terms, we looked up each metaphor candidate in several dictionaries for discrepancies between the primary meaning of the word and the figurative use of the same item in the text, accounting for cotext and context (Kövecses, 2015, 2020).

We gathered and kept in our final list a few items that were arguably cases of metonymy rather than metaphor. It is sometimes impossible to decide whether or not a particular item should confidently be categorized as a metaphor (Cameron, 1999), and the distinction between metaphor and metonymy has been found to be particularly blurred (Barnden, 2010). However, our qualitative analysis of the students’ responses at times allowed us to tell whether they were interpreting expressions as metaphor or metonymy.

**Analysis of metaphor translation**

To analyze the translations of the identified metaphors we used as the first approximation of Kövecses’ (2005) division of metaphor translation into four options, but we changed it following our theoretical frame, elaborating on lexical expression. So, we have laid out four criteria, viz.

1. Same mapping condition and same lexical representation
2. Same mapping condition but different lexical representation
3. Different mapping conditions in SL and TL
4. Loss of metaphor in TL

We are going to elaborate on the first three criteria in the Results and Discussion section in more detail, as they do not necessitate any clarification here. As for
the loss of metaphor (LM) criteria, we have to lay out the subcriteria we used in
their investigation. We also present a brief analysis of metaphor typology, which
requires a separate study to account for all the complexities of each excerpted
item, including image schema, blend structure, embodiment, etc.

Although most identified metaphors are compound ones and a great part of
the idiomatic phrases are blends, we adhere to the division of metaphors into
ontological, orientational and structural ones (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980, pp.
25-33), as it proved more convenient for the translation analysis. We have
identified them based on the most powerful conceptual metaphor underlying
each case, e.g. First step (‘LIFE IS A JOURNEY’); Diffusing the tensions
(‘CONCENTRATION IS FORCE’); the rise of China and America’s relative
decline (‘UP IS MORE’).

**Presenting the data**

We have tried to come up with a unified approach in presenting the data in
the Results part, however, that proved enormously challenging as the different
criteria necessitate different approaches. Nevertheless, we have elaborated on
some all-embracing parameters as “most used”, and “least used” procedures.
We have also shown a breakdown of the percentage of the results for each
criterion. Each one of the latter has its unique characteristics and they have duly
been deliberated on.

We have provided some explanation for the various parameters of the study
(e.g. metaphor typology) in the Discussion section, which is separated for
convenience. We have also used italics for the excerpted words and phrases and
abbreviations for the types of metaphors, which are clarified in a footnote.

**Results**

*The choice of mapping condition in translation*

We concur with Kövecses’s view (2005) that the choice of mapping conditions
depends on the diversity of cultural conceptualisation of identical objects or
worlds in both communities whose languages are involved in translation.

The use of same or different mapping conditions is contingent on the distance
that separates the cultural background of the source text and target audience in
terms of time and place, the entrenched linguistic expressions in the language
and the subjective choice of the translator. Therefore, the group of professional
translators serves to measure the normal, the most adequate rendition of the
metaphor in the target language, considering the cultural and linguistic distance
between the two languages.
### Same mapping condition, similar wording (SMCSW)

#### Table 1. Representation of the use of Same Mapping Condition Similar Wording by the three groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SMC</th>
<th>NCG</th>
<th>CG</th>
<th>PROs</th>
<th>Total Mean for all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Similar wording</td>
<td>283 (46.9%)</td>
<td>248 (41%)</td>
<td>218 (36.1%)</td>
<td>749 (42.55%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of the 45 analyzed metaphors and their translations, 36.1% of the professionals have translated the metaphors using SMC, compared to 46.9% of the translators without metaphoric competence and 41% of the translators with metaphoric competence.

As can be seen from the table, the percentage associated with SMC accounts for almost half of the cases for the NCG, while for the PROs it is one-third. This may be due to the fact that the PROs and the CG are more aware of cultural differences and achieve equivalence by changing mapping conditions. Professional translators seem less inclined to pick the easiest choice and preserve the same mapping, probably due to their greater cultural knowledge. We may conclude that students with metaphoric competence are less prone to preserve the mapping than students without metaphoric competence. Literal translation rarely yields the same effect, though due to similarities in worldviews, close to one-third of all metaphors are translated not only with similar mapping but with the same wording, as well. It is illuminating to analyze those metaphors, translated predominantly by applying SMCSW by all groups and the opposite type as well, lacking in such a translation approach.

Metaphors rendered exclusively by SMCSW:

1. Similar conceptualisation in the target language – universal knowledge. In these cases, we observe root conceptual metaphors with a powerful experiential basis. These are universal conceptual metaphors that are expressed through the same wording in most languages. Any deviation of the translation from the same wording is unreasonable.

   (1) *Bridge over troubled water* (LIFE IS A JOURNEY)

   (2) *Influential actors in world trade* (LIFE IS A PLAY)

   (3) *Rise of China and A’s relative decline* (UP IS MORE)

   (4) *Balance of power* (POWER IS WEIGHT)

   (5) *Cradle of so many … hopes* (IDEAS ARE PEOPLE)

   (6) *First step* (LIFE IS A JOURNEY)
2. Similar expression in the target language (language match) – co-text explicated:

(1) *His body open towards* (CAMERAS ARE WEAPONS)

(2) *All your dreams are on their way* (TIME IS A MOVING OBJECT)

(3) *Signalled* (INFORMATION IS A SIGN)

A vertical analysis of the cases in which the different groups prefer the use of SMCSW shows the following:

1. The NCG group has chosen SMCSW in more cases than the other two groups in the expressions such as: *diffusing the tensions, undermining the communist party, drove Myanmar towards the West, at its peril, cradle of so many hopes.*

2. The CG group chose SMCSW in more cases than the other two groups in the following cases: *the smallest details of summit choreography, signalled, torpor, in league with, America’s lake or China’s, satellites of America, it fed Chinese paranoia, own clubs.*

3. The group of PROs has chosen SMCSW in more cases than the other two groups in the following example: *summit, overtake, uphold the security of, contain it, foment, all your dreams are on their way.*

4. Certain translations of metaphors have been almost unanimous: *the first step, the balance of power.* This can be accounted for by the fact that the words *steps and balance* exist in the Bulgarian language and they are activated immediately so the translators see no reason in substituting them for a synonym, different wording, or, let alone, different mapping.

Metaphors with the least frequent application of SMCSW:

1. Conceptual difference plus gloss: This is necessary in cases when, due to terminology, domain-related polysemy, or merely cultural or linguistic differences between the languages:

(1) Pacific rim

(2) High-handedness

(3) Pivoting

2. Culture-specific:

(1) Great power jockeying

3. Language inadequacy – cultural mismatch:

(1) *As if paying tribute:* the corresponding same mapping has the implication of “paying one’s dues” and should therefore be avoided at all costs

(2) *On the face of it:* “face” is conceptualised differently in the TL culture which requires loss of metaphor rather than SMC
(3) China’s armed forces would be no match for America’s - are not equal to in the TL is meant on a positive scale – are far beyond – quite the opposite of the meaning this phrase has in English.

(4) Entrench

The second-easiest choice when translating metaphoric expressions is SMCDW. These cases are commented on in greater detail in the section on SMCDW below.

As for the cases with great differences between the groups, we present Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Examples translated 100% with SMCSW (not counting the mistakes)</th>
<th>Examples translated 0% with SMCSW (not counting the mistakes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All groups</td>
<td>Bridge over troubled water – STR(^1)</td>
<td>Pacific Rim – ORI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>His body open towards – STR</td>
<td>As if paying tribute – ORI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Signalled – STR</td>
<td>On the face of it – ORI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First step – STR</td>
<td>No match for America’s – ORI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>rise of China and A’s relative decline – STR</td>
<td>High-handedness – ORI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I’m sailing right behind – in a gunboat – STR</td>
<td>Pivoting – STR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Balance of power – ORI</td>
<td>Great power jockeying – ORI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undermine the communist party – STR</td>
<td>Entrench</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It fed Chinese paranoia – ORI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>at its peril – ORI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All your dreams are on their way – ORI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cradle of so many ... hopes – ORI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The majority of conceptual metaphors that yield themselves to SMCSW translation are structural</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Cases of translation using SMCSW by groups
Participants | Examples translated 100% with SMCSW (not counting the mistakes) | Examples translated 0% with SMCSW (not counting the mistakes)
--- | --- | ---
CG | Summit choreography  
I’m sailing right behind – in a gunboat  
Meeting of minds  
Fed Chinese paranoia  
Entrench | Contain it  
Foot-dragging  
Absorb
PROs | Foot-dragging  
absorb | Foot-dragging  
absorb

**Same mapping condition, different wording (SMCDW)**

Table 3. Representation of the use of the Same Mapping Condition in Different Wording by the three groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NCG</th>
<th>CG</th>
<th>PROs</th>
<th>Total Mean for all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SMCDW</td>
<td>82 (13.6%)</td>
<td>84 (14.1%)</td>
<td>103 (17.1%)</td>
<td>270 (15.3%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Finding the appropriate lexical choice in the target language requires deep linguistic mastery, knowledge and experience and is definitely more difficult than just using similar words. That is why, only in three cases this option prevails, while using SMCSW as the option of choice abounds in twelve cases. It is interesting to pinpoint the cases where the professional translators used different wording, as that shows their greater experience and skills. In several cases, the professionals opted for SMCDW, while the other two groups did not:

1. The smallest details of summit choreography – STR
2. Diffusing the tensions – STR
3. I’m sailing right behind – in a gunboat – STR
4. Influential actors in world trade – STR
5. Seething with rivalry – STR
6. Contain it – ONT

What is illuminating is that almost all of these metaphors are structural. Most of them constitute universal knowledge and have their Bulgarian equivalent translations. They belong to the same domain but are best translated having in mind the entrenched target language expression. Obviously, the professionals’ greater experience, mother tongue mastery and universal knowledge are crucial in their rendering.
As far as this criterion is concerned both groups of students fared equally, with a very slight prevalence of the CG (as seen from Table 3). Using different wording for *torpor* was the preferred choice for the “non-competent” group of students, while *overtake* and *in league with* were rendered in this way mostly by the CG. Both groups chose SMCDW as their preferred choice for *head-on war, foment* and *foot-dragging* – while the PROs translated these with a loss of metaphor. Even in English, these metaphoric expressions are not common, while other more common expressions exist to convey the same meaning and are usually used in everyday language. Therefore, the loss of metaphor is a form of generalization; substitution of a more commonly used expression for a fancier one, which professional translators prefer to make the text more straightforward. *Influential actors* – on the other hand, was translated by using SMCDW mostly by the PROs and the CG.

Concerning the three above-mentioned options where all respondents used SMCDW as their first choice, these metaphors are:

1. *As if paying tribute* – ONT
2. *On the face of it* – ONT
3. *Pivoting* – STR

The first two of these items have exactly what Al-Hasnawi (2007) has in mind – these metaphors are conceptualized in the same domain in both English and Bulgarian, but the well-entrenched language expression is different in either language. *Pivoting* in its use as a verb has a domain matrix which has no exact match in Bulgarian, which is why, although it is rendered preserving the mapping (TURNING TO IS THINKING ALIKE is a conceptual metaphor common to both cultures), the lexical expression in Bulgarian has to be done differently.

There are eight cases of all 45 identified metaphors where none of the groups used SMCDW at all. In almost all cases such as these, the respondents used similar wording, as the metaphoric conceptualizations are very similar to their Bulgarian equivalents.

1. *Pacific rim* – ONT
2. *His body open towards* – STR
3. *First step* – STR
4. *rise of China and A's relative decline* – ORI
5. *China’s armed forces would be no match for America’s* – ORI
6. *At arm’s length* – ONT
7. *Undermine the communist party* – STR
8. *Entrench* – ORI
As can be seen, no specific type of conceptual metaphor stands out. In general, the same mapping is often manifested through a variety of ways, yet the mappings do fit a single overarching category. The same mapping is due to cultural universality, but though it may be the same, it is often manifested through different wording in the target language, which obviously the PROs are more sensitive to, being more experienced. Greater competence is evinced in the ability to master the initial urge to translate literally, to be more proficient in the recipient language collocability and co-text adequacy, and thus more sensitive to the expressions entrenched in the TL.

**Different mapping condition (DMC)**

| Table 4. Representation of the use of Different Mapping Condition (DMC) by the three groups |
|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
|                                | NCG                             | CG                              |
| DMC                            | 49 (8.1%)                       | 61 (10.1%)                      |
|                                | PROs                            | 87 (14.4%)                      |
|                                | Total mean for all              | 197 (11.2%)                     |

As conceptual differences between languages certainly exist, they require different mappings. Translating by changing the domain is probably the most challenging one and demands the greatest cultural awareness. Every metaphor emphasizes some features of similarity between the source domain and the target domain and hides others. Therefore, DMC may only be applied when the language and culture override the loss incurred when changing the mapping/domain. From this point of view, it is very obvious that the group of professional translators, being more sensitive than the other two groups to differences in the conceptual domains between the two cultures, thus having greater “language and culture-specific knowledge”, will use different mapping conditions the most. Different mapping is a manifestation of greater cultural and linguistic mastery, which is confirmed by our results.
The percentage of the PROs using DMC is much higher than that of both student groups. The professional translators used DMC with varying degrees in translating 28 out of all 45 metaphors, while the “non-competent” group of students in 16 and the “competent” ones in 23 instances. As can be seen from Table 5 above, the overall use of DMC is almost twice for the group of PROs while compared with the NCG of students and 25% more than the CG.

Metaphors such as *trumps, American Lake or China’s, plunged, entrench* are translated by the PROs almost exclusively by using DMC. *Great power jockeying*, being translated mostly by DMC by all three groups, is still topped in terms of exclusive rendering in this way by the PROs. What strikes as a tendency is that in almost all cases where DMC is involved, the greatest scores belong to this group.

A noticeable difference exists between the two student groups, which comes to show that awareness of conceptual metaphor has made the CG more sensitive than the other student group to the need for change in the mapping conditions of the linguistic expressions used in the translation to achieve greater equivalence. This can no doubt be attributed to their greater sensitivity to metaphoricity.
All in all, using DMC as an option of choice is rarest in all groups and non-existent in eleven translations of metaphor. One possible explanation can be viewed not only in terms of preference but also with regard to the conceptual and cultural proximity of the two languages. If we analyze the types of metaphoric items, we will find out that those examples in need of DMC type of translation are mostly culture-specific ones and a fine example is great power jockeying, which is not present as realia in the Bulgarian culture. Finding similar realia in the Bulgarian culture, which must also be co-text adequate, is not a simple act and demands both universal and culture-specific knowledge and experience.

As far as the different types of metaphors are involved, what is worthy of note is that most instances involving DMC in translation are originally structural metaphors. The latter are of the type X is Y (e.g., diffusing the tension, ‘CONCENTRATION IS FORCE’ while the instances where DMC was applied the least or not applied at all incorporate a significant number of ontological metaphors (e.g., contain it ‘CONTAINMENT’— For a further discussion of metaphor type – see Discussion).

**Loss of metaphor**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Loss of metaphor</th>
<th>NCG</th>
<th>CG</th>
<th>PROs</th>
<th>Total Mean for all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Loss of metaphor</td>
<td>122 (20.2%)</td>
<td>106 (17.5%)</td>
<td>128 (21.2%)</td>
<td>356 (20.2%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Is the loss of metaphor in translation a good thing or not? That is the question! Which translation is better – the one that preserves the metaphor, or the one that does away with it? By applying our analysis, we try to provide some answers to the final question.
Table 7. Breakdown of results of Loss of Metaphor usage by type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LM – applied the most</th>
<th>LM – applied extensively by all groups</th>
<th>LM – applied by one group only</th>
<th>LM – not applied by any group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pacific Rim – ONT</td>
<td>Diffusing the tensions – STR</td>
<td>The smallest details of summit choreography ONT – PROs</td>
<td>Bridge over troubled water – STR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aligned – STR</td>
<td>In league with – STR</td>
<td>On the face of it ONT – CG</td>
<td>His body open towards – STR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China’s armed forces would be no match for America’s – ORI</td>
<td>A head-on war – ONT</td>
<td>Those days are now at an end STR – PROs</td>
<td>As if paying tribute – ONT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-handedness – ORI</td>
<td>At arm’s length – ONT</td>
<td>Balance of power ORI – PROs</td>
<td>I’m sailing right behind – in a gunboat – STR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absorb – ONT</td>
<td>Own clubs – STR</td>
<td>Undermine the communist party STR – PROs</td>
<td>Overtake – STR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sell it – STR</td>
<td>Foment STR – NCG</td>
<td>Influential actors in world trade – STR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Foot-dragging – STR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Great power jockeying – STR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First, in view of the process leading to LM, we defined several reasons for “losing” metaphor:

1. Entrenched metaphoric collocation in SL, which does not have an equally entrenched collocation in TL, leading to non-metaphoric explication – own clubs, foot-dragging, head-on war;

2. Lack of TL equivalent due to unstable TL collocation – Pacific Rim

3. No conceptual metaphoric equivalence, to avoid error translators resort to loss of metaphor – high-handedness, foot-dragging, aligned, great power jockeying, no match for, sell it;

4. Entrenched TL equivalent with a more concrete meaning which does not cover the intended SL interpretation/meaning – borrowed item exists in TL with a different concrete meaning – at arm’s length, entrenched, absorb.

Of course, these criteria are created ad hoc, they are intended to highlight an effort to analyze the reasons for the lack of metaphor in the TL and they definitely overlap. For example, low-frequency entrenchment in the target language means instability of a collocation, which makes potential translation equivalence problematic.

As far as the product (outcome) is involved, we discovered two major types:

1. Lexical explication – use of non-metaphoric word

2. Syntactic explication – use of non-metaphoric phrase or syntactic unit.
In the final analysis of this criterion, if we judge from the translations of the PROs, it is often more appropriate to lose the metaphor than to keep it at all costs. In 20.2% of the cases, the metaphor was lost. This raises the question: Does one have to be familiar with CMT to be able to tell when to sacrifice a metaphor? The group of professional translators (not familiar with CMT) have killed the metaphor in more cases than any of the student groups, yet the CG has tried hard to preserve the metaphor more than any of the other groups, resulting in some cases of translation awkwardness, bordering on the tolerable. Overtranslating metaphor is therefore a potential risk among those who have become too enthusiastic about CMT and metaphor in general.

The NCG has resorted to the literal transfer of the meaning, rather than keeping the form. Explication is a frequent practice, and compared to the metaphor-aware group, highly sensitive to metaphor, the group of students lacking metaphoric competence do not feel the urge to preserve the metaphor at all.

Strange as it may seem, professional translators are more prone to killing metaphors than the students’ groups. A likely reason for this may be their greater commitment to the content than to the form.

Discussion

One thing grabs the attention when we analyze the overall performance of all groups – the group of professional translators stands out among the other two in most respects as has been expected. We may convincingly assert that the professionals translated the text with a view to its equivalence and in the final analysis, quality in the target language. The mere fact that this group resorted to translation modes highlighting metaphor importance comes to suggest the importance of metaphoric competence, which does not necessarily spell out as knowledge of CMT.

The fact that professional translators made use of DMC more frequently than the other groups shows their greater proficiency in the target language. They did not shy from abandoning the search for an adequate metaphoric rendition when the mere preservation of metaphor distorted the meaning and that is obvious in their choice of explicating the meaning of a given metaphor without preserving its linguistic form – the number of instances of Loss of metaphor is the greatest in this group.

It is obvious from the data that when the other two groups played it safe by using SMCSW, which in some cases was inappropriate, the PROs “lost” the metaphor in their translation variants on account of a lexical gap or cultural mismatch in the target language. All this, however, does not diminish the power of metaphor or the importance of recognizing the principles of CMT.
If we look at the results more closely, we will find out that “a better translation”, or a greater degree of translation equivalence, if we accept the role of the group of professional translators as our yardstick, by the latter standards, means achieving ‘greater metaphoricity’. In our opinion, the professional translators adhered to the major tenets of CMT per se, even without being fully aware of them explicitly.

In the case of the CG of students, certain aspects also loom large. Although quality of translation is not the primary focal point of this study and irrespective of the relatively small number of the respondents, we may conclude that this group has fared better than the other group of students in light of the former results being closer to the group of professional translators. We may also confirm the role of the knowledge of CMT as important, given the fact that the CG choices follow the professionals’ translation choices more closely in the criterion DMC, which requires greater awareness of metaphoric use both in the source and target languages.

Finally, it is incumbent on us to throw some light on the translation of metaphor based on typology. What we mean is that certain types of metaphors caused greater effort to translate and were more often interpreted using SMCSW. On the whole, ontological metaphors fall into that category, while the respondents found less difficulty with structural ones. If we look closely at the type of ontological metaphor, we will discover that the ones translated using the abovementioned criterion are well-entrenched in the source language. It is also ontological metaphors which “lost” consistently their metaphoric status in the target language in the translations of all groups. In principle, ontological metaphors reflect the language’s own ways of conceptualisation and are deeply embedded in the conceptual makeup of the specific culture. In terms of divergence, structural metaphors are the ones that are rendered most differently by the three groups. The “non-competent” group differs more broadly from the PRO’s than the competent group, which attests to the idea that this type of metaphor is more culturally bound.

Although there is abundant research on Conceptual Metaphor involvement in Translation Studies, we have found only Jensen’s paper (Jensen, 2005) to be of relevance. As stated above, she analysed the translation output of three groups – non-professional translators, young professional ones (students of Translation Studies) and expert translators. Although her research design slightly differs from ours (she uses three texts from newspapers) her findings corroborate to a great extent ours. She has found that the non-professional group processed metaphors at the surface level; source text metaphors were translated by target text metaphors “when an immediate match could be found” (Jensen, 2005, p. 204). This aligns with our findings regarding the NCG and their use of SMCSW. As far as the other two groups in Jensen’s study, she asserts that
the more experience translators acquire, the fewer problems they encounter with metaphorical transfer, especially the one that requires more “associative processing”, or “an attempt of finding a different metaphor” (ibid.).

Conclusion
The main aim of this paper is to attempt to analyse the practical importance Conceptual Metaphor Theory may exert on the translation process and thus influence and transform translation training. We have endeavoured to find out if knowledge of CMT would have any impact on translation quality which would necessitate changes to translation teaching regarding immersion into cross-cultural knowledge and the development of an awareness of the pragmatic, semantic and textual function of metaphor.

Although the evidence deduced from the current study is by no means conclusive, we assuredly state that metaphoric (sub)competence does play a role in translators’ competencies. Such (sub)competencies may not be exclusively associated with Conceptual Metaphor Theory, nonetheless, they are inherently central to the quality of translation. All in all, metaphoric awareness cuts across linguistic, culture-specific and universal knowledge and thus is conducive to a successful translation process.

References


COULD MARRIAGE BE A GLORIFIED TRANSACTIONAL RELATIONSHIP? A COGNITIVE BLENDING APPROACH TO ANALOGIES OF MARRIAGE IN DHOLUO

George Ouma Ogal¹, Vicky Khasandi-Telewa², Evelyne Mahero³

¹,²,³Department of Literary and Communication Studies, Laikipia University, Kenya

Abstract: The last few decades have seen declining marriage rates as people prioritize other life goals over marital commitments. While the explanations for this shifting tide are multifaceted, scholarly evidence suggests that portrayal of marriage in a negative light scares many young adults from the institution. Every community equips its people with experiences, attitudes and linguistic resources to conceptualize abstract phenomena such as marriage. Against this background, this study seeks to analyze analogies of marriage in Dholuo to reveal how cultural resources and experiences influence the conceptualization of marriage. The study adopts a descriptive research design. Data for the study was collected through interviews. Forty (40) speakers of the Kisumu South Nyanza (KSN) dialect were asked to provide analogies used to describe marriage in Dholuo. A total of 66 analogies were collected. Four annotators used the synectic method of analogy identification to verify the collected expressions. One analogy which implies that marriage is a transactional relationship was selected for analysis using the Conceptual Integration Theory (CIT). The study found that analogies pervade daily conversations but they are unconsciously used to describe abstract phenomena such as marriage. Additionally, the study found that in some marriages in the Luo community, love chemistry, compatibility and emotional investment take a backseat and partners see each other as a means to satisfy their selfish interests. The findings also indicate that conceptual mental spaces as a tenet of the CIT provide a plausible model for interpreting marriage as an abstract concept in Dholuo. The study concludes that analogy is culture-specific and should be investigated through the lenses of a cognitive linguist.

Keywords: analogy, marriage, cognitive linguistics, mental spaces, Dholuo

About the author: George Ouma Ogal is a Doctoral candidate pursuing Applied Linguistics at Laikipia University, Kenya. His major research interests include Cognitive Linguistics, Indigenous Languages, Discourse Analysis, Sociolinguistics, English Language Teaching, Ecolinguistics, Cultural Linguistics, English Semantics and Pragmatics, Phonetics and Phonology.

About the author: Vicky Khasandi-Telewa, PhD, is an Associate Professor of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics at Laikipia University, Kenya. She is currently a Presidential Postdoctoral fellow at the Center for African Studies in Pennsylvania State University, USA. Her research interests are in Applied Linguistics in African contexts particularly Decoloniality, Language-in-Education policies, Discourses of Gender, Religion, Politics and governance, Refugees, and Ecolinguistics

About the author: Evelyn Mahero, PhD, is a lecturer in the department of Literary and Communication studies, Laikipia University. Her field of specialization is Applied Linguistics that includes Critical Discourse Analysis especially in the area of Language and Gender, Language and Power, Language and Culture, and Language and Ideology.

Copyright © 2024 George Ouma Ogal, Vicky Khasandi-Telewa, Evelyne Mahero

Article history: Received: 2 January 2024; Reviewed: 20 February 2024; Revised: 7 March 2024; Accepted: 10 March 2024; Published: 15 April 2024.

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Introduction: A Brief Background of Cognitive Linguistics

This study investigates analogies of marriage in Dholuo using Cognitive Linguistics (henceforth CL). According to Ntabo et al. (2022, p. 7), CL “was founded in the late 1970s and early 1980s” to explore the relationship between language and the human mind in creating utterances. This approach to language holds that every speech community employs specific linguistic resources to describe their experience of the world. As individuals use language, they draw from their sociocultural experiences, thought processes, perceptions and varied contexts to describe abstract phenomena. Language use mirrors various aspects of cognition which cannot be accounted for by formal branches of Linguistics (Evans & Green, 2018). The dissatisfaction with formal branches of linguistics was the departure point of studies investigating products of cognition such as analogy, metaphor, metonymy, counterfactual reasoning and idiomatic expressions among others. According to Fauconnier (2006), CL emerged after discontentment with Chomskyan grammar whose structure cannot describe backstage cognition motivating the meaning of an utterance. Generally, language is a product of thought processes in a sociocultural context. To establish meaning of utterances, therefore, one needs to consider the cultural resources, perceptions and experiences of individuals in a particular community.

A Cognitive Linguistic approach to language considers utterances to be products of embodied cognition. This means that speakers of a language rely on particular encounters, experiences and mental processes to create utterances. Weiskopf (2010) observes that speakers’ conceptual organization and the general representation of their physical environment combine to form the meaning of entities around them. The human brain has cognitive models which process raw perceptual data and transform them into mental images which are used to comprehend expressions such as analogy, metaphor, counterfactuals, idioms and referential obscurity among others. Unlike generative linguistics, which considers meaning peripheral to the study of language, CL maintains that meaning is the centre of any linguistic inquiry. Holme (2012) contends that if meaning is the focal point of linguistic inquiry, it is important to explore the cognitive, cultural and social contexts of expressions.

Analogy and Cognition

Analogy, the focus of this study, is a pervasive product of cognition which is used to comprehend abstract phenomena in terms of concrete entities. The term analogy is derived from the Greek word ‘anologos’ which means proportional relationships between two entities (Guerrière, 2019). Analogy compares two things to reveal the correspondence in their structures. The essence of comparing two things in analogous phrases is to clarify the partial similarity, dissimilarity or the parallels between the source domains and the target domains. According
Studies in Linguistics, Culture and FLT - Volume 12, Issue 1. ISSN 2534-9538

to Gentner and Smith (2012), analogy is “a kind of similarity in which the same system of relations holds across different sets of elements” (p. 186). This suggests that when two things are compared using analogy, they do not only share structural similarities but also operate in a similar way. This is the argument buttressed by Remias (2018) who points out that analogous comparisons provide models which one can use to predict structural and operational resemblances between source and target domains. Keshwani and Chakrabarti (2017) reiterate that the target domain is often an abstract phenomenon while the source domain is a physical or concrete entity. By mapping the attributes of the concrete domain on the target, analogy helps us understand the less familiar (target) in terms of the familiar (source).

Analogies deserve scholarly attention because they are common in everyday language use but sometimes people may fail to comprehend them due to culture-dependent cues used to generate them (White, 2015). Another reason for studying analogy is that it spices up a conversation by creating a vivid representation of the phenomenon being described for easier understanding. Guerrière (2019) points out that because analogy utilizes culture-specific resources to describe concepts, some people may be locked out of the meaning because they lack backstage cognition. Problems in analogy use arise from the fact that individuals who are not part of a cultural set-up may assign different interpretations to the analogies. Some of these interpretations may introduce features that do not align with native speakers’ mental representations or embodied experiences. Consequently, analogies of marriage in Dholuo may be interpreted differently by the native speakers of Dholuo. This study, therefore, investigates how linguistic resources and embodied experiences in the Luo community combine to describe marriage through analogies.

**Analogy and Marriage in Dholuo**

The marital experiences and circumstances under which one enters marriage influence the analogical expressions used to describe marriage. For instance, marriage can be conceptualized in terms of gardening, hospital or war among others (Gise, 2006; Diamond & Grama, 2022; Gathigia, 2014). In the Luo community, certain marriage practices such as *gemo* (negotiation), *meko* (abduction), and *por* (marriage by elopement) influence how one perceives marriage. Abduction and elopement are outdated practices that have no place in the modern society. However, marriage by negotiation is a common practice in the Luo community. According to Oduke (2016, p. 5), the Luo Community sets the bride price at a minimum of two live cows but the groom is likely to “receive pressure to give more” if his competitors are richer. This practice implies that marriage requires the exchange of women for the bride price. Besides, certain practices such as settling marital conflicts through fines, transactional sex and
the demand for monetary gifts in exchange for love and intimacy may lead to the conceptualization of marriage as a transactional relationship. According to Kwena et al. (2012), some marriages in the Luo community are founded on transactional sex along the shores of Lake Victoria. Some of the above activities associated with marriage in the Luo community may, to a great extent, influence the choice of phrases used to describe marital relationships in Dholuo.

The study chose to investigate marriage based on a number of reasons. First, marriage is not only the foundation of the society but also the basis of human relationships (Bethmann & Kvasnicka, 2011). Second, the number of adults who choose to settle in marriage continues to diminish as the degree of importance attached to marriage also continues to wane (Sassler & Lichter, 2020). Some adults are adamant about entering marriage, while others choose to get married on their terms. According to Manning et al. (2019), a large number of adults prefer cohabitation or the pursuit of other life goals such as education to marriage. Research also demonstrates that various attitudes associated with marriage directly influence the choice of getting married among adults. Leonhardt et al. (2022) postulate that expressions used to describe marriage in various communities influence the number of individuals who may get married or prefer other life engagements. Based on these reasons, the present study employed the CIT to investigate how marriage is conceptualized using analogies in Dholuo.

Dholuo is a Nilotic language spoken by the Luo community in Kenya. Native speakers of Dholuo are called Joluo (Luos) while the area where the language is predominantly spoken is referred to as piny Luo (Luo land). The Kenya National Bureau of Statistics (2019) estimates Dholuo speakers to be 5,066,966. Otieno (2014) observes that Dholuo is principally spoken in Siaya, Homa-Bay, Migori and Kisumu counties. There are two mutually intelligible dialects of Dholuo: Kisumu South Nyanza (KSN) and the Boro-Ukwala (BU) dialects (Aduda, 2013). The KSN dialect is chiefly spoken in the geographic areas such as Kisumu, Homa-Bay and Migori counties while the BU dialect is predominantly spoken in areas such as Alego, Yimbo, Gem, Ugenya, Yala and the larger part of Siaya county. The BU dialect is spoken in a smaller geographical region and is considered less prestigious (Yamo, 2014). The KSN dialect is regarded to be socially prestigious because it is not only spoken in the larger region but is also widely used in Dholuo broadcast, literature and Dholuo Bible. This is the argument buttressed by Ogutu (2019) who reiterates that KSN dialect is used in print media, radio stations and electronic media among others. The present study, therefore, investigated analogies of marriage in the KSN dialect of Dholuo.
Theoretical Framework

The study was guided by the Conceptual Integration Theory (CIT) which was originally proposed by Fauconnier and Turner (2008). The CIT was further improved by Coulson and Oakley (2005). Generally, the CIT enables one to comprehend abstract linguistic data by integrating information from different communication contexts into a single unit called a blend. Also known as the Blending Theory (Close & Scherr, 2015), Many Space Model (Gathigia, 2014), and Mental Spaces Theory (Tucan, 2013), the CIT is resourceful in retrieving information from human memory and matching it with pragmatic information to yield special meaning within the context of use. While Džanić (2007) observes that the CIT was initially employed in the study of indirect reference and referential obscurity, recent studies have used the theory to investigate products of cognition such as idiomatic expressions, metaphor, analogy and metonymy among others.

The CIT uses mental spaces as a major tenet to describe analogical connections between source domains and target domains. The mental spaces comprise the input space one, input space two, the generic space and the blended space (Džanić, 2007). The explanation of linguistic phenomenon using the CIT proceeds in four steps. First, an expression with a hypothetical blend is introduced. Second, one describes the conceptual structure of both the target domain and the source domain. The features of the two domains are displayed in input spaces one and two. After this, the common information in the two input spaces is projected into the generic space (Coulson & Cánovas, 2009). The generic space refers to the packet which captures information shared between the source and target domains. The generic space is connected to the two input spaces using dotted lines.

In the last stage, shared information in the input spaces is selectively projected to the blended space. Coulson and Oakley (2005) observe that during selective projection, background information is matched with the details in the input spaces to create a special meaning within the context of use. The selective projection creates a conceptual integration network of the four mental spaces. The blended space integrates information in the input spaces with inferential information drawn from the context of an utterance to create a new meaning in the emergent structure. According to Ntabo et al. (2022), the emergent structure uses contextual accommodation across domain thus creating special meaning within the context of the utterance. Figure 1 below presents a conceptual integration network of the four mental spaces.
The CIT uses three blending processes to explain an expression. First, composition is a blending process which involves ascribing information in input space one to input space two. The second process called completion involves retrieving information from long-term memory and matching it with the blend. Polak (2017) posits that during completion, one retrieves background information stored in the memory and matches it with the information in the input spaces to create special meaning within the context of use. For instance, divorce or separation of a family may be matched with constant quarrels or unfaithfulness. In the final blending process called elaboration, one creates a visual or pictorial representation of the situation in the mind. According to Džanić (2007) elaboration as a blending process “usually entails mental or physical simulation of the event in the blend” (p. 175). The three blending processes combine to create new inferences within a context hence explaining the meaning of a blend.

**Methodology**

The present study adopted a descriptive research design. Doyle et al. (2020) define descriptive design as an approach that seeks to provide an account of a research phenomenon as it is without manipulating the data. This is the argument buttressed by Nassaji (2015) who reiterates that descriptive research design endeavors to analyze that which is already available. A researcher should, therefore, collect the data using such instruments as questionnaires and interviews. The study used an interview schedule to collect analogous phrases of marriage in Dholuo among 40 KSN dialect speakers purposively sampled based on variables of age, gender and marital status. Klärner (2015) contends
that marriage is perceived differently depending on demographic variables such as age, marital status and gender.

A total of 66 analogies of marriage in Dholuo were collected through an interview schedule. The analogies were then subjected to inter-rater reliability measures in which four annotators established the analogous nature of each expression. The annotators used the synectic method of analogy identification to verify the collected expressions. According to Clapham (2003), the synectic method identifies analogies in four steps. First, analogous expressions use associations such as ‘A is like B.’ Second, the compared entities must be unrelated or disconnected. Third, the expression provides a brief explanatory note elaborating the structural similarity between the compared items. Girija (2014) observes that analogy compares unrelated entities and goes ahead to provide a brief explanation of their shared structures. The fourth step in analogy identification demands that the compared entities must have more than one structural similarity. That is, there must be many similarities between the source and target domains. The expressions were categorized as analogies if at least three annotators were in agreement. That is, if each expression was assigned 0.75 or 75%, it was considered analogous.

The collected analogies were translated into English. One analogy that depicts marriage as a transaction was purposively sampled for analysis because, as pointed out by Amin and Bajracharya (2011), depiction of marriage as a transactional relationship is one reason for dwindling numbers of those who prefer marriage in this age. Amin and Bajracharya further add that some marriages are “prohibitively expensive’ thus scaring young adults from getting married. Hamilton (2023) also asserts that love which glues many marriages has been replaced by material gains, thus marriage has become trade in many communities. This is the argument buoyed by Ali (2010) who contends that in the present age, many people conceptualize marriage as a transactional union where spouses exchange material gains for love and affection. Along these lines, the study set out to describe how Dholuo depicts marriage within the framework of the CIT.

**Findings and Discussions**

This study found that marriage in the Luo community is conceptualized as a business or transactional relationship. This is in line with the argument of Hamilton (2023), who observes that many marriages and romantic relationships at present operate like businesses where partners engage in transactions. Further, although many still fall in love and enter marital relationships, some see marriage as a business transaction which generates revenue and guarantees higher standards of living. According to Mojola (2014), marriage is depicted as a business because it is an institution where financial resources are exchanged
for intimacy and affection. Table 1 below presents Dholuo analogy depicting marriage as a transactional relationship.

Table 1. Inter-rater Reliability Measures for Kend en kaka ohala (marriage is like a business)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Dholuo</th>
<th>Gloss</th>
<th>Reliability Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Kend en kaka ohala</td>
<td>Marriage is like a business</td>
<td>Coder 1 0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Coder 2 0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Coder 3 0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Coder 4 0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total 1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To analyze the analogy kend en kaka ohala (marriage is like a business), this study proceeds in certain steps. The first step involves the description of the information contained in the source domain (business) and target domain (marriage). The source domain becomes the input space one while the target domain becomes input space two. When describing the conceptual structure of the two input spaces, we highlight the features of a business activity and map them onto marriage. The study noted that a business transaction involves two people (buyer and seller). The traditional business system in the Luo community is known as wiló (barter), which involves two parties exchanging goods without a currency (Okello, 2021). With the introduction of money, the two parties (buyer and seller) now use currency to exchange goods and services. Marriage involves two parties who attract each other in the fashion of a business transaction. According to Roth (2015), the person who woos the other is like a seller and the one being wooed is the buyer who falls for them.

A business person takes certain risks with the expectation of making profits. Although one intends to sell their products, there is no guarantee that the products will be bought. This makes a business activity a risk. Verbano and Venturini (2013) highlight theft, fire outbreaks, equipment failure, economic recession, change in tastes and natural disasters as some of the unforeseen circumstances that may lead to losses in business. Marriage is also depicted as a risk because the future of the couples is uncertain. Hiekel and Keizer (2015) describe marriage as a risky move in which partners stake their love and lives with the hope of living happily.

Business transactions are characterized by negotiations. Both the buyer and the seller discuss responsibilities and expectations to reach a mutual understanding. Similarly, marriage involves reaching an agreement through discussions and negotiations. Brannen and Wilson (2023) observe that marriages operate like a business when partners engage in give-and-take agreements with mutual understanding. This study also noted that in a business activity, an entrepreneur expects higher returns. This aspect corresponds to the expectation of a better living standards in marriage. Musick and Bumpass (2012) point out that while an entrepreneur is inspired to start a business with the expectation of higher
returns, couples in marriage are motivated to initiate a relationship with the promise of higher standards of living.

Duration and longevity are other points of correspondence between the source domain and the target domain. Generally, businesses seek to achieve short-term or long-term financial objectives. In contrast, marriages are meant to be lifelong commitments in which couples stick to each other through different stages of their lives. Unlike a business which may be dissolved due to poor performance, marriage is meant to last forever. In the Luo community, marriage is guarded by laws which discourage separation or divorce. According to Oguda (2012), the Luo culture imposes stringent measures and punitive laws on couples to discourage them from entertaining thoughts of separation or divorce. Marriage, therefore, is expected to be a lifelong commitment in the Luo community. The information contained in the two input spaces is summarized in Table 2 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Input Space 1 (Business)</th>
<th>Mapping</th>
<th>Input Space 2 (Marriage)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Buyer and seller</td>
<td></td>
<td>Husband and wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk</td>
<td></td>
<td>Uncertainty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiation</td>
<td></td>
<td>Give and take</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectation of returns</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expectation of wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short/long term</td>
<td></td>
<td>Lifelong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptability</td>
<td></td>
<td>Flexibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial commitment</td>
<td></td>
<td>Emotional connection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After describing the conceptual structure of each input space, the analysis proceeds to the generic space. In this space, common information between the source and target domains is projected. For instance, a business and marriage are both institutions. According to Atwood (2012), marriage and business are both institutions which operate to improve the welfare of individuals. As institutions, marriages and businesses have systems in place to track performance and remedy any unpleasant situations. The two input spaces also share communication as a common feature. Businesses require effective communication between clients and the entrepreneurs. Similarly, marriages thrive on heart-to-heart talks between partners. Further, businesses have clearly defined rules that regulate their operation. Such rules regulate supply, pricing, corporate behavior and marketing among others. Correspondingly, marriages are governed by rules of communication, conflict resolution, family fun and expenditure among others.

Another common feature in businesses and marriages is satisfaction. An entrepreneur remains committed to the business as long as there is satisfaction in the transactions. That is, dissatisfaction with business progress is one cause of closure. Similarly, marital satisfaction is a key contributor to marriage success. According to Khezri et al. (2020), factors such as partner loyalty, partner...
support, communication, spending time together and forgiveness are some of the factors that promote marital satisfaction.

After describing the conceptual structure of the generic space, the study proceeds to analyze the structure of the blended space where the new meaning of marriage emerges. Background details about a business reveal the intention of an entrepreneur. In spite of the economic situation and market factors, a business person will only remain in the market if there is gain. The word business is *ohana* or *loko* in Dholuo. Both words mean to exchange goods and services with something that generates revenue. The seller gains the money while the client gains the product or service. The collaboration between a buyer and seller serves one purpose: to gain something. Similarly, a marriage which is depicted as a business implies that the relationship is not founded on love but generation of income. Therefore, the meaning of the analogy *kend en kaka ohala* (marriage is like a business) comes out as a relationship in which partners pair up for financial or economic gain. The generic-blended space mapping for the analogy *kend en kaka ohala* (marriage is like a business) is presented in Table 3 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic Space</th>
<th>Mapping</th>
<th>Blended Space</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules</td>
<td>Rules</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment</td>
<td>Commitment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention</td>
<td>Intention</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Emergent meaning *Marriage is a relationship in which partners pair up for financial or economic gain.*

The Conceptual Integration Network (CIN) for the analogy *kend en kaka ohala* (marriage is like a business) is presented in Figure 2 below.
The above analysis has employed three blending processes. First, composition has introduced the frames of the source and target domains hence describing the features of the two input spaces. The completion process has been used to project the common features of the input spaces in the generic space. Lastly, the study has employed elaboration in which background information about marriage has been selectively projected to create special meaning. Elaboration has helped in the creation of a visual or pictorial image of the expression. The meaning of the analogy ‘marriage is like a business’ therefore comes out as a relationship in which partners pair up for financial or economic gain.

Conclusions

Based on the findings above, this study concludes that ohala (business) is suitably employed to conceptualize marriage in Dholuo. Further, the study indicates that marriage in the Luo community is depicted in transactional terms. That is, love chemistry, compatibility and emotional investment take a backseat and partners see each other as a means to satisfy selfish interests. Additionally, the conceptual mental spaces of the CIT aptly integrate to reveal how marriage is depicted as a transactional activity in the Luo community. Moreover, the synectic method of analogy identification is an effective procedure for verifying
analogous expressions. The synectic method qualifies expressions as analogous if the compared elements are unrelated, there is an explanatory note on structural similarity and there is more than one domain in the comparison. Therefore, analogy, which is a culture-specific product of cognition, should be explained using the Cognitive Linguistics approach.

References


POWER AND LOVE VERSUS DEATH: “DEATH CONSTANT BEYOND LOVE” BY GABRIEL GARCÍA MÁRQUEZ

Kuğu Tekin
Atılım University, Ankara, Turkey

Abstract: This article analyses the philosophy and literary aesthetics of Gabriel García Márquez’s political satire with reference to his short story, “Death Constant beyond Love.” The analysis is based on the author’s views concerning the common personality traits, actions and ends of tyrannical rulers made manifest in the main character of the story – Senator Onesimo Sanchez. It is observed that the philosopher-emperor Marcus Aurelius’ meditations on the transience of existence, and the mortality of man serve as the backdrop to the power-drunk Senator’s vain attempts to keep exercising his tyranny despite his awareness of his looming death. The story’s central theme is that misused political power – no matter how wide its scope – is limited by man’s transient corporeal existence, or by death, to put it more simply. The author’s reflections upon dishonest politicians as fictionalized in the Senator display how corruption defiles each individual in society. The discussion on the nature and ramifications of man’s boundless ambition for power also draws on Nietzsche’s will to power/will to life equation, and Foucault’s views on resistance-freedom/power proposition.

Keywords: Gabriel García Márquez, short story, political satire, tyrannical power, death

About the author: Kuğu Tekin is currently working as an Assoc. Prof. Dr. at Atılım University, department of English Language and Literature. She received her M.A. in English Language and Literature from Atılım University and her PhD in English Literature from Middle East Technical University, Ankara Turkey. Her research interests include post-colonial literature, urban studies, comparative literature.

e-mail: kugu.tekin@atilim.edu.tr ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0123-8523

Copyright © 2024 Kuğu Tekin

Article history: Received: 3 January 2024; Reviewed: 18 February 2024; Revised: 20 February 2024; Accepted: 26 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024.

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Suppose that a god announced you that you were going to die tomorrow or the day after. Unless you were a complete coward you wouldn’t kick up a fuss about which day it was – what difference could it make?

Aurelius, 2003, p. 47

In the short story titled “Death Constant Beyond Love,” Gabriel García Márquez meditates through his main character, Senator Onesimo Sanchez, upon man’s boundless ambition for power. At the onset of the story, it is said that the Senator has only “six months and eleven days to go before his death when he finds the woman of his life” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2055). What is surprising is that although the Senator is diagnosed with a terminal disease, and he is even given the exact time of his upcoming death, he neither thinks of leaving his political ambitions behind nor of spending his remaining time with his wife and five children; instead, he dedicates his whole being to his ongoing political campaign to be re-elected senator for the third time. The author’s portrayal of the Senator’s character draws attention to the concept of “will to power,” which is defined by Nietzsche as the basic human drive that is the limitless desire to impose one’s own will on others.

“Death Constant beyond Love” first appeared in García Márquez’s collection of short stories titled The Incredible and Sad History of Candid Erendira and Her Wicked Grandmother (1972). The collection’s very long title was also subtitled “Siete cuentos” (Seven Short Stories); and among the six other stories, “Death Constant beyond Love” stands out as an exception due to the narrative’s reliance on stark realism. To Frank Dauster, “the story is a powerful political satire [which is] a characteristic of García Márquez’s mature work” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 470). In a similar vein, Regina Janes argues that in his later works, García Márquez “integrates personal obsessions, literary allusion, and political interpretation,” especially after publishing his groundbreaking work, One Hundred Years of Solitude in 1967 (1984, p. 98). Concerning the function of politics in the author’s early works, Janes says, “political issues are either allegorised or serve as an indistinct backdrop against which a conflict between characters or within a character is enacted” (1984, p. 97). It is clearly seen that the issue of power politics is fully foregrounded, serving as the main theme in “Death Constant beyond Love.” Dauster claims that the story [is] a psychological study of the awakening to lust at an unfortunately advanced age of Senator Onesimo Sanchez” (1973, p. 470). The story appears to be a realistic exception because unlike the other six stories in the collection, it lacks the Márquezian fantasy elements, or fantastic laughter – except for the flying paper birds; yet, it still displays the author’s signature dark humour. García Márquez directs his
critical eye on his fictional corrupt characters, the desolate, sterile setting, and the lethargic townsfolk who do nothing to change their miserable plight.

In fact, the story’s title tells much about the futility of man’s desires and passions against the inevitable, omnipotent death. While titling his work, García Márquez subverts the Spanish poet Francisco de Quevedo’s seventeenth-century sonnet, “Amor constante más allá de la muerte” (“Love Constant beyond Death”), the theme of which is everlasting love against death. García Márquez reverses the places of the two nouns – “Love” and “Death” – to indicate that what conquers all is death, not love. Thus, at the very beginning, the author presents death as the sole invincible ending awaiting all human beings without any exception. Indeed, quoting the last part of Margaret Jull Costa’s English translation of Quevedo’s sonnet might be helpful in understanding how the dynamics of subversion operate in García Márquez’s story:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Soul that was prison to a god, } \\
\text{Veins that fueled such fire, } \\
\text{Marrow that gloriously } \\
\text{burned- } \\
\text{The body they will leave, } \\
\text{Though not its cares; } \\
\text{Ash they will be, but filled } \\
\text{with meaning; } \\
\text{Dust they will be, but dust in love }
\end{align*}
\]

The ending lines of Quevedo’s poem put emphasis on the ever-enduring quality of love compared to the transience of worldly ambitions. Obviously, the poetic persona believes in the immortality of the human soul and that the soul, transcending death, remains capable of carrying the indestructible residues of love—depicted as ashes and dust in the poem. While in Quevedo’s poem it is love that transcends all, in Márquez’s story it is death.

“Death Constant Beyond Love” is set in a fictional town called “Rosal del Virrey” (The Rosebush of the Viceroy). The name is ironic because the landscape of the town is dry and desert-like even though it is by the sea; and the only rose one can see is worn by Senator Sanchez on his jacket. Although the image of the sea is traditionally associated with the notions of procreation, regeneration, fertility, abundance and purification, this particular town yields the exact opposite impression. There is no sign of productivity, and the only wharf is haunted by smugglers at night. The townsfolk, who are periodically visited by Senator Sanchez during his electoral campaigns, are grossly marked by stagnation and inactivity. Although the Senator fulfils none of the promises that he makes to the town dwellers over the years, it never occurs to these people to question the Senator’s unjust illegal actions or to hold him responsible for his misdeeds and lies. Indeed, the opening of his public speech, which is laden with
Studies in Linguistics, Culture and FLT - Volume 12, Issue 1. ISSN 2534-9538

populist elements, and which he delivers with disbelief in his own words, reads as follows:

We are here for the purpose of defeating nature. We will no longer be foundlings in our own country, orphans of God in a realm of thirst and bad climate, exiles in our own land. We will be different people, […], we will be happy and great people. (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2056)

What is noteworthy is that although the Senator has been painting the same fake future in his memorized speech for many years, his audience listens to him in a state of great exuberance as if he were saying new things, and ready to make, this time, substantial reforms and investments that will change the poor socio-economic profile of the society for the better. Thus, the Senator’s helpers set up, for the third time, the same old cardboard city representing a prosperous city that will obviously never come; yet the townspeople neither protest nor give up voting for the Senator. The cardboard city displaying skyscrapers and ocean liners is used to convince the townsfolk to blindly vote for the Senator once more. On one level, this worn-out, fake city symbolizes the corruption and dishonesty of all politicians like Sanchez; yet on a more sophisticated level, the reference is made to the transience of existence and the mortality of man. This city could be thought of as a reworking of the timeless metaphor of the world as an illusory stage, where no action by man, whether evil or virtuous, bears any significance, since death and oblivion await in the end. The author relates this idea of the triviality of human life and especially of the futility of man’s boundless ambition for power to the Senator’s admiration for Marcus Aurelius’ Meditations. Marcus Aurelius Antoninus, who was the last of the five emperors of the Golden Age of the Roman Empire, was also a prominent Stoic philosopher. He is Sanchez’s only role model, his source of inspiration in political, social, and personal matters. The Emperor’s Meditations has been the Senator’s bedside reading for a long time. Particularly, after being told about the brevity of his time on earth, Sanchez’s reading of the philosopher-emperor Marcus Aurelius’ reflections on the inevitability of death and oblivion and the futility of struggles for power turn into an obsession. The emperor’s fearless stance against death, his understanding of death as a part of the natural process, and his conviction about the vanity of worldly power – no matter how great – are all reflected in the following words: “Death is not to be feared. […] It is a natural process, part of the continual change that forms the world. ‘Soon you will be dead and none of it will matter’” (Aurelius, 2003, p. xlii). Gregory Hays, the writer of the Introduction to Meditations, connects the emperor’s notions on death and oblivion to transience by stating that “All things change or pass away, perish and are forgotten” (Aurelius, 2003, p. xlii). As an ardent follower of the stoic emperor, one expects the Senator to be a person who has strength and courage in misfortune. Yet, despite his rational knowledge of these facts, when he is informed that he will die by the following Christmas, Sanchez grows
desperate and fearful; instead of assuming the courageous stance of his role model, Sanchez attempts to cheat death through his erotic passion for Laura Farina, to no avail. His lustful deeds lead to a huge scandal that destroys his seemingly unblemished political reputation, and he dies in desperate fury.

The epigraph to this article, which is taken from Marcus Aurelius’ *Meditations*, anticipates that the Senator dies as a “complete coward” for neither his educational background – he is a graduate of the highly prestigious Göttingen University – nor his history in active politics, or even his family prevent Sanchez from becoming involved in treachery and adultery. In *Meditations*, the philosopher-emperor categorizes human character as “dark, womanish, obstinate, wolf, sheep, child, fool, cheat, buffoon, salesman, tyrant” (Aurelius, 2003, p. 43). It is seen that among the emperor’s character types, “cheat” and “tyrant” are the most fitting nouns defining Sanchez’s personality traits. Added to his tyrannical and cheating character, the “wolf” at the beginning of the story gradually becomes the “sheep” and dies as the “fool.” Obviously, Sanchez learns nothing from the emperor’s notes on the significance of being a rational, honest, just, humble ruler, who is aware of the transience of worldly power and the mortality of man. The emperor’s reminders to himself about the transience of life and the importance of being a good person read as follows: “Not to live as if you had endless years ahead of you. Death overshadows you. While you are alive and able – be good” (Aurelius, 2003, p. 41). However, unabashed Sanchez ignores the emperor’s reflections on the concept of mortality, starts living as if he were immortal and recklessly falls in love with Laura Farina. Sanchez’s infatuation with Laura might be interpreted as his vain attempt to cheat death. Ekaterina Poljakova’s comment on Dostoevsky’s ideas on the nature of human love in *A Writer’s Diary* is that knowledge of the inevitability of death turns human love and happiness, even the entire humanity itself into nothingness: “And no matter how rationally, joyously, righteously, and blessedly humanity might organize itself on earth, it will all be equated tomorrow to that same empty zero” (2017, p. 124). Dostoevsky calls death “[an] enduring tyrant” and finds all kinds of material and sensual ambitions and passions – power, status, wealth, love and hatred – as meaningless, miserable attempts. Indeed, the end of the disillusioned Senator, weeping like a helpless, raging child in the presence of death, once more justifies Dostoevsky’s characterization of death as the “enduring tyrant.”

The Senator’s obsession with the nineteen-year-old Laura causes him to fall into the clutches of Laura’s criminal pharmacist father, who represents another dimension of the corruption in the town. Nelson Farina does not hesitate to sacrifice his own daughter to escape from justice; he offers her to the Senator in return for a fake identity card. This unscrupulous deal between the father and the Senator might be interpreted with reference to Dimitar Vatsov’s discussion on the interrelation between power and freedom. Vatsov’s article centers around
Nietzsche’s and Foucault’s views related to the issue. In Foucault’s later works, Vatsov argues, power is most often identical with government. Indeed, in his seminal essay, “The Subject and Power,” Foucault defines “the exercise of power as a mode of action upon the actions of others. To govern in this sense, is to structure the possible field of action of others” (Foucault, 1982, p. 790). Freedom, which, to Foucault, means resistance, is precisely complementary to power because without resistance, Foucault claims, there would only be a one-sided determination, not power. Considering the Foucauldian connection between power and freedom, it seems that the Senator is the one who holds power against Laura’s father at first. The Senator continually rejects Nelson Farina’s plea for a fake identity card until he falls in love with Laura: “Nelson Farina had begged for his help in getting a false identity card which would place him beyond the reach of the law” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2057). In that case, power is at the hands of Sanchez, and he consistently resists accepting Nelson’s unlawful demands as if he were an honest politician, a true believer in both legality and morality. Conversely, since Sanchez is a corrupt opportunist, he does almost nothing for his voters unless he receives a satisfying profit serving his political ambitions. Nevertheless, when Laura, “the most beautiful woman in the world” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2056), enchants Sanchez with her youth and charm, Nelson Farina seizes power and thereby the freedom to play with Sanchez, to make the Senator yield to his wishes. It is seen that, while to Foucault, resistance-freedom (that is, the freedom to resist) is a precondition of power, to Nietzsche it is not: “instinct for freedom [is] the will to power” (1887/2006, p. 59). For Nietzsche, 

[the] most fearful and fundamental desire in man, his drive to power – this drive is called freedom” (1968, p. 383). In addition, Nietzsche claims that one who has a higher degree of power also has the privilege of “freedom from good and evil and from true and false”. (1901/1968, p. 140)

In the case of García Márquez’s story, Sanchez’s obsession with Laura not only inflames Nelson’s instinct for freedom but also allows him to gain control over the actions of Sanchez; thus, the power/freedom binary switches places, and Nelson becomes the one who has a higher degree of power over the Senator. Considering the Nietzschesian power/freedom proposition, which bestows upon the more powerful person freedom from all moral codes, one cannot help thinking about the degree of corruption in Nelson’s already vile character. Indeed, Márquez’s brief depiction of Nelson Farina’s criminal personality reveals a murderer and a pure embodiment of evil, even when he is assumed to be a Nietzschesian herd man against the Übermensch (superhuman) Sanchez:

[Farina] had drawn and quartered his first wife. He had escaped from Devil’s Island and appeared in Rosal del Virrey on a ship [where he had met] a beautiful and blasphemous woman [...] by whom he had a daughter. The woman died of
natural causes [...] and she didn’t suffer the fate of the other, whose pieces had fertilized her own cauliflower patch, … (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2056)

Nevertheless, when Sanchez accepts to provide Farina with the fake identity card in return for Laura, the roles change, and while Sanchez becomes the herd man, Nelson turns out to be the Übermensch. This dirty deal between the two corrupt characters also proves that both lack the impulse or conscience to distinguish between what is commonly believed to be good and evil or true and false; and apparently, they have no intention to act in the right way either.

In “Nietzsche on The Value of Power and Pleasure,” Robert Shaver discusses Nietzsche’s conceptualization of power in relation to pleasure and higher types. While examining the deeper meanings of Nietzsche’s will to power and its connection to the essence of life, Shaver mainly focuses on Beyond Good and Evil:

…life itself is essentially appropriation, injury, overpowering of what is alien and weaker; suppression, hardness, imposition of one’s own forms, incorporation and exploitation […] Exploitation belongs to the essence of what lives […] it is a consequence of the will to power, which is after all the will of life. (Nietzsche qtd in Shaver, 2022, p. 9)

Shaver comes to the conclusion that “since life is essentially will to power, the enhancement of life requires enhancing power” (2022, p. 9). The power struggle between the Senator and Nelson Farina ends with Farina’s victory; that is to say, he enhances his life by enhancing his power over the Senator’s weakness—which is his desperate attempt to cheat death by exploiting the youth and beauty of Laura Farina. But how could a criminal figure like Nelson strengthen his hand against the omnipotent Sanchez? The answer is that Nelson exploits his own daughter’s youth and “unusual beauty” just like Sanchez does. In addition, before sending Laura to Sanchez in her best attire, he tells Laura to put on a chastity belt and keeps the key to himself to guarantee the promised fake identity card. In doing so, Nelson not only obtains his new identity card but also punishes the Senator for lusting after Laura; otherwise, he has no real concern for his daughter’s “honour” (as per the story’s patriarchal setting) and no intention of protecting her against any potential sexual violence. Upon noticing the chastity belt, the Senator, who is on the verge of death, is at first enraged, but when he questions Laura concerning what she and his voters truly think about his personality and public image, he calms down. The dialogue between the two reads as follows:

‘What have you heard about me?’
‘Do you want the honest to-God truth?’
‘The honest to-God truth.’
‘[...] ‘They say you’re worse than the rest because you are different.’ (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2060)
The honest public opinion of his character overshadows “his most hidden instincts” for a while, and he tells Laura that he will settle Farina’s identity trouble. In addition, he tells Laura that he does not want the key; he only wants her to lie next to him. This chastity-belt key, which is kept by Nelson, might be briefly interpreted with reference to the definitions of the Nietzschean power-pleasure relationship by Maudemarie Clark and Bernard Reginster, respectively. To Clark, “[p]ower is the ability to satisfy one’s desires” (1990, p. 211). Whereas for Reginster, “[t]he will to power is the will to seek out and overcome resistance to satisfying one’s desires” (2006, p. 132). The epiphanic moment in the story is the scene where the Senator fails to satisfy his lustful desires because that very moment coincides with his realization of not only Nelson’s victory but also of his loss of power. Obviously, Sanchez’s “most hidden instinct” is his fear of death. Thus, both furious and helpless, Sanchez sinks into his inner world, into his dark solitude, while Laura lies beside him silently. The Senator ponders upon his legacy, the way his name will be remembered, and his posthumous public reputation. In order to relax and encounter his fate courageously like a Stoic, he closes his eyes and starts thinking of Marcus Aurelius’ ideas on the inevitability of death and oblivion: “Remember, [Sanchez] remembered, that whether it’s you or someone else, it won’t be long before you’ll be dead and it won’t be long before your name won’t even be left” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2060). The emperor’s words remind Sanchez of the vanity of his boundless ambition for power and his attempts to leave behind an everlasting glorious name. He also painfully realizes that the all-powerful enduring force is death, rather than love: “...six months and eleven days later he would die [...], debased and repudiated because of the public scandal with Laura Farina and weeping with rage at dying without her” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2060).

García Márquez’s portrayal of Senator Onesimo Sanchez as a corrupt politician who has tyrannical tendencies might be traced as a recurrent archetype in the author’s literary oeuvre. According to José Anadon, García Márquez’s description of the personality traits of his tyrant characters, especially their endings, displays certain similarities. Based on many interviews with the author, Anadon states that the feeling García Márquez’s tyrant characters evokes in the audience is neither “outrage” nor “shock,” but “pity”:

…the tyrant is a man to be pitied. Think of it, after all his excesses he should not be condemned, we should not even feel outrage or shock, but pity. In García Márquez’s view, the dictator is both a victimizer and a victim. In this respect, he looks just like […] any of us. And anybody who has or has had power in his or her hands probably knows its pitfalls. Power attracts, and is sought with passion. Yet power is one of the greatest illusions for human beings, the source of the greatest feelings of emptiness in life. (1989, pp. 23-24)

Likewise, Senator Onesimo Sanchez embodies all the characteristics García Márquez attributes to his fictional dictators. At first, he is the victimizer of his
loyal poor voters who do not give up re-electing him despite his unfulfilled promises and lies. Sanchez’s communication with the helpless people of “Rosal del Virrey” and his hypocritical strategies are based on profit maximization or, to put it more precisely, on the principle of taking everything without giving anything in return. Obviously, a customary policy for the Senator prior to the elections is to walk around his disadvantaged voters and to seem concerned with their various needs and problems: “The senator listened to them good-naturedly and he always found some way to console everybody without having to do them any difficult favors” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2057). Among these easy favors the scene where the Senator agrees to give a donkey to a needy woman whose husband left her and his six children to work “on the Island of Aruba” is noteworthy. The scene is pathetic as well as humorous. The woman wants the donkey to carry water from the “Hanged Man’s Well.” After a short while, one of the Senator’s men brings the woman “a donkey with a campaign slogan written in indelible paint on its rump so that no one would ever forget that it was a gift from the senator” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2057). Thus, the Senator exploits not just the present miserable condition of his voters but also their future; and more importantly, he is exploiting the townspeople together with his accomplices, whom the author calls “the important people of Rosal del Virrey” (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2058). The Senator meets with his corrupt supporters just before the election day to explain and warn them about what would befall them in case he fails to be re-elected; meanwhile, the senator is watching the movement of the paper birds flying around the room with the help of an electric fan. The Senator says:

We, of course, can’t eat paper birds. You and I know that the day there are trees and flowers in this heap of goat dung, the day there are shad instead of worms in the water holes, that day neither you nor I will have nothing to do here, do I make myself clear? (Márquez, 1970/1999, p. 2058).

A final discussion on the above quotation, prior to the concluding remarks, appears to be necessary to see the scope of corruption among the local administrators. It is evident that the well-being of the Senator and his accomplices depends on doing nothing to improve the life standards of the townsfolk. The Senator speaks to his subordinates in a sickly manner partly because of his illness, but mostly because he knows how to manipulate them as well as their equally corrupt counterparts in other towns in the desert. In brief, the Senator makes his audience fully grasp that their sole way of protecting their present wealthy status as the privileged ruling elite hinges on keeping the townsfolk destitute, without allowing any improvements that might lead to prosperity. To put it another way, the Senator should always be the absolute decision-maker governing the compliant townspeople. In Foucauldian terms, that kind of rule is not power but “one-sided determination,” for such power lacks resistance as in the case of the submissive townsfolk of “Rosal del Virrey.” Yet, Nelson Farina’s
resistance to power, which is represented by Senator Onesimo Sanchez, enables Farina to achieve freedom and hence to become the one who has a higher degree of power than Sanchez. The criminal Farina takes full advantage of the dying Sanchez’s weakness resulting from his irresistible passion for Laura Farina. Nelson Farina’s victory over the Senator confirms Nietzsche’s power/freedom equation; that is, freedom is power and power is freedom. Perhaps, it is not cancer but rather losing his will to power which costs Sanchez his will to life; and certainly, it is love that leads Sanchez to yield to death in tears, agony and rage. Thus, García Márquez subverts the ashes and dust of the everlasting love in Francisco de Quevedo’s poem to the ashes and dust of shame at the end of his story.

References


SPACE IN WILLIAM SHAKESPEARE’S  
THE TRAGEDY OF HAMLET, PRINCE OF DENMARK  
Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu¹, Daniela Anisiei²  
¹²“Vasile Alecsandri” University of Bacău, Romania  
Abstract: The paper deals with the concept of space in William Shakespeare’s “The Tragedy of Hamlet, Prince of Denmark”. Not only is the play the most popular and the most internationally known creation of William Shakespeare, but it also attracts readers and critics for its complexity and up-to-datedness. We chose to analyse various aspects of space in this tragedy to underline their influence on different characters. The paper aims at proving that there is a relation between each character and a particular space whose features are partly reflected in the characters’ personality or/and actions. Therefore, the main characters were analysed in connection with the spaces they appear in throughout the play. We were also interested in analysing whether the characters have the necessary power and/or ability to change these spaces, or not. We noticed that some of the characters had their spaces invaded by perpetrators, while other characters became perpetrators themselves. Observing the link between spaces and the characters’ personality, we tried to scrutinize their deeds based on the features of certain spaces emphasizing aspects such as: private vs. public, natural vs. artificial.  
Keywords: space, masculine vs. feminine, natural vs. unnatural, order vs. disorder  
About the author: Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu is a member of the Department of Foreign Languages at “Vasile Alecsandri” University of Bacău. She delivered her PhD thesis in philology (in the field of Gender in German literature) at ‘Al.I.Cuza’ University of Iași and for more than 20 years has been writing articles and books in the following areas: gender studies, Victorian literature, the English Renaissance and children’s literature. She participated in over 40 (inter)national conferences (Bordeaux - France, Bălți and Chișinău-Republic of Moldova, Chernivtski – Ukraine), was a member in 3 international projects and 1 project funded at “Vasile Alecsandri” University of Bacău.  
e-mail: balinisteanu.catalina@ub.ro  
ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0009-0009-7645-1768  
About the author: Daniela Anisiei holds a BA degree in Political Sciences and graduated a MA programme in Communication Sciences at National School of Political and Administrative Studies, Bucharest, Romania and is currently preparing her BA thesis in English Literature, due in July 2024 as a final year student at “Vasile Alecsandri” University of Bacău, Faculty of Letters. She is also a primary school teacher in Piatra-Neamț, Romania. She participated in students’ conferences organised by UVA Bacău (2022, 2023) and in the 2023 “Politics and Poetics of Difference” Conference organised by Nicolaus Copernicus University from Torun, Poland. She has articles pending publishing in scientific journals due in spring 2024, and one was published in RoBrit (Alma Mater, Bacău).  
e-mail: daniela.litere@gmail.com  
Copyright © 2024 Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu, Daniela Anisiei  
Article history: Received: 28 January 2024; Reviewed: 14 February 2024; Revised: 29 February 2024; Accepted: 8 March 2024; Published: 15 April 2024.  
This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.  
Motto: “Place is important, to the degree to which, the historical and geographic coordinates are significant to the action.”

Wood, 1987, p. 27

Introduction

We cannot speak about the concept of space in *The Tragedy of Hamlet, Prince of Denmark* without asking ourselves a very basic question: why is a prince from Denmark one of the most known Shakespearean protagonists of all times? In 1589, Thomas Nashe mentioned a revenge play called *Hamlet* that was being played on London stages. Revenge plays were very popular in Elizabethan and Jacobean times when vengeance was sought and always found, and bloodshed was necessarily part of the retribution (Bălinișteanu-Furdu, 2021, p. 153).

Shakespeare’s son Hamnet, who is likely to have been named after a baker, Hamlette (also spelled Hammett), died in 1595 at the age of eleven, leaving the writer bereft. We can easily imagine that Shakespeare was drawn to the story of Hamlet after that sorrowful event, especially considering the various examples of fathers and sons/children encountered in the play. Some critics have even considered the play as autobiographical, but the protagonist’s name and one or two concepts or ideas are not enough to define it as such. As stated, he did not invent the story, he delivered a more elaborated version of the old Danish story of Prince Amleth, probably originating from around year 500, whose traditional name is an anagram of “Lamleth”, a form of “Lamech” which means some sort of moral distinction (Gillies, 2013, p. 398).

According to the *Glossary of literary terms*, the entire setting of a dramatic writing is the “general locale” and the “setting of a single episode or scene within the work is the particular physical location in which it takes place.” (Abrahams, 2009, p. 330). Moreover, the German researcher, Habermas, known as a theoretician of the public sphere, analysed the concept of public space and its evolution throughout history. The initial separation of concepts between *public* and *private* occurred in Ancient Greece, where ‘polis’ which took place in ‘agora’ (the place for open interactions between free individuals) differed from ‘oikos’ (the domestic dimension, attached to the dwelling) (Habermas, 1991, p. 3). Later, the Romans further set a clear distinction between ‘publicus’ and ‘privatus’ (Habermas, 1991, p. 5). Habermas was certain that the German word ‘privat’ had its origin in the Latin language, and the meaning was almost similar to the English one (“private”) meaning the “exclusion from the state apparatus”. The word “public” appeared later, in the 17th century, in France, referring to the court, the spaces of the urban nobility, and the bourgeoisie (Habermas, 1991, p. 31). What we intended to analyse in this paper was the distinction between ‘private’ and ‘public’ spaces, how their characteristics
influenced the personality of people. Furthermore, we also aimed to demonstrate how William Shakespeare managed through his own version of the legend of the Danish Prince Amleth to endow spaces with traits which would help readers and spectators understand the characters’ mentality and failings.

**Denmark – a kingdom at the crossroads**

Shakespeare chose Denmark as the setting of the play, and as with some of his other plays, he borrowed the plot from an existing source. The original story is taken from *Gesta Danorum (The Deeds of the Danes)*, a 13th-century historical work by Saxo Grammaticus who wrote it as a history of the Danish kings and heroes. Despite containing the Scandinavian legend of “Amleth” (Gillies, 2013, p. 398), it seems the play itself was not fully accurate, since little in the play suggests the writer knew much about Denmark. For example, aside from Rosenkrantz and Guildenstern – the actual names of two noble Danish families – none of the characters’ names are Danish.

Shakespeare was also inaccurate about Denmark’s geography and like most of his contemporaries took little care for historical or geographical realities. Exotic locations were popular with the audience of the time and gave playwrights the chance to comment indirectly on current events in an effort to avoid censorship. The play takes place outside the boundaries of England – in Denmark, due to other reasons as well. All actions happen in a foreign country, “the actions that take place therein, could be justifiably considered ‘external’ or ‘exterior’ to the main hub of Elizabethan life” (Emmerichs, 2003, p. 48), especially since we are dealing with the shedding of a lot of innocent blood, corruption, and lack of virtues. England is able “to maintain its interiority and even elevate its status to superiority” (Emmerichs, 2003, p. 48) due to its distancing from criminality, wrongdoings and non-civilised acts occurring at the peripheries.

Even from the very beginning of the play, we are informed of that fact that “something is rotten” in Denmark (I.4.100). This means that Denmark’s situation is comparable to a fish that rots from head to tail, and it implies the corruption from the very top of political hierarchy, a situation which “plunges the country and his family into complete disarray” (Bălinișteanu-Furdu, 2021, p. 167). Claudius and Gertrude’s incestuous marriage is a sign of this rottenness as King Claudius “defies moral values by marrying his sister-in-law, by plotting to have his nephew killed” (Bălinișteanu-Furdu, 2021, p. 167). This marriage is morally suspicious, as it takes place only two months after the former King’s death, and as it cannot be religiously accepted. These circumstances cause Prince Hamlet’s anger, and the brevity of the Queen’s mourning supports the idea of a suspicious death of the old King Hamlet. The phrase “There is something rotten in Denmark” (I.4.100) gains further significance in the play since it is uttered by a commoner, who knows that if the elite are corrupted,
the order of the state ceases to exist. The conditions prevailing in Denmark are highly intriguing and confusing. Amid this confusion, Hamlet’s other remark “Tis an unweeded garden” (I.2.139) reinforces the idea of degradation and lack of order. When his father’s ghost tells him a chilling story in Act 1, Scene 5, Hamlet realizes the extent of Denmark’s internal chaos. This type of description is found in literature, politics, at the royal court, in economics and in everyday life, when referring to corruption. It perfectly signals a corrupt leader known for his misruling and corrupt administration, suggestion that something out-of-place is happening.

Denmark is a Northern European country, populated by less instinctual people than the Mediterranean people. It is a small but important country since it is an old kingdom, and we know that most of Germanic heroes from Old northern literature have their origins in this area. It is also a country and kingdom with a long history, known for its advanced level of culture, civilisation, and knowledge. The decay in meaning and representation, of the word “king” is also evident in the uses of the word “Denmark”. The King and the country are one and thus the word “King” is often replaced by “Denmark” or “the Dane”, as he is the symbol of the whole country. One example of such identification is the description of the old king’s ghost: “that fair and warlike form/ In which the majesty of buried Denmark/ Did sometimes march” (I.1.56-7). It is a symbolic image of a central figure of a kingdom: “fair”, “warlike” and “majesty” (I.1.55-6). That is why the famous line “Something is rotten in the state of Denmark” (I.1.100) points to a perverted/corrupt centre of the system. Also, when Horatio has a premonition that the ghost of Denmark will be responsible for “some strange eruption to our state” (I.1.68), his use of the pronoun “our” refers to all inhabitants of Denmark (Emmerichs, 2003, p. 42).

The events in The Tragedy of Hamlet, Prince of Denmark famously occur in Denmark, but mostly within the constructed space of the castle Elsinore. Emmerichs (2003, p. 39) thinks that William Shakespeare intentionally insisted that “we know very little” about the scenery of the play, granting theatre directors a lot of freedom when choosing the way to set up the stage, as he did in many of his other plays. The details related to the space where the actions happen are also limited: the whole play takes place in a “room”, “a castle”, “a graveyard” within a “churchyard” and all these are situated in Denmark. Paton (p. 140) quoted by Emmerichs (2003, p. 40) thinks that “critics associate landscape with issues of power and possession of the external and of other”, therefore, Ophelia, Hamlet, and the current king himself, Claudius “offer space a meaning” (LaFave, 2018, p. 8), but the nation-state is “rotten”, and he perpetuates its rottenness. Horatio refers to the ghost as “the majesty of buried Denmark” and the ghost calls his own ear the “whole ear of Denmark” (I.5.43). Claudius continues this tendency of associating the king with the whole nation by replacing mentions of himself
with the concept of Denmark, the man becomes the space he controls, and the other way around.

It appears that each character shares an intimate and unique relationship with his/her space, but we should also consider the concept of “unity of space” (Wood, 1987, p. 27), as well as the characters’ proximity to each other. In this context, the place becomes a space of perpetual surveillance and vigilance, characters eavesdrop on each other, scrutinising the others’ behaviour to identify possible secret intentions, such was Polonius’s spying act from behind the curtains, which unfortunately led him to his death. This proximity leads to subtle judgements as if the characters are trying and even succeed in reading each other’s thoughts (Wood, 1987, p. 27).

**Elsinore between private and public existence**

Elsinore is not an ordinary castle: it has its own name (like Heorot, from *Beowulf*) and it becomes a social construct as well, segmented between the private and the public life of the characters. The space itself transgresses its limits as a building and it soon becomes the embodiment of a human being; for example, the text abounds in adjectives when it comes to describing it. Elsinore is in fact the English spelling of Helsingør, a town on the eastern coast of Denmark that used to be an important military site; Emmerichs suggests that “a castle or a ‘court’ is representative of urbanity and city life” (2003, p. 48), therefore, Elsinore with its order, laws, rules, and regulations “provides a moral landscape” for the whole country which should leave “little room for ghosts or similar otherworldly apparitions” (p. 48) that might eventually cause confusion in the people’s set of moral values. Presumably, its prototype was the castle of Kronborg, the most modern castle in Europe in the 16th century, and apparently even King James I (Great Britain’s future king) stayed there after his marriage to Anne of Denmark. A fortress had stood in the town since the Middle Ages, so the castle aimed at being the symbol for the nation’s stability and prosperity, especially when Frederick II of Denmark, who was actually very fond of theatre and actors, rebuilt the fortress, transforming it into an amazing castle (Stitt, 1984, p. 67).

Since the king was replaced in strange circumstances, Elsinore castle has become a less serene entity, the characters are always there to spy on each other, and the castle has adopted an air of suspicion and of constant scrutiny. It seems as if the walls of the castle had ears, nothing said in private stays private, the only secret remaining the apparition of the ghost, but Hamlet himself eventually discloses it to his mother.

Emmerichs (2003, p. 45) identifies a sort of dichotomy between the outdoor and the indoor in the Renaissance conventions, according to which each type of space draws upon itself a specific kind of behaviour: there seems to be a tendency
to locate “most vice in the towns and most virtue in the countryside” (Thomas, 1983, p. 246). In the Renaissance literature, nature appeared in its purity and the city is illustrated with its vicious depravity and wickedness. This play, however, constitutes a mixture of both types of landscape: “nature as ideal and perilous, and urbanity as lawful and lawless all at once” (Emmerichs, 2003, p. 47). We further concur with Thomas’ observations (1983, pp. 246-7) upon “life in the countryside [that] lacked the anonymity which made city a better setting for clandestine intrigue (…) [Nature] also offered an escape from urban vices and affects, a rest from the strains of business, and a refuge from dirt, smoke and noise of the city”. Consequently, Elsinore’s urban character provides the appropriate atmosphere for Claudius’ surreptitious aims and atrocious deeds.

**Hamlet’s home**

Many actions occur in individual spaces, which end up borrowing features from their inhabitants; however, Elsinore can be defined as a social construct because of its public character. The protagonists can be defined through the relationship they have with the occupied space, through comparison and occasionally through antithesis; their feelings and the unique way each perceives a particular setting help build one’s personality. Therefore, Elsinore becomes synonymous with Hamlet, a dominant space that deeply impacts the play, by emphasizing the built setting, as opposed to the natural one. The voices from the built, artificial (=unnatural) environment are masculine, fundamentally linked to death, murder, treason. The natural environment seems more like a feminine space, connected with life, fertility, birth, and re-birth (expressed in the motif of the orchard). The aforementioned spaces somehow work against each other. The masculine, monarchical power is associated with the social and mental meaning specific to the court. The most obvious aspect of the dichotomy masculine-feminine, however, can be observed in the depiction of Ophelia’s madness, which derives directly from pre-defined patriarchal order (Ronk, 1994, p. 21).

The hazards of nature were specifically highlighted when Queen Elizabeth I travelled to the countryside to watch a form of drama called “landscape entertainment” (Lesley quoted in Emmerichs, 2003, p. 43). The queen’s presence on premises such as: the heath, the field, the garden, the seaside, or the park was considered very risky since this setting could be quite dangerous; the monarch was outside the “architectural expression of authority” when she was mobile, because these spaces represented “decreasing safety and increasing loss of authority and control” mostly because “when royalty wanders, peril follows” (Lesley in Emmerichs, 2003, p. 43). It becomes therefore obvious that practical reasons lead to the distrust in a natural landscape, so, royals are generally afraid of going far away from the castle, to get out of their comfort zone.
For the main protagonist, however, the castle that once gave him comfort, suddenly becomes a “dungeon” (II.2.265). Elsinore also becomes for Hamlet an extension of the whole country. The protagonist tries hard to protect the castle and the country mainly for the sake of others, of his family and of his people. He speaks of both (the castle and the country) as if they were his best friends. This place, depicted almost like a horror-film setting, is still familiar to Hamlet; he trusts it, it is still his beloved home, and the dark atmosphere recently created does not scare him, but it brings him his internal turmoil/conflict. He is no longer at ease in his own home, he resembles a prince kept in a Gothic-like dwelling, which has lately turned into a prison. Elsinore functions as a private space to Hamlet and everything there is familiar to him (because it is his childhood home), although the castle remains essentially a public place. Hamlet, in his criticism of the new king, says that “Elsinore’s a dungeon” (II.2.265) because of the king’s terrible secret which transforms the whole country into a place filled with all sorts of criminals and even murderers. The new corrupted king sends his spies, Rosenkrantz and Guildenstern, to find the truth about Hamlet’s madness, a “pretended insanity, for safety reasons” that “protects him from his enemies” and helps him “gain time to prepare for his goals” (Bălinișteanu-Furdu, 2021, p. 169). Therefore, Denmark’s image seems to be subjected to degradation which is acknowledged by everybody (the Danes, as well as the audience) through the allusion to “something rotten” and then through Hamlet’s own presentation of the Danish “drunkards”. And this negative representation of the state, in his opinion, starts from the King (Milica, 2014, p. 96):

The king doth wake to-night and takes his rouse,
Keeps wassail and the swaggering up-spring reels;
And as he drains his draughts of Rhenish down,
The kettle drum and trumpet thus bray out
The triumph of his pledge. (I.4. 9-13)

Elsinore’s space, built by human hands, however, blends with Hamlet’s mental space and creates a new hybrid space – the one defined by the land, as by the man who leads it. Thought, mentality, and opinion also help produce space. Elsinore is a prison because Hamlet conceives it to be so. LaFave (2018, p. 10) thinks that Elsinore’s built setting contrasts with the natural one, which is “synonymous with nurturing, abundance, and other feminine qualities”. Throughout the play, “the women are attached to nature while the men see nature not as something, they are willing to embrace or to understand, but something they use in creating their own environments.” (LaFave, 2018, p. 10).

Even when Hamlet addresses nature metaphorically, the result is “an unweeded garden, that grows to seed” (I.2.139). Hamlet’s representation of the natural environment is always associated with waste, concuring with Wilson’s opinion (2002, p. 112) who emphasizes how space in this tragedy appears as “a continuous
representation of filth” due to “Shakespeare’s dazzling language and his sense of tragic form” (LaFave, 2018, p. 15). Hamlet therefore mentions how “the court itself also seems out of place” (LaFave, 2018, 15), similar to his perception of time as being “out of joint” (I.5.210). Following Hamlet’s ideas, his perception of space, of other characters, such as the two women in his life – Ophelia and Gertrude, are also affected by this rottenness and sense of decay.

**Gertrude’s defiance of private space**
Concerning Gertrude, all spatial details referring to her expose the private existence, women had to restrict themselves to in a patriarchal society. Rackin (2005, p. 129) says that it was only natural, “in that era to institute gender as the essential axis of difference between people and to confine women within the household, which was being redefined as a private, domestic space, separate from the public world of masculine activity”, therefore, Gertrude’s chamber is a strongly “feminized space (Racking, 2005, p. 50).” She somehow destroys its privacy when she allows Polonius and Hamlet – now a male adult, not a child anymore – to enter her chambers. But this attitude is in line with her tendency to ridicule the sacred institution of marriage and her approach transforms her into a precursor of the rebellious modern women, a subversive critic of the conservative approach to private and domestic life. Her moral beliefs are decaying. She no longer treats her private space as a sacred place, as the medieval women would, and she is not afraid of facing the consequences of her behaviour.

Elsinore plays a totally different function for her, than for Hamlet. Some critics go as far as to consider Gertrude the main reason for all the problems that Denmark was facing. Newman (1985, p. 602), however, sees in Gertrude and other Shakespearean female characters the “contradictions between the enactment of repressive social structures manifested in genre (courtship and marriage) and the representation of powerful female protagonists.” Ophelia is the total opposite of Gertrude. She still follows the moral conventions, maybe due to her naivety and age, she still values the conservative principles specific to the women of her era, she is obedient to a manipulative father, and her first encounter with the harsh and tough reality proves to be fatal to her. Despite having these two contrasting women in his life, Hamlet already links women with the tendency to ignore moral values: “frailty thy name is woman” (I.2.150). These different representations of women are signs of incipient female emancipation and were in fact the unheard women’s voices wanting “to express themselves and gain more power and a stable position in the social life” (Bălînişteanu-Furdu, 2021, pp. 162-3). Newman (1985, p. 603) thinks that “by attributing to women power over language, such representation distances the play from its patriarchal ideology and thereby undermines and interrogates those repressive structures from which Shakespeare’s drama emerged.” Therefore, the common image of a woman as the guardian angel of the family, of the values and principles
specific to a patriarchal society, is replaced by a son, who is more interested in preserving morality than his own mother.

Even the Ghost in Act 1, Scene 5 identifies his former queen with lust, and tells Hamlet about her taste for “garbage”, comparing her “royal bed” with a mere place designed for sexual intercourse “a couch for...incest”. Mullaney (1994, p. 148) sees in the scene from her chambers the expression of misogyny, when Hamlet’s “act is in itself a violation of the queen’s presence”, and he has to “remind himself to use verbal rather than physical violence” therefore he decides to “speak <daggers> to her, but use none” (III.2.429). Apparently, the old King Hamlet blames only Claudius for the incestuous relationship, when he “considers his brother to be garbage, and lust” saying that he “will sate itself in a celestial bed and prey on garbage” (I.5.63-4). However, the negative connotation of the words he chooses to describe his wife’s personal space, also points a finger at her: “Let not the royal bed of Denmark be/ A couch for luxury and damned incest” (I.5.90). Some critics find Gertrude to be very similar to Eve, because of her complicity to murder and decay; but the stains on her very soul “Thou turn’st my eyes into my very soul,/ And there I see suchblack and <grainèd> spots/ As will not leave their tinct” (III.4.100-2) and this, in Gillies’ (2013, p. 416) opinion, “speak(s) the language of sin, not crime – the primal sin of Eve.”

We can easily identify a ‘garden metaphor’ which is the traditional image of Jesus Christ’s mother for nurturing all Christians and for trying to get them rid of the weeds (=sins). In total antithesis is Gertrude’s neglected garden, which “grows to seed” and is filled with “things rank and gross” (I.2.140). Here Hamlet is the one who has the motivation and the duty to redeem it, as Adams (1994, p. 230) identifies the two types of Shakespearian mothers as “normal and deviant”. She further believes that: “Gertrude becomes the active agent in old Hamlet’s murder, having corrupted Claudius and persuaded him to commit murder by seducing him. In this reconstruction, the lusting body of the sexualized mother is the source of chaos and death. Hamlet (is) given life within her body” (Adams, 1994, p. 230).

When he associates his mother’s space with “rank and gross” (I.2.140), this may be a connection with Gertrude’s fertility, and Hamlet is the one who sets boundaries to her garden, therefore to her space and implicitly to her sexuality, thus imposing a fence, perhaps taking the role of her gardener. Emmerichs (2003, p. 41) on the other hand, thinks Hamlet’s words “rank and gross” were “analogous to the perilous orchard in which his father had met his own treacherous death” and could actually describe his own life, rather than his mother’s space, seeing in the chosen metaphor a vivid connection to the space where old King Hamlet found his perfidious death: an orchard. Emmerichs (2003, p. 41) concludes that “none of these characters, Hamlet, (old) King Hamlet, or Ophelia, can rise above
the ineluctable force of nature to save themselves from ultimate ruin, yet we can see how each metaphor ties the natural world to a specific human characteristic or emotion grief, madness, revenge, betrayal.”

In William Shakespeare’s times, we hardly speak about the beginning of the woman’s emancipation. Many Shakespeare’s plays had an “uneasy relation to emergent notions of women’s nature” especially because “devoted mothers were difficult to find; mothers being usually considered unsatisfactory.” (Rackin, 2005, p. 134)

**Claudius’s control over space**

Old King Hamlet was abusively removed, and the new king brought with him new rules, the corrupted rules of a murderer. Claudius “ascribe(s) meaning to space (...) and tie(s) social meaning to the nation-state, and [subjects the land to] the process of moulding (...) to fit that social meaning” (LaFave, 2018, p. 8). The castle has become a place of danger, like the dangerous, violent, aggressive new ruler, hence Prince Hamlet’s perception of his home and of his former space of comfort as his current “dungeon” (II.2.265).

Hamlet’s protective feelings towards the country and castle grow because he could eliminate the intruder that has abusively invaded his home and changed everything. Coming to power, Claudius imposes a new set of rules wishing he could transform Elsinore into his own place and home, making the place a scene of corruption, which is completely strange for Hamlet. The space puts pressure on Hamlet, like a burden, crushing/suppressing and suffocating him. The tension is now filling the air; there is no left space anymore in Elsinore which is void of this pressure. The whole space is under the influence of Claudius’s dictatorship which triggers Hamlet’s desire for revenge. Space changes the protagonist’s as well as other characters’ feelings, as if they were in pure osmosis. The phantasmatic spies, traitors, and false friends, as well as the spirit of the murdered, continuously haunt Elsinore. Claudius, however, does not atone his guilt by repenting or by improving his character and because of his power, he is able to change the space, and he follows a masculine “impulse to create a built, social space, intertwined with social hierarchy”, (LaFave, 2018, p. 9) something which was also specific to Old King Hamlet. This makes Claudius even more devious. After separating a young man from his father, he also steals his mother away from him, as well as his personal space – home.

Gillies finds that another example of Claudius’s “bad normality is his failure to stop Gertrude’s drinking from the poisoned cup. As far as Claudius is concerned, Gertrude is not expendable. But Claudius is incapable of seizing the one moment that he has to dash the cup from Gertrude’s hands because that would mean exposure.” (2013, p. 419).
Rot and material decay typically found throughout Hamlet’s speeches depict both Elsinore’s and Denmark’s physical space and those in charge of these spaces. Furthermore, Claudius again totally identifies with the country (LaFave, 2018, p. 9) when he says that “Denmark drinks” (I.2.129), when referring solely to himself. Rot and material decay destroy Hamlet’s own physical body, his mother’s, uncle’s, and everyone else’s involved in this corruption.

Claudius’ presence is noticeable in all spaces: he enters the castle from the garden, where he becomes guilty of fratricide and from those marginal premises he plunges into the centre, identifying with it, like a nucleus. Being obsessed with power, most of the times, he appears close to the room of the throne. He perverts the space he occupies, in a similar way the snake perverted Eden when it tricked Eve in committing the primordial sin. Gillies (2013, p. 419) sees in Claudius a Shakespearean version of Cain:

> a conscientious and sympathetic villain, unusual in a genre specializing in unconscionable Machiavels. He will do what is necessary to become king, and then do what is necessary to stay king. But far from gloating, he is tortured by wrong, once he has done it. Two aspects of (…) [Cain’s portrait] are suggestive of Claudius – hypocrisy and conscience. That Cain should be explained in terms of the same moral psychology as Adam and Eve.

The idea of water as a symbolic purifying factor is what Claudius refers to when he asks himself: “What if this cursed hand/ Were thicker than itself with brother’s blood?/ Is there not rain enough in the sweet heavens/ To wash it white as snow?” (III.3.47-50).

**Ophelia’s natural space**

If the male characters mainly get activated in so-called social spaces, Ophelia “embraces natural vitality, but this narrow-built space excludes and restraints her attitude, and her femininity. She is excluded from participating in the space of Denmark, fully defined by masculinity.” (LaFave, 2018, p. 11). Throughout the play, Ophelia overcomes her dependency on male characters, approaching the natural by using flowers and later by converting elements from nature into her tower of strength, when she seems to lose her mind and senses. Her death is the path she chooses to take in order to return to Mother Nature, hence the graveyard scene as well as the imagery of mermaids, which pulls “her into an iconic realm of the idealized and transcendent” (Ronk, 1994, p. 35). The natural land engages with the masculine rules of the court, creating a place where the significances of the genders harmoniously combine for the first time ever during the play. Ophelia liaises “the natural and the unnatural, by committing an unnatural act: suicide, in a natural manner/assisted by nature” (LaFave, 2018, p. 11) or maybe aspiring to free herself, rather than committing a sin. Her desperate action is also in contrast with Christian dogmas, thus suggesting
paganism often identified with raw nature. She is willing to die because this is
the way through which she will return to the initial state of purity and run away
from the corrupted court; she perceives death as a tunnel, a passage towards
freedom which was lost in Elsinore’s process of decaying.

Using all these concepts when we talked about spaces initiates an ongoing
antithesis throughout the play between the “process of creation in contrast to
decay” (LaFave, 2018, p. 7): rottenness versus beauty, male versus female, built
versus natural, and Ophelia’s relationship with nature is opposed to that of
Hamlet, who considers it as inferior (LaFave, 2018, p. 7). For Ophelia, “the natural
world, the space not occupied by the social and mental world constructed by the
king, prince, and his advisors, is one associated with death. Beyond Elsinore’s
stone walls lies, presumably, a natural world of grass, flowers, and mountains,
all of which are mentioned in her songs” (LaFave, 2018, p. 21), especially when
she mourns her father: “grass-green turf,” “mountain snow”, “sweet flowers”,
and “true-love showers” (IV.5.20-50) – all these attract Ophelia to develop a
close relationship to nature.

While Laertes and other royal figures (the King and Queen) regard these as
signs of madness, her throwing of flowers is also a way of “coping with her loss”
(LaFave, 2018, p. 23) and of paying tribute to a loved, but now lost father. The
dichotomy between the feminine and the masculine is evident in the depicting
of madness, as many critics have observed. Elaine Showalter in her feminist
criticism emphasizes how Ophelia’s tragedy is undermined and “subordinated in
the play; unlike Hamlet she does not struggle with moral choices or alternatives”
(1985, p. 81). When talking about heroes and heroines, we concur with Edwards
who believes that “we can imagine Hamlet’s story without Ophelia, but Ophelia
literally has no story without Hamlet” (Edwards, 1979, p. 36).

Therefore, the unhappy and distraught young woman returns to nature and
even Gertrude believes that Ophelia belonged to the water. When she mentions
how Ophelia spreads her clothes in a “mermaid-like” manner (IV.7.200),
Gertrude again reinforces the idea that the young woman regained her freedom,
innocence, and purity through death. Ophelia is back to her comfort zone and
away from deception, disappointment, and treachery from the built, social
space. Even the act of dying in water, by drowning, is substantially feminine
due to the “female fluidity as opposed to masculine aridity” (Showalter, 1985, p.
81). Polonius and Claudius use her as a pawn, whereas Hamlet hurts her deeply
by stabbing her father and hiding the body. Ophelia’s madness and consequently
her death are a result of these traumatic events that could only have taken place
within the enclosed walls of the built-in man-made space which does not want
to be very much feminine or favourable in general. Ophelia’s death and her
funeral are episodes that take place off-stage and outside the castle, making
them “simultaneously natural and unnatural” (LaFave, 2018, p. 27). Goodman
(1996, p. 110), although he confirms that madness in literature has not been only a woman’s attribute, addresses a very pertinent question: “if ‘reason’ was a person, would that person – according to the attributes and qualities attached to reason – be gendered as female or male?” (Goodman, 1996, p. 114).

The ghost’s space: close to the sky

The initial episode, involving the supernatural, takes place outside the castle with its man-made walls probably because nature is “innocent and pastoral” but also because it is the “realm of the unruly, the untamed, and the uncontrolled” (Emmerichs, 2003, p. 42). Throughout the play, the spectre is primarily seen by other characters, before he met his son, on the terrace, the open-space, outside the dungeon-like castle. The old King Hamlet’s ghost seems to be in a transitional stage, the Purgatory, the final step one has to make before going to Heaven. There is quite a difference between events occurring outside the castle, surrounded by nature and the ones that happen ‘inside’ within the walls of the ‘man-made structures’. The placing of the unnatural or ‘nonhuman’ either in the interior or exterior space can establish “the conceit of change or transcendence” (Emmerichs, 2003, pp. 41-43). Hamlet’s father claims that “Tis given out that, sleeping in my orchard/ A serpent stung me” (I.5.35-36), making a reference to the biblical story of Adam and Eve (Emmerichs, 2003, pp. 41-43). However, this occurs once human degradation has invaded nature. Human wickedness seems to have invaded the cities and has moved beyond the city walls into the wilderness. The ghost feels free to roam around the castle, at his own free will, considering:

It “becomes apparent that there is a great deal of anxiety regarding how such lines are crossed, anxiety that translates into the ever-present apprehension concerning foreign influences in England and its outward expansion. (…) The outdoor world is empty, drained of the unnatural, because the unnatural has moved inside. It has been replaced, however, with a human element; Hamlet is sent to England, is removed from the urban centre of Elsinore, and so his place, by means of this exchange, is filled by the ghost.” (Emmerichs, 2003, pp. 48-49)

The ghost of Hamlet’s father appears only one more time, in his former wife’s chambers, without her seeing him, when she seems to worry about her son’s state of mind. This can be seen as a symbol of her no longer considering him her husband. In the end of the play the spectre disappears, so, we can assume his soul has found peace, just by taking the dear ones with him. The ghost’s moving from the margins (the terrace of the castle) to the centre (the interior of the castle) may be perceived as his gradual persuasion of his son to avenge his betrayal. In his wife’s chambers, the spectre appears only to Hamlet, to his son, as opposed to the ghost’s appearance in Act 1. This time Hamlet is “not nearly as happy or intrigued by the ghost’s second appearance” (Emmerichs, 2003, p. 45). Therefore, he interrogates his father’s ghost and Gertrude becomes
suspicious when she sees her son speaking to thin air, “Alas, he’s mad. [...] O gentle son,/ Upon the heat and flame of thy distemper/ Sprinkle cool patience./ Whereupon do you look?” (III.4.96, and III.4.115). Gertrude cannot see the ghost, so it is only fair when she assumes that Hamlet is truly mad and experiences hallucinations. As for that aspect, Emmerichs (44) suggests that there are significant transformations in Hamlet’s behaviour, attitude, appearance and even in the manner of speech towards the ghost: from interrogative demands: “O answer me!” (I.4.26), “Why is this? Wherefore? What [...]?” (I.4.38), “Why?” (I.4.45) to the replacement of the initial polite address; in addition, “thou” and “thee” – the more polite forms are replaced by the familiar and formal “you”.

The shift of natural towards the unnatural is another sign of Elsinore’s decay. The Ghost avoids the churchyard for example, where such apparitions are usually known to occur. Probably because he is already an outsider and similarly to Hamlet who feels unease in the castle, so does the ghost of his father. The supernatural is presumably more connected to Mother Nature and his apparitions are his last moments on Earth, spent in the orchard or in the garden. As we have mentioned before, the garden depicts a biblical space reminding us of the story of Adam and Eve, but also of their children, Cain and Abel. Serpents commonly kill by injecting their prey with venom. People on the other hand, secretly administer poison, cowardly avoiding a face-to-face confrontation with their enemy; therefore, the concept of death through poisoning is frequently associated with treason and vile crimes, as was the case with the old King Hamlet’s death. In this play, the garden and the snake are recurrent images which depict the old King Hamlet as a good man (despite his sins), the victim of a viciously deceptive murderer, Claudius. This murder is particularly vile, because Claudius is old King Hamlet’s brother (just as Cain and Abel were siblings). The connections with the biblical story are two extensions of the theme of the original sin: the analogy derived from “the Fall narrative” even more striking in Genesis 3 and 4, together with the concept of “totalized taint echoed by Hamlet in the nunnery scene (…) powerfully fused” (Gillies, 2013, p. 411), where the Ghost tells Hamlet about his murder for the first time:

“Tis given out that, sleeping in my orchard,
A serpent stung me – so the whole ear of Denmark
Is by a forged process of my death
Rankly abus’d – but know, thou noble youth,
The serpent that did sting thy father’s life
Now wears his crown” (I.5.35-9).

And of course, “Cain’s jawbone” (V.1.79), found in the graveyard is another direct hint to the biblical original sin. Cain, the son of Adam and Eve, kills his brother Abel, using the jawbone of an ass, and Hamlet, who is about to revenge a fratricide comes across his own ‘Cain’s jawbone’ in a graveyard, hours before finalising his act of vengeance. All in all, because of the court’s
sins and corruption, Hamlet feels that the world’s garden has become suffocated with weeds, when talking to his mother about her marriage, he suggests: “Fie on’t! O fie! ‘Tis an unweeded garden/ That grows to seed; things rank and gross in nature/ Possess it merely” (I.2.135-7) and later, when he warns her not to “spread the compost on the weeds/ To make them ranker” (III.4.151-2). Hamlet is thinking about how the absence of repentance fertilizes the sin, and perpetuates it, the same way the undesirable plant monopolizes a garden, similarly, maybe to aggravating a fault, when augmented with intent.

A very important aspect concerning spaces in *The Tragedy of Hamlet, the Prince of Denmark* is the Christian universe, which strongly affects the ideas the characters believe in and act upon – they seem to be conscious of committing sins and apprehend God’s final judgement and are deeply concerned with the final destination of their souls: heaven, hell or purgatory. In this context, “the heroes/heroines from the great tragedies see God as the authority they fear and from whom they ask protection” (Bălinişteanu-Furdu, 2021, p. 155) because “divinity shows the hero the dimension of anger caused by the mistakes and misjudgement” (Bălinişteanu-Furdu, 2021, p. 172). In order to gain forgiveness, the individuals need to confess their sins, repent and change their character, accepting the forgiveness made possible through Jesus’ death. In response to true repentance, God will wash away all guilt and sins; in the context of the play even Claudius is aware of this. These beliefs interfere a lot with some of the characters’ decisions – they might constitute the reason for Hamlet’s procrastinating vengeance (he continuously questions the morality of his revenge) and they even make Claudius kneel to pray. (Rein, 1960, p. 9)

**Conclusions**

William Shakespeare’s control of space in his plays is an important factor in the audience’s perception of it. The space in *The Tragedy of Hamlet, Prince of Denmark*, and in other Shakespearian plays, can be interpreted as dual, because many actions happen offstage. Therefore, some of the events are seen by the audience, whereas most of them are narrated by various characters. This style of presenting the dramatic events does not align with Aristotle’s view on tragedy. However, it gives so much power to the spoken word. Jones, in *Scenic Form in Shakespeare*, reminds the readers that “plays are made of scenes before made of words...the scene is the primary dramatic unit.” (Jones, 1971, p. 256).

At the end of the play, most characters die, thus the readers/audience can perceive space as empty. This is a good start for a new beginning, suggests Emmerichs (2003, p. 49) as the current vacancy can successfully be filled by Fortinbras, who is the promise of a better tomorrow and of lessons learned. The *inward* and *outward* movement from the *indoor* versus *outdoor* spaces in the play further creates a “fluidity and continuity of space” (Emmerichs, 2003, p. 49).
What we wanted to demonstrate in our paper is that each space seems to reflect the personality of its inhabitants, and based on their existence, the space is private or public. Sometimes, it can be both: the importance of the royal figures forces the transformation of their private space into a public one – the castle is private for its owners; however, it is public for the king’s subjects. The cultural values specific to that age are also emphasized in the description of spaces, hence the author’s frequent references to mythology or historical events within the soliloquies or dialogues between the characters. We placed great emphasis also on the dichotomy ‘nature-culture’ and how this influences the characters’ perception of spaces. For example, the garden, seen as a natural place, is expected to be innocent, untouched by human wickedness; yet old King Hamlet is killed in this Edenic garden proving that the intervention of culture (through the hands of the killer) can spoil nature’s beauty and purity. Though Aristotle’s recommendation concerning the unity of time and space is not necessarily taken into consideration by William Shakespeare, the British writer succeeded in creating a sort of unity between spaces and their dwellers focusing on those places which appear as social constructs because of the close connection between microcosm and macrocosm in this play. Events, betrayals, disappointments occurring within Hamlet’s family mirror the degradation of the whole nation; thus, re-establishing order in his family becomes for Hamlet a goal in life which will make him sacrifice himself for his country, not only for the dignity of his family.

References


ANGLICISMS IN THE MACEDONIAN POLITICAL DISCOURSE: A SERIOUS THREAT OR A WELCOME ADDITION

Silvana Neshkovska

Faculty of Education, “St. Kliment Ohridski” University, Bitola, Republic of North Macedonia

Abstract: The widespread presence of Anglicisms in the Macedonian language is undisputable. Anglicisms are particularly conspicuous in political discourse as politicians seem to have pronounced tendency to insert English borrowings in their public statements, speeches, discussion and debates quite frequently. While politicians thus clearly attempt to reinforce the persuasiveness of the political messages they impart to the masses, the question that arises is whether the general public endorses or condemns such a linguistic strategy.

The aim of this paper is to shed some light on Macedonian native speakers’ perceptions and understanding of a list of Anglicisms that have become an integral part of Macedonian political discourse. For the purposes of this research, a tailor-made questionnaire was conducted among Macedonian speakers of different ages and educational levels. The aim was twofold – to inspect the influence of age and education on the informants’ understanding of Anglicisms, and to ascertain whether they perceive Anglicisms as a serious threat to the purity of their mother tongue or as a welcome addition that enriches it and increases its expressive potential.

The insights gained from this research point in the direction of a tacit agreement between political authorities and general public about the usefulness of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse, but they also indicate that the (lack of) understanding and (non) acceptance of Anglicisms used in political discourse, to a great extent, are conditioned by the profile of Macedonian native speakers, i.e. their age and education, in particular.

Keywords: Anglicisms, Macedonian, political discourse, social factors

About the author: Dr. Silvana Neshkovska is an Associate Professor at the Faculty of Education – Bitola, University St. Kliment Ohridski – Bitola. She teaches a number of courses in English linguistics such as Syntax, Pragmatics, Contrastive Analysis and Phonetics and Phonology as well as Translation, at the Department of Macedonian and Other Foreign Languages. Her main research interests lie in the field of pragmatics, contrastive analysis, English language teaching and translation. She has published a number of research papers in various domestic and foreign scientific journals (e.g. Lodz Papers of Pragmatics; Acta Neophilologica; Respectus Philologicus; Linguistics, Culture and Identity in Foreign Language Education; Teacher International Journal (IJET), Studies in Linguistics, Culture, and FLT; International Journal of Language and Linguistics (IJLLL), International Journal of Applied Language Studies and Culture, Thesis International Research Journal, etc.).

e-mail: silvana.neskovska@uklo.edu.mk

ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4417-7783

Copyright © 2024 Silvana Neshkovska

Article history: Received: 15 November 2023; Reviewed: 8 March 2024; Revised: 15 March 2024; Accepted: 20 March 2024; Published: 15 April 2024

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Introduction

The trend of borrowing linguistic material from English is not a new phenomenon. In fact, this trend did not start with and is not exclusive to the English language. In the past, in different historical periods, other languages such as Latin, French, and German exerted their influence on and imported some of their features in a number of languages they came in contact with (Karadakovska, 2021). However, the social, political, cultural and economic conditions at the beginning of the 20th century became conducive for the English language to take supremacy and to become the greatest “donor” of linguistic material at all times. Put differently, with the unmatched global prevalence of English, the English terms have become omnipresent in both professional and colloquial speech (Gerwens, 2017, p. 2) and indispensable to various fields such as technology, fashion, sports, music, show business, tourism, and science (Đurčević, 2021).

Although the linguistic material borrowed from English is mainly in the form of lexical items, still it is worth noting that the term Anglicism is actually an “umbrella” term that covers “any linguistic element adopted, adapted or calqued from English (either directly or via an intermediary tongue), or inspired or boosted by English models, used in intralingual communication in a language other than English” (Núñez Nogueroles, 2018, p. 220). Put differently, in addition to lexical items other linguistic traits (phonological, morphological, syntactic, orthographic, and semantic) are being infiltrated in the system of other languages (Thomson, 2001, in Ćorić, 2020; Capuz, 1997).

The use of Anglicisms in other languages is mainly attributed to the process of borrowing, still to depict this phenomenon simply as borrowing is not exactly accurate as that depiction suggests that the linguistic elements that have been borrowed, at some point, would be returned to the “donor” language (Aitchison, 2001). Even though this is not how Anglicisms function, the term “borrowing” has been retained and used in the literature quite extensively and persistently that the linguists seem to have agreed that after such a prolonged usage, it would make little sense to attempt to replace it with a more appropriate term.

Prestige or “being in”, the geographical closeness of languages, bilingualism and the cultural, economic and political predominance of a language (in this case, English) are among the main triggers that make the process of borrowing possible (Karadakovska, 2021). Nevertheless, this process is not always considered as necessary or fully-justified. Prćić (2005/2011) considers “justification of use” as a crucial criterion in trying to classify Anglicisms into distinct categories and, consequently, he distinguishes among: fully justified (if they bring a totally new meaning into the recipient language), justified (if they introduce a new semantic contrast), conditionally justified (if they offer a shorter means to express new or existing content), unjustified (if it is easy to produce a translation) or fully unjustified (if there is a word with the same meaning in the recipient language).
The other criteria that Prćić (2005/2011) relies on in classifying Anglicisms are as follows: type (obvious, hidden and raw), formation (trans-shaped, translated or mixed) and status (completely naturalized, partially naturalized or unnaturalized). According to Prćić (2005/2011), prototypically “the best” Anglicism, from the language-systemic, lexicological and lexicographical point of view would be the one that is obvious, trans-shaped, (fully) justified and fully integrated. In a similar vein, Onysko and Winter-Froemel (2011) propose a pragmatic classification of Anglicisms grounded in Levinson’s (2000) pragmatic theory and distinguish between: catachrestic Anglicisms which bear the implicature of informativeness (I-implicatures) and which are equal to the ones called necessary or fully justified by other researchers, and non-catachrestic which bear the implicatures of manner (M-implicatures) and which are identical with the ones called luxury or not justified in previous studies, on the other hand.

Irrespective of whether the entrance of Anglicisms has been triggered by prestige, the prevalence of English, or other reasons, and irrespective of whether their use is fully justified or not, research has shown that what gives Anglicisms special relevance in the recipient language is their potential to fulfill a number of pragmatic functions. More specifically, studies have shown that they can be used to express affect, irony, positive or negative associations, euphemism, to achieve clarity, precision, economy of expression, variation of expression, to create a foreign atmosphere, and to showcase prestige (Rodríguez González, 1996). In journalistic discourse, for instance, they are used in headlines to catch readers’ attention, to “advertise” the respective articles and to allow journalists to express themselves more variedly and nuancedly (Gerwens, 2017, p. 49). On the other hand, in political discourse, Anglicisms are employed when politicians wish to underline prestige; to appeal to the public and to attach an additional connotation of modernity, open-mindedness, internationalism and Western lifestyle to themselves (Kusevska, 2021).

Literature abounds with studies that prioritize investigating people’s attitude towards Anglicisms in their respective languages (e.g. Gani, 2007; Đurčevic, 2021; Drljača Margić, 2014, etc.). Some of these studies demark a sharp discrepancy between the authorities’ inclination to oppose the infiltration of Anglicisms and to preserve the linguistic purity of their language, on the one hand, and the predominantly positive attitude and acceptance of Anglicisms by the masses, on the other hand (Gerwens, 2017). Đurčevic (2021) underscores that, due to their brevity, simplicity, and international usage, Montenegrin speakers perceive Anglicisms predominantly as modern, informal, and suitable for different professional domains, as a result of which Montenegrin words are perceived as less modern and popular, i.e. as obsolete. Drljača Margić (2014) in her study discovers that Croatian university students depict Anglicisms as modern and popular, and associate them with informal and private language
use, whereas they find their Croatian equivalents to be more suitable for more formal contexts. Đorđević (2016) explores the attitudes of agricultural experts toward Anglicisms and their equivalents in Serbian and finds out that Anglicisms are preferred because of their internationality and simplicity both in terms of their form and meaning. Mišić Ilić (2014) too, looks into the interpretation and the perception of certain Anglicisms by native speakers of Serbian. In her study, Mišić Ilić points out that “the influence of English on Serbian has never been characterized by militant purism and segregationist biased tones against foreign words” and that Anglicisms have been accepted “as a normal, necessary and unstoppable modern phenomenon” (2014, p. 339). Still, she reiterates the “constant warnings and pleas for knowledgeable, adequate use, streamlined by the strong and sophisticated promotion of the general language culture” (2021, p. 339). In a similar vein, Gani (2007, p. 40) acknowledges that “the Italians’ zeal for lacing their language with English words is well-known and on-going”. Gerwens (2017, p. 2) tackles general public’s acceptance and propagation of English loanwords in German and highlights that the creative adaptation of English terms and phrases in German indicates that Germans, to a great extent, are actively and dynamically utilizing English to respond to their local circumstances and the globalized world. Yang (1990, p. 49) conducted a preliminary survey with German university students and discovered that the English loanwords were most often perceived as “customary”, “modern”, and “businesslike” (in Gerwens, 2017, pp. 30-31).

Another important aspect related to Anglicisms worth considering is the influence of the social factors such as age, gender, education, profession, etc., on the use of Anglicisms in the recipient language. González Cruz (2003) in her study focusses only on the use of not justified Anglicisms, by well-educated inhabitants of Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, and concluded that the sociolinguistic variables, sex and age, have a significant bearing on the linguistic behavior of the informants regarding the knowledge and use of unnecessary English vocabulary (in Núñez Nogueroles, 2017, p. 9). Also, Đurčević’s (2021) study tackles the interplay between education and the use and understanding of Anglicisms and outlines the finding that Anglicisms have been frequently described as negative by some informants, most probably, due to their foreign origin, i.e. their generally lower frequency of use as well as due to individual informants’ lower English proficiency, i.e. their insufficient familiarity with the meanings of some Anglicisms, which eventually points to some sort of educational insufficiency.

In the Macedonian language, the number of studies that deal with this issue is rather limited. Lazarevska (2020, p. 115) discusses whether the presence of Anglicisms in Macedonian is justified or not and underlines that borrowing from English as a global language has not circumvented Macedonian even in cases when there are terms with the same meaning as the imported ones in our
standard language. As a result of this, according to Lazarevska (2020, p. 115), some Macedonian terms fall into disuse and are being replaced by English terms written in Cyrillic letters. Hence, her recommendation for the young people in particular is that they respect and use their mother tongue properly, following Koneski’s premise (1982) that the enrichment of the vocabulary should mainly be done on the basis of the Macedonian dialects and that borrowing from foreign languages should be resorted to only when absolutely necessary (Lazarevska, 2020: 119). Karadakovska (2021), relying on definitions of borrowings proposed by relevant linguists, showcases the different types of adaptation that borrowed words undergo in Macedonian by using examples of borrowed words not just from English, but from French and German. More specifically, Karadakovska (2021) exemplifies the existence of complete, partial and zero adaptation, depending on the morphological, phonetic and semantic parameters proposed by Filipovic (1965). Kirova et al. (2014) also draw attention to the necessity of preserving the Macedonian language which, according to them, is “invaded” by Anglicisms not only when there is an actual linguistic gap in the language, but also when existing Macedonian words are replaced with English for no obvious reason. She underlines that the importation of Anglicisms in Macedonian is not due to regular social interaction of the speakers of the two language communities, but a result of intensive exposure to computer technology, traditional media (newspapers, magazines and brochures), electronic media, radio and television, and notes that their presence is most obvious in the media, economy and politics. Janusheva (2020) investigates the influence of the English language on Macedonian in the area of scientific research and analyses the presence of Anglicisms in MA theses written in Macedonian and defended in Macedonian state universities. Her research shows that the English language has a significant impact on the Macedonian language on different language levels which, in turn, unfortunately points to a serious lack of knowledge of Macedonian on the part of the MA candidates.

Given that, to the best of our knowledge, no similar study exists in Macedonian that tackles the issue of Anglicisms from the perspective of people’s perception and understanding of Anglicisms as well as the influence of different social factors on the use of Anglicisms, the study at hand is intended to fill in a small but significant scientific gap in that respect. Consequently, the paper aims to investigate Macedonian native speakers’ perceptions and understanding of Anglicisms used in Macedonian political discourse in particular, as previous studies have shown that the realm of politics, alongside with journalism, are among the most open and receptive ones when it comes to admitting Anglicisms in its discourse.

Research Methodology

As stated previously, this paper aims at investigating Macedonian native speakers’ perceptions and understanding of Anglicisms used by Macedonian politicians in their public statements and speeches. For the purposes of this study a questionnaire composed of 45 questions was tailor-made. The first three questions in the questionnaire were a combination of close and open-ended questions and were designed to elicit the informants’ position regarding Macedonian politicians’ use of Anglicisms. More specifically, they were intended to inspect whether people have a favorable or unfavorable attitude towards politicians’ use of Anglicisms. The third question was aimed at eliciting the informants’ position regarding the pragmatic functions of the English borrowings in the Macedonian political discourse.

The rest of the questions in the questionnaire, 42 in total, are of the closed type and they serve the purpose of disclosing the informants’ understanding of the meaning of Anglicisms. In fact, the informants were provided with 42 utterances extracted from a small corpus of political statements made by the last three Macedonian Prime Ministers\(^2\). Each utterance contains an Anglicism, and is followed by three ready-made options, i.e. potential Macedonian equivalents, from which the respondents were supposed to select the one whose meaning was equivalent with the meaning of the Anglicism in that specific utterance. In case the informants were unfamiliar with the meaning of some of the Anglicisms included in the questionnaire, they were also provided with the “I don’t know” option. All of the selected Anglicisms are in the form of lexical borrowings, or more precisely direct loanwords (cf. Pulcini et al., 2012), as a more comprehensive research which would include the other types of Anglicisms would be far beyond the scope of this paper. More precisely, the direct loanwords included in the questionnaire are mostly nouns, but there were also verbs and adjectives, too. Most of them have been adapted either phonologically or morphologically to be more compatible with the natural features of the Macedonian language. Prior to including the excerpted utterances with Anglicisms\(^3\) in the questionnaire, the Official Digital Dictionary of the Macedonian Language\(^4\) and Digital Dictionary of the Macedonian Language\(^5\) were consulted in order to confirm that the selected terms were indeed of English origin.

\(^2\) The last three Macedonian Prime Ministers are: Nikola Gruevski (2006-2016), Zoran Zaev (2017-2020) and Dimitar Kovachevski (2022- ) (see Appendix 1 for the links to their statements)

\(^3\) See Appendix 2 for a detailed list of the selected Anglicisms

\(^4\) https://makedonski.gov.mk/

\(^5\) http://drmj.eu/
To ensure maximum validity and objectivity of the results obtained from this research, the questionnaire was conducted in the presence of the researcher and the informants were not allowed to use IT devices, to consult dictionaries or other people regarding the meaning of the selected Anglicisms. They were encouraged to rely solely on their knowledge, and in case they were unfamiliar with a specific Anglicism, to have an honest approach and choose the “I don’t know” option.

Given the fact that one of the main aims of this study was to inspect whether age and education play a significant role in people’s understanding of and their position towards Anglicisms, efforts were made to include different profiles of people in the study. Thus, in terms of age, the informants were divided into three groups: younger people aged 18 to 30 (Group A); middle aged individuals aged 31 to 55 (Group B), and older individuals aged 56 and above (Group C). As to education, the informants were organized in three groups as well – individuals who have completed primary education (PE); individuals with secondary education (SE) and individuals with higher education (HE).

In view of the two overarching aims of the study – to inspect the informants’ position towards Anglicisms and their understanding of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse, four hypotheses were laid out at the outset of the study:

H1. Macedonian native speakers have a favourable attitude towards the use of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse.

H2. According to Macedonian native speakers, Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse have mainly positive pragmatic functions.

H3. The older Macedonian native speakers (56 years old and above) have more difficulties understanding the meaning of Anglicisms than their younger counterparts.

H4. Macedonian native speakers who have completed tertiary education (and consequently were exposed to English longer in the course of their education) have a better understanding of the Anglicisms than the individuals who have completed primary and secondary education.

Evidently, age and education are not the only relevant social factors that should be taken into consideration when it comes to investigating the use of Anglicisms in political discourse, still given the limited scope of the study we decided to focus on these two factors.

The software package SPSS was used for statistical analysis of the data. The maximum number of scores the informants could obtain in the questionnaire, provided they opted for the correct Macedonian equivalents for all of the selected Anglicisms was 42. The scores obtained were then analysed by means
of the Independent Samples T-test, which was used to compare the means of the independent groups according to the informants’ level of education, in order to determine whether there was statistical evidence that the associated population means were significantly different. One Way Anova and LSD Post Hock test were also employed to establish the existence of significant differences regarding the understanding of Anglicisms among the informants who belonged to different age groups. Finally, Chi square test was utilized in determining the understanding of Anglicisms on the part of the targeted age and education groups.

The next section offers an analysis and discussion of the results obtained.

Results

In total, 105 informants gave their consent to participate in the study and to fill in the questionnaire. The age and the educational profile of the informants were, as mentioned before, quite versatile. Namely, 56 informants were allocated to Group A (18 to 30-year-olds group); 38 informants to the Group B (31 to 55-year-olds), and only 11 informants to Group C (56-year-olds and above). With respect to the informants’ educational background, 1 informant finished only PE; 41 informants were SE graduates and 63 were HE graduates. Given the difficulty we encountered in finding informants with PE who would be willing to participate in the research, this group was excluded from further analysis and discussion in the research at hand.

A) Analysis of the results with respect to the first hypothesis

In order for us to check the validity of the first hypothesis (H1. Macedonian native speakers have a favourable attitude towards the use of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse), the informants were asked whether politicians should use Anglicisms in their political discourse. As depicted in Table 1, the results suggest that the majority of the informants do indeed support the use of Anglicisms in political discourse, which proves our first hypothesis correct. More precisely, 48.6% of the informants approve of the use of Anglicisms in political discourse but only occasionally, and 16.2% of them approve of it always; whereas 35.2% are adamant that such linguistic behaviour is not exemplary and is unacceptable in political discourse (see Table 1).
Table 1. Macedonian native speakers’ attitude towards the use of Anglicisms in political discourse (according to age)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Should politicians use Anglicisms in their political discourse?</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group A (18-30)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19.6%</td>
<td>17.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group B (31-55)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15.7%</td>
<td>42.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group C (56-)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16.2%</td>
<td>35.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What deserves to be stressed in these findings is that the age factor seems to play a very important role in people’s attitude towards the use of Anglicisms in political discourse. Namely, while the informants in Group A are clearly in favour of the use of Anglicisms (even though 62.5% mainly support occasional use of Anglicisms, and only 17.8% are against it), the informants in Group B seem to be slightly more reluctant, as their opinions with respect to this issue are divided, with 57.9% being in favour (again the majority of them supported occasional use of Anglicisms), and 42.1% being explicitly against it. Interestingly, the informants in Group C were unanimous that such linguistic behaviour on the part of Macedonian politicians is not permissible. Among the reasons underlined in their answers in support of this claim are the following: “People cannot understand them“ (Луѓето не можат да ги разберат); “They are representatives of the people so they should use language understandable to everyone. Not everybody knows English“ (Тие се представници на народот и треба да го говорат јазикот на народот кој е разбирлив за сите. Не сите го знаат англискиот јазик.), etc.

Table 2. Macedonian native speakers’ attitude towards the use of Anglicisms in political discourse (according to education)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Should politicians use Anglicisms in their political discourse?</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PE</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12.1%</td>
<td>41.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HE</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>30.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
On the other hand, as far as the influence of the education factor on the informants’ position towards Anglicisms is concerned, the majority of the informants in the HE group, generally speaking, have a more favourable attitude towards the use of Anglicisms in political discourse than their SE counterparts (see Table 2). Namely, 50.7% of them are in favour of occasional use of Anglicisms in political discourse, as opposed to 43.3% of the informants in the SE group who support occasional use of Anglicisms. Also, the percentage of those who are explicitly against it is higher in the SE group (41.4%) than in the HE group (30.1%). Lastly, the percentage of those who support the use of Anglicisms always is also higher in the HE group (19%) in comparison with the SE group (12%). The more pronounced positive inclination towards the use of Anglicisms on the part of the HE graduates could be attributed to many different reasons, among which surely is their considerably longer and more systematic exposure to the English language in the course of their education.

B) Analysis of the results with respect to the second hypothesis

In order to either prove or refute the validity of the second hypothesis (H2. According to Macedonian native speakers the pragmatic functions of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse are mainly positive) the informants could choose from a list of potential reasons as to why politicians resort to using Anglicisms, which included the following: a) to sound more sophisticated, modern and wise; b) to attract the attention of the public; c) to make their discourse more versatile and interesting; d) to make their topic more contemporary and relevant; e) all of the previously mentioned reasons. Clearly, all these reasons underline a variety of positive pragmatic functions of Anglicisms in political discourse. The informants, however, were also encouraged to list additional reasons not listed in the questionnaire, if they deemed them relevant.

The analysis of the results proved this hypothesis valid as well. The majority of the informants dwelled on the positive pragmatic functions of Anglicisms in political discourse that were listed in the questionnaire. More precisely, 34.3% of them have selected the “all of the listed reasons above” option, 27.7% opted for “to make sure they sound more sophisticated, modern and wise”, and approximately the same percentage of informants (11-13%) selected the remaining three options (see Chart 1).
Chart 1. Pragmatic functions of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse

What deserves to be emphasised though, is that only 5.7% of the informants offered reasons which bring to the forefront certain negative pragmatic functions of Anglicisms. In other words, according to these informants, Macedonian politicians use Anglicisms “to make sure that people don’t understand them” (За да бидат сигурни дека луѓето нема да ги раберат); “to obscure the true meaning of their statements” (За да го скријат вистинското значење на нивните искази), etc.

C) Analysis of the results with respect to the third hypothesis

As explained in the research methodology section, the testing of the third hypothesis (H3. The older Macedonian native speakers (56 years old and above) have more difficulties understanding the meaning of Anglicisms than their younger counterparts), rested on the 42 utterances which contained an Anglicism each, excerpted from public statements and speeches made by the last three Macedonian Prime Ministers on different occasions. In order to inspect the informants’ understanding of the meaning of the selected Anglicisms they were instructed to make a choice of one of the three (potential) Macedonian equivalents accompanying each statement, in addition to the “I don’t know” option, which they were to choose in case they were unfamiliar with a specific Anglicism.

The results of the Chi-square test depicted below (Table 3) point to the fact that there are differences in the understanding of the Anglicisms among the three age groups of informants. In fact, statistically significant difference among the three age groups of informants emerged in 9 out of 42 Anglicisms (see Table 3 below).
In order to determine the differences among the different age groups, initially each informant obtained a total score of his/her understanding of the selected Anglicisms. Then, the statistical method of data analysis ANOVA was employed to determine the differences in the understanding of Anglicisms among the three age groups of informants. The mean gained for Group A was 28.07; then 32.30 for Group B, and 26.20 for Group C (see Table 4).

The fact that the value of the F test is 4.51 on the level of significance at Sig.=.013 leads to the conclusion that a statistically significant difference exists in the knowledge of the three age groups (see Table 5).
The LSD Post Hock test was used to determine among what age groups differences emerged in the understanding of the selected Anglicisms. The value of Sig between Group B and Group C was 0.009; whereas, between Group A and Group C was 0.009 (see Table 6 below). This points to the fact that Group C showed poorer understanding of Anglicisms in comparison to Group A and Group B, which is statistically significant. Moreover, this analysis indicates that there was no statistically significant difference between Group A and Group B. Hence, the general conclusion that could be reached in this respect is that the older informants (56+) displayed considerably poorer understanding of the meaning of the selected Anglicisms than their younger counterparts.

These results confirm our third hypothesis that the older generation of informants (56-year-olds and above) has lower understanding of Anglicisms in comparison to younger informants. To illustrate this point let us have a look at the word антагонизам (antagonism) which was used in the following utterance in the questionnaire “I believe that the brave and principled decisions I make... open up a prosperous future, not enmity and antagonism” (Јас верувам дека храбрите и принципиелни одлуки кои ги носам... отвараат перспективна иднина а не непријателство и антагонизам). While Group A encountered practically no problems in recognising and selecting the correct Macedonian equivalent – омраза (hatred), and Group B in this case did even

### Table 5. ANOVA test of total scores of the informants according to age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Type III Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corrected model</td>
<td>526.184</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>263.092</td>
<td>4.517</td>
<td>.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>52114.192</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>52114.192</td>
<td>894.660</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>526.184</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>263.092</td>
<td>4.517</td>
<td>.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5941.530</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>58.250</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corrected total</td>
<td>97402.000</td>
<td>105</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 6. The results of the LSD Post Hock test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Factor</th>
<th>(J) Factor</th>
<th>Mean Difference (I-J)</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Lower Bound</th>
<th>Upper Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(4.25)*</td>
<td>1.598</td>
<td>.009</td>
<td>(7.42)</td>
<td>(1.08)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>2.617</td>
<td>.467</td>
<td>(3.32)</td>
<td>7.06</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(4.25)*</td>
<td>1.598</td>
<td>.009</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>7.42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.12*</td>
<td>2.713</td>
<td>.026</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>11.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(1.87)</td>
<td>2.617</td>
<td>.476</td>
<td>(7.06)</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(6.12)*</td>
<td>2.713</td>
<td>.026</td>
<td>(11.50)</td>
<td>(.74)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
slightly better, Group C was almost completely unfamiliar with the meaning of this word (see Table 7).6

Table 7. Frequency of the answers of the informants’ regarding the meaning of the word антагонизам (according to age)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>војна (war)</th>
<th>омраза (hatred)</th>
<th>нестрпливост (impatience)</th>
<th>не знам (I don’t know)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td><strong>43</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-55</td>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>1</strong></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D) Analysing the results with respect to the fourth hypothesis

To ascertain the validity of the fourth hypothesis (H4. The respondents who have completed tertiary education (and consequently were longer exposed to English in the course of their education) have a better understanding of the Anglicisms), initially we considered the answers of informants with SE and HE. As mentioned previously, due to lack of sufficient number of informants who have completed PE, this category was excluded from further analysis and discussion.

The Chi-square test of the analysed data points to the fact that there is a statistically significant difference in the answers of the informants with different levels of education. Namely, as depicted in Table 8 below, a statistically significant difference in the understanding of the meaning of Anglicisms on the part of the different education groups was noted in the case of 28 out of 42 Anglicisms, i.e. in 66% of the analysed Anglicisms.

---

6. The frequencies of the informants’ answers as far as the rest of the Anglicisms are concerned are not presented here due to the space constraints.
determining the differences in the results of the different education groups, the statistical method Independent Samples T-test was used. The mean in the case of the informants with SE was 25.90; whereas, in the case of the informants with HE, it was 31.81 (see Table 9 below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 8. Chi-square of the informants’ understanding of Anglicisms (according to education)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bilateral (bilateral)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>what’s up (vetting)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>political actors (political actors)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>integration (integration)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cooperation (co-operation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dignity (dignity)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>calculate (calculate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>antagonism (antagonism)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>transparent (transparent)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>photovoltaic (photovoltaics)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>co-financing (co-financing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>targeted (targeted)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>monitoring (monitoring)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sustainable (sustainable)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>match (match)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>connections (connections)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>verification (verification)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>projection (projection)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>barriers (barriers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>educated (educated)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>substitution (substitution)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>impact (impact)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>boost (boosting)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>quantum leap (quantum leap)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compromise (compromise)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>crucial (crucial)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frustrated (frustrated)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>relations (relations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>departments (departments)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>perception (perception)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agency (agency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>legislation (legislation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>harmonization (harmonization)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empathy (empathy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>respect (respect)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>represent (represent)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reflect (reflect)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>capital (capital)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>implementation (implementation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>counterproductive (counterproductive)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>continuous (continuous)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 9. Descriptive statistics of the total score of the informants’ understanding of Anglicisms (according to education)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary education (SE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher education (HE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The value of the T-test is 3.969 on the level of significance Sig (2 tailed) from .000 (see Table 10 below), which indicates that there is a statistically significant difference when it comes to the understanding of the meaning of Anglicisms between the informants who have completed SE and those with HE. In fact, the mean indicates that the respondents who have completed HE have a better understanding of the meaning of the selected Anglicisms.

Table 10. T test of the total scores of the informants’ understanding of Anglicisms (according to education)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levene’s Test for Equality of Variances</th>
<th>t-test for Equality of Means</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval of the Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>6.587</td>
<td>.012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>(3.727)</td>
<td>67.936</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To illustrate this point, let us consider the word impact which was used in the following utterance in the questionnaire: “This trend shows the impact of these measures” (Овој тренд покажува колку импакт имаат ваквите мерки) (Table 11).

Table 11. Frequency of the informants’ understanding of the meaning of the word импакт (according to education)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Импакт (impact)</th>
<th>влијание (influence)</th>
<th>реакција (reaction)</th>
<th>одговор (response)</th>
<th>не знам (I don’t know)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HE</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>70</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As Table 11 above shows, 60.9% of the respondents with SE are well familiar with the meaning of this specific Anglicism; whereas, 71.4% of the respondents with HE successfully choose the correct Macedonian equivalent which has got the same meaning as the Anglicism in question. Similar results were obtained regarding the word агонија (agony) used in: “We cannot say that at the moment but we are trying not to turn it into an agony but a productively spent time” (Тоа не може да се каже во овој момент, но ние се обидуваме тоа да не е агонија туку продуктивно потрошено време). More specifically, the word was correctly interpreted by 43.9% of the respondents with SE, and 57.1% of the respondents with HE.

Table 12. Frequency of the informants’ understanding of the meaning of the word агонија (according to education)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>чекање (waiting)</th>
<th>измачување (agony)</th>
<th>залудно потрошено време (waste of time)</th>
<th>не знам (I don't know)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SE</strong></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HE</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As expected, the results show that the informants with HE do have a better understanding of Anglicisms in comparison to the informants who have completed only SE, most likely due to the longer exposure to the English language in the course of their studies. These findings confirm the truthfulness of the fourth hypothesis.

Conclusion

The study focused on the use of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse. The aim was to dissect Macedonian native speakers’ opinions regarding the presence of Anglicisms in Macedonian political discourse as well as their understanding of a number of Anglicisms, which have definitely found their way into our politicians’ speech.

The results of the questionnaire that was tailor-made and conducted just for the purposes of this study were subjected to statistical data analysis, and they confirmed the validity of the four hypotheses set at the beginning of the study. The findings reveal that Macedonians, particularly the ones aged from 18 to 55, and the ones who have graduated from university, have a more favourable attitude to Anglicisms in political discourse than the older Macedonian native speakers (56 years old and above), who are adamant that Macedonian politicians
in their public speeches and statements should only stick to the Macedonian standard language. Unsurprisingly, the elder Macedonian speakers showed poorer results in comparison to their younger counterparts, especially those with a university degree, when it comes to understanding the meaning of Anglicisms used by politicians. The majority of the Macedonian informants who took part in this study are convinced that politicians use Anglicisms in their discourse because the pragmatic functions they perform are mainly positive; unlike, an insignificantly low percentage of the informants who think that Anglicisms serve negative pragmatic functions in political discourse.

One downside of the study is that a limited number of native Macedonian speakers agreed to take part in it. Also, as secondary education has become compulsory in Macedonia in the past couple of decades, a major predicament was to find informants who have completed only primary education and to test their position towards Anglicisms. In fact, only some elderly people currently might have such an educational background, but these individuals were completely disinclined to participate in a study like this. The study revolved around a limited number of Anglicisms used in political discourse. Given that Macedonian political discourse abounds in Anglicisms, it is possible that a different selection of Anglicisms in this research could have yielded different results. Finally, despite the encouragement to use the “I don’t know” option in case they were unfamiliar with a specific instance of Anglicism in the questionnaire, the informants absolutely avoided choosing that option and preferred to “try their luck” with the option that looked most plausible to them.

Despite the above-stated shortcomings, this small scale study, which at no point pretends to make all-encompassing claims, surely gives a clear indication regarding Macedonian native speakers’ position and understanding of Anglicisms employed in political discourse. Most definitely, in the future, studies much larger in size, both in terms of number of participants and Anglicisms, should be carried out to obtain more objective results regarding the issue at hand. The study can also be expanded to include other types of discourse, not just political discourse, and other social factors such as gender and profession, for instance.

Overall, what is evident from the present study is that the tendency in the Macedonian language on the part of both the political authorities and the general population is not towards language purity and shunning English borrowings at all cost. Quite the contrary, these results show that the use of Anglicisms is perceived as a valuable addition to our mother tongue that boosts its expressive power, despite the warning of some Macedonian linguists that Koneski’s premise about highly cautious borrowing of linguistic material from foreign linguistic systems should be obeyed and followed.
References


Studies in Linguistics, Culture and FLT - Volume 12, Issue 1. ISSN 2534-9538


### Appendix 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Politician</th>
<th>Link</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.Nikola Gruevski: The unity of the state has been attacked</td>
<td><a href="https://youtube.com/watch?v=ZKk7UT2Px0w">https://youtube.com/watch?v=ZKk7UT2Px0w</a></td>
<td>26.02.2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2

сустенабл (sustainable); билатерално (bilateral); ватс ап (what’s up); аспирација (aspiration); интеграција (integration); компромиси (compromise); дигнитет (dignity); антагонизам (antagonism); калкулара (calculate); таргетиран (targeted); верификација (verification); мечира (match); едуциран (educated); бариери (barriers); бустинг (boosting); супституција (substitution); круцијална (crucial); континуиран (continuous); контрапродуктивни (counterproductive); имплементација (implementation); капитали инвестиции (capital investments); рефлектира (reflect); репрезенти (represent); респективи (respect); гармонизира (harmonize); емпатија (empathy); легислатива (legislation); агонија (agony); перцепција (perception); департменти (departments); релацији (relation); фрустриран (frustrated); квантен скок (quantum leap); конекција (connections); проекција (projection); мониторинг (monitoring); кофинансирање (co-financing); фотоволтаици (photovoltaics); транспарентно (transparent); политички актери (political actors); импакт (impact); ветинг (vetting); интеграција (integration); департменти (departments)
BOOK REVIEW: A TOPOGRAPHY PLAGUED BY MARGINALITY IN VICTORIAN NOVELS

Veronica-Loredana Balan

"Vasile Alecsandri” University of Bacău, Romania

The building of spaces based on the stereotypical gender roles was widely discussed in many Victorian novels. Other concepts frequently used in the 19th-century novels are those of ‘marginality’ and ‘Otherness’ which are illustrated by Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu through the marginalized individuals who strive to climb the social ladder or to preserve the newly acquired social status. We read this survey because it mainly focuses on women who seem to be enclosed in marginal positions and because it differentiates the perspective of a male author from the one of a female writer. The author, however, tries to emphasize the marginality of different individuals from different social classes, regardless of their race or gender. In her book, A Topography Plagued by Marginality in Victorian Novels (2022), Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu lets herself be guided by the existentialist mantra “essence precedes existence” which Simone de Beauvoir transformed into a feminist phrase: “One is not born, but rather becomes a woman” (The Second Sex, 1998, p. 267) suggesting that gendered stereotypes influenced the construction of spaces and of conventional norms which is an idea generally transmitted to readers in order for them to follow a specific set of values.

About the author: Professor Veronica-Loredana Balan, PhD, received her PhD from “Al. I. Cuza” University of Iași, Romania and Poitiers University, France in 2006. Her field of research comprises medieval studies, French literature and cultural studies. In 2019 she became a full professor, after she defended her habilitation thesis entitled Cultural Filiations. Aesthetic and Moral Issues. Veronica-Loredana Balan is currently working at the Department of Foreign Languages at the Faculty of Letters at “Vasile Alecsandri” University of Bacău, Romania. She has already published 3 books on medieval studies at well-known publishing houses and participated in numerous international conferences.

e-mail: grecu.veronica@ub.ro

ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4279-1168

Copyright © 2024 Veronica-Loredana Balan

Article history: Received: 9 February 2024; Reviewed: 14 February 2024; Revised: 28 February 2024; Accepted: 28 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

As the title suggests, Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu referred only to Victorian texts, to illustrate and even re-interpret the traditional roles, the moral values specific to those times: the chronological order mirrors the evolution of concepts such as ‘marginality’, ‘Otherness’ and ‘centre’ in time and history. The survey begins with *Wuthering Heights* by Emily Brontë published in 1847, it then continues with *Jane Eyre* by Charlotte Brontë (1848), *North and South* by Elizabeth Gaskell (1860), *Great Expectations* by Charles Dickens (1861), *Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland* by Lewis Carroll (1865), and it ends with the analysis of *Tess of the D’Urbervilles* by Thomas Hardy from 1890. Besides depicting the protagonists’ marginality, each chapter of the book reminds us of the well-known ‘master-slave’ dialectic (Hegel, 1995, p. 67) which focuses on the characters’ position in society and their possible oscillation between centre and margins. Other binary oppositions also mentioned and explained in the introduction of the book are private vs. public, nature vs. culture, surface vs. depth, appearance vs. reality, man vs. woman, hunters vs. hunted, free vs. confined, possessors vs. possessed. Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu considers these concepts as lying at the core of most discussions about space and social position in the Victorian novels.

“Marginality Embedded in Opposite Spaces” is the first chapter of the book, which offers the characters’ representation in opposite spaces in *Wuthering Heights*. The difference between Thrushcross Grange and Wuthering Heights reflects the opposition between nature and culture, which also mirrors the basic features of the inhabitants of these two spaces: the Lintons and the Earnshaws, respectively. The prototype of marginality is Heathcliff whose name and appearance illustrate his social position, education, and origin. The education and culture of Thrushcross Grange, as well as the savageness of Wuthering Heights are analysed in the examples taken from Emily Brontë’s novel which emphasize the influence that spaces have on their inhabitants. Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu provides the readers with the portrait of the Victorian patriarch and shows how his power (sometimes manifested through violence) modifies spaces and the persons within. The violence exercised upon certain characters reinforces Hegel’s dialectic (mastery vs. servitude) in which one has the right to impose orders and to control others, giving the slave enough reasons to rebel against or subvert the master attempting to steal his position in society.

“Can Governesses Break Marginality without Being Punished?” refers to Charlotte Brontë’s *Jane Eyre* whose protagonist’s marginalization is caused by her condition as an orphan. The second chapter of this book shows Jane in different stages of her life and her rebellion against her abusers who considered themselves socially superior to her. Each space defines a stage in Jane’s life: Gateshead (Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu identifies this space as the beginning of Jane’s marginality), Lowood School (representing the transition from a private to a more public existence), Thornfield (Jane’s marginalisation encloses her into a web of lies), Marsh End (this space marks the end of her marginality),
and Ferndean (which symbolizes the balance between reason and passion, and the move towards the centre of the social system). The woman’s marginality is marked by different acts of oppression, of humiliation, of (physical and verbal) abuse, which she had to endure first as an orphan, then as a governess – ultimately as ‘the Other’.

“Overcoming Marginality in *North and South* and the Transgression of Borders” illustrates the relation between the urban and the rural landscape in the 19th century England, between the industrial North and the idyllic South. The third chapter of this book reveals Elizabeth Gaskell’s insight into the woman’s forced transgression from a superior social class to an inferior one, and vice versa, as well as into the effects of the industrial revolution. Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu considers Margaret Hale’s discourse in the novel not a feminist manifesto, but a woman’s right to voice her opinions in order to solve social problems. This is a novel in which the public space invaded the private home, in which social aspects pervade Thornton’s domestic space, thus social life influences the personality of characters and alters the identity of spaces. The South is continuously idealised, despite its passivity, whereas the industrial North’s lack of beauty and menacing darkness torments the nostalgic characters and pushes them into marginal positions. However, a woman manages to overcome her marginality through education, kindness, and generosity, only after she has acquired the necessary lessons of humility and modesty.

“Forever Marginal despite Transgressing the Childhood Rural Boundaries” highlights Pip’s marginalization in different stages of his life or in different spaces in Charles Dickens’ *Great Expectations*. Again, the orphan is ‘the Other’; despite his gender, the orphan has to belong to the lower-class. Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu re-evaluates the Victorian binary oppositions when she classifies the Dickensian spaces into outer and interior, rural and urban, uncivilized and civilized, infinite and finite spaces. The bildungsroman presents Pip’s evolution from childhood to youth, his transgression from innocence to maturity, as well as his overcoming of his marginality. When he leaves behind the rural environment for London, he passes through ‘sub-spaces’ like the hulks (the prison-ships), the river Thames, the sea. These peripheral spaces underline that the water represents the border between criminality and Victorian educated people. The protagonist’s marginality makes it easier for others to lie to him (hence the secrecy of his benefactor), to abuse him (hence his sister’s abuses) – all these reveal the dehumanization of the individual in a corrupt society. Again, the Victorian binary oppositions are detected when the author gives examples of manipulators and manipulated, between hunters and hunted, as well as between possessor and possessed. This chapter calls the reader’s attention to the difference between male and female writers: the Brontë Sisters and Elizabeth Gaskell build up their protagonists as capable of overcoming their marginality only after they have learnt the necessary lessons of domesticity, while Charles
Dickens imagines the hero’s transgression of marginality with humility and only after he has understood the rightful Victorian order.

“When Time and Space become Strange: Does the Wonderworld Help Alice Overcome Her Marginality?” is Cătălina Bălinişteanu-Furdu’s attempt to show how a male author (Lewis Carroll) depicts a female protagonist, how he depicts her rebellion against the Victorian conventions and how Alice deals with her marginality in Wonderland as well as in the Victorian reality. In the second half of the 19th century, we sense an evolution in the process of constructing a woman’s identity when Lewis Carroll creates the heroine as capable of rejoicing adventures, of experiencing a fantasy world. Although she is not an orphan, Alice is seen as ‘the Other’ because she is a child, hence Alice’s marginalization and rejection from both the Victorian reality and from Wonderland. Cătălina Bălinişteanu-Furdu perceives Alice’s transgression of her marginality as a conflict between the girl’s past and her present, between horizontality (the Victorian society) and verticality (Wonderland). Besides the typical spaces like the rabbit hole (presented as a portal between Victorian reality and Wonderland) to the Queen’s Garden (reminding us of the primordial temptation and a glimpse into the Garden of Eden), Cătălina Bălinişteanu-Furdu also discusses the girl’s bodily borders which are constantly challenged through her adventures in Wonderland, and which make Alice feel confused about her identity. The more elements from the Victorian reality are neutralized by those specific to Wonderland, the more we feel the reversal of the typical hierarchy which challenges the traditional ideas of domesticity and stability especially in the episodes involving the Duchess or the Queen of Hearts. We tend to believe that Cătălina Bălinişteanu-Furdu sees Lewis Carroll (the male author) as someone who manipulates the female character to believe that any world (she intends to evade to) could turn out to be a dystopia because this fantastic world is ruled by a totalitarian dictatorship.

“Mapping Tess of the D’Urbervilles’ Marginality”, the final chapter of this book, opposes the traditional morality to the Victorian values and foregrounds once again the woman’s marginalization because Tess is Thomas Hardy’s Other, the outsider who is not understood or helped by the rest of the characters, hence her alienation. Tess’ oscillation between the centre and the margins of the social system mirrors other Victorian binary oppositions: private-public, master-slave, nature-culture. However, these concepts are re-interpreted by Hardy because he prefers to accentuate the heroine’s close connection to nature and her enclosure in prehistoric and medieval elements, thus the male writer combines spatial with temporal coordinates.

We find the book to be the expression of Cătălina Bălinişteanu-Furdu’s own thoughts about marginality, about gender roles, about the Victorian values. The book with its comparative analysis of the six novels can be used by both scholars
interested in Victorian literature/culture and students studying the 19th century literature since it offers a comprehensive analysis of Victorian novels which can be applied to other narratives written in the same period. Cătălina Bălinișteanu-Furdu does not intend to question the gender roles and stereotypes; she aims at underlining the importance of power, of order and of stability in a period of time when society was undergoing tremendous political, scientific and social changes.

References
BOOK REVIEW: AGATHA CHRISTIE’S POIROTS IN WORD AND PICTURE: STRATEGIES IN SCREEN ADAPTATIONS OF POIROT HISTORIES FROM THE VIEWPOINT OF TRANSLATION STUDIES

Antony Hoyte-West
Independent scholar, United Kingdom

Though almost five decades have elapsed since her passing in 1976, the British novelist Agatha Christie is still regularly mentioned as one of the world’s most popular authors. Her prolific output has been translated into many languages, and the enduring appeal of characters such as Miss Marple and Hercule Poirot has transcended the realm of detective fiction to leave an indelible imprint on modern-day popular culture. Indeed, in Agatha Christie’s Poirots in Word and Picture: Strategies in Screen Adaptations of Poirot Histories from the Viewpoint of Translation Studies, it is the television and cinematic versions of Christie’s works involving the famous Belgian detective that form the core of Polish literary and translation studies scholar Lucyna Harmon’s detailed study.

Harmon’s 208-page book is based on the analysis of over 70 of Agatha Christie’s short stories and novels which feature Poirot, together with their relevant screen versions. As the work’s subtitle suggests, it adopts theoretical approaches from translation studies to examine the varying strategies and techniques used in the filmed Poirot adaptations as interpreted through a comprehensive taxonomy of Harmon’s own devising. This material is outlined in the first chapter, which opens by defining the rationale for undertaking research on Christie’s oeuvre, as well as providing succinct character portraits of the key figures who recur regularly in the literary originals as well as on screen. In addition to Hercule Poirot himself, these include his friend Captain Hastings, his secretary Miss Lemon, and Inspector Japp of Scotland Yard.

About the author: Antony Hoyte-West is an interdisciplinary researcher focusing on linguistics, literature, and translation studies. A qualified translator and conference interpreter from several languages into his native English, he holds a doctorate in linguistics and postgraduate degrees in languages and social sciences from the universities of St Andrews, Oxford, Galway, and Silesia, as well as two diplomas in piano performance. He is the author of 71 publications, a number of which are indexed in Scopus or Web of Science. He has presented his research at 41 international conferences in 18 countries, and is on the editorial or advisory boards of 6 peer-reviewed journals.

e-mail: antony.hoyte.west@gmail.com
ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4410-6520

Copyright © 2024 Antony Hoyte-West

Article history: Received: 15 January 2024; Reviewed: 14 February 2024; Revised: 14 February 2024; Accepted: 15 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

This presentation is complemented by an incisive evaluation of the scholarly literature which conceptualises screen adaptations as translations, outlining the common features that underlie why “film adaptation is often perceived as a relative of translation” (p. 25), and alluding *inter alia* to Roman Jakobson and intersemiotic translation. Harmon locates her research study as primarily being a content-based analysis, and discusses the question of fidelity to the original text, observing the widespread conceptualisation of an adaptation as either faithful, somewhat faithful, or unfaithful. Citing key theorists, Harmon then goes on to differentiate the strategies and techniques with regard to translation and adaptation, before presenting the twenty-three adaptation strategies which have resulted from her evaluation of the Poirot literary and screen works (pp. 32-36). To give just a few examples, these include strategies such as “co-option”, where “a character is introduced that is absent from the pages” (p. 33); “entertainisation”, where an element of the plot “has been introduced in order to generate humour” (p. 33); and “glorification”, where “a character’s individual splendor is emphasised or increased” (p. 33). In addition, other strategic elements such as ‘melodramatisation’ (p. 34), “political correctness” or “political redirection” (p. 35), as well as “thrill intensification” (p. 36) are also included. This taxonomy features heavily in the subsequent chapters, each of which is dedicated to a specific focal point in the Poirot context. With this in mind, Harmon’s book is a valuable addition to the literature on screen adaptations of Christie’s work (see e.g., Aldridge, 2016, 2023; Rolls, 2016, etc.).

In Chapter 2, the outlined strategies are applied to Christie’s short stories featuring Poirot, which are contrasted with the associated episodes from the acclaimed long-running (1989-2013) television series featuring Sir David Suchet in the role of the detective (indeed, it is the adaptations featuring Suchet’s interpretation of Poirot which form the main point of reference throughout the volume). In terms of presentation, the necessary data for each original story (year, length) and episode is given (director, screenwriter). This is followed by a short summary of the plot; any changes between the filmed version and the original are analysed through the prism of Harmon’s aforementioned taxonomy. In this chapter, the thirty-six stories and adaptations are divided into four sets corresponding to the year the television version was first screened, thus allowing different trends to be discerned and analysed (for example, in the third set from 1991, the strategy of glorification is “significantly strengthened” (p. 86) compared to the two previous iterations.

Chapter 3 adopts a similar approach, but this time the focus is on the adaptation strategies utilised in television version of Christie’s Poirot novels, again with reference to the David Suchet television series. Unlike in the previous chapter, the thirty-two works are presented in chronological order according to the original year of composition, starting with *The Mysterious Affair at Styles* (1920). Aside from being the first Poirot novel, it was also Christie’s first published
book and would ultimately pave the way for her global success as an author. As with the preceding chapter, a potted plot summary of the original novel is provided, before the filmed episode is scrutinised for relevant modifications as per Harmon’s analytical schema. Additionally, each case study is concluded by a final ‘Comment’, which evaluates and interprets the deviations from the original novel. For example, in what Harmon terms “marital reduction” (p. 109), the television adaptation of *The Mysterious Affair at Styles* omits Captain Hastings’ marriage, thus ensuring that he remains a bachelor in future episodes.

The fourth chapter of the book focuses on those seminal Poirot novels which have attracted the attention of multiple directors and screenwriters. These include adaptations of well-known works such as *Murder on the Orient Express* and *Death on the Nile*, and in addition to Sir David Suchet, other incarnations of Poirot have been interpreted by actors such as Sir Peter Ustinov and Sir Kenneth Branagh. Harmon opens this chapter by arguing that multiple film adaptations could be considered as retranslations, as well as noting that it could be interesting to examine French scholar Antoine Berman’s famous 1990 hypothesis (Berman, 1990) in the context of screen adaptations (p. 160). For each of the eight novels featured in this chapter, a short overview is given, and then the various filmed adaptations (always starting with the Suchet version) are outlined and evaluated in line with Harmon’s twenty-three strategies, after which brief general comments concerning all of the films are provided.

The closing chapter draws together the various avenues presented by Harmon in her analysis – namely, by comparing and contrasting the various screen adaptations as a coherent whole through the prism of the strategies utilised and with reference to the theoretical approach delineated in Chapter 1. In noting the effectiveness of these strategies, Harmon posits that these could be applied more widely, not only “as a research-based and descriptive tool for screen adaptations of detective prose, but they may additionally prove applicable to film adaptations in general” (p. 200). To reiterate, the development and implementation of this detailed framework in the context of a large-scale analysis of a given author’s works certainly makes this book distinctive, and certainly enriches the literature on adaptation studies significantly. Accordingly, with its clarity of approach and succinct analyses, this volume is important not only for scholars in literary studies and translation studies, but also for fans of the Poirot books, television series, and films – indeed, for all who are looking for new scholarly perspectives on these much-loved works.
References


